INVESTIGATION OF THE LINKS BETWEEN VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND LANGUAGES, PARTICULARLY ASIAN LANGUAGES
# Table of Contents

**Acknowledgments** ........................................................................................................................................ 3
**Executive Summary** .................................................................................................................................. 4

**Part 1: Literature Review** ................................................................................................................................. 11
- Summary of Key Findings from the Literature ................................................................................................ 11
- Purpose of the Literature Review .................................................................................................................. 15

**Part 2: Findings From the Interviews** ............................................................................................................. 18
- Summary of Findings from the Interviews ...................................................................................................... 18
- Introduction .................................................................................................................................................... 22
- Section 1: The Benefits of Linking Languages and Vocational Education ................................................. 22
- Section 2: Vocational Pathways for People with Language and Cultural Skills ........................................ 27
- Section 3: Existing Links Between Languages and Vocational Education .................................................. 28
- Section 4: Models for Linking Languages and Vocational Education in Secondary Schools .................. 51
- Section 5: Elements of a Successful LOTE-VET Programme ..................................................................... 69
- Section 6: Barriers to the Linking of LOTE and VET .................................................................................. 74
- Section 7: Factors Facilitating the Uptake and Delivery of Vocational Language Programmes in Secondary Schools ........................................................................................................................................ 86

**Part 3: Conclusions and Recommendations** ................................................................................................ 102
- Silo Thinking Versus Strategic Outcomes ....................................................................................................... 102
- Strategies to Achieve the Desired Outcome ..................................................................................................... 104
- Impact of Strengthening Existing Practices ................................................................................................... 108
- Mechanisms to enable implementation .......................................................................................................... 109
- Provision of Information .................................................................................................................................. 111

**Bibliography** .................................................................................................................................................. 112
- Books and Journal Articles ............................................................................................................................ 112
- Websites ......................................................................................................................................................... 116

**Appendix 1: Literature Review** .................................................................................................................... 117
- Section 1: Benefits of a Workforce Equipped with Vocational Language Skills ........................................ 117
- Section 2: Vocational Pathways Available to People with Skills in Languages and Cultures .................. 122
- Section 3: Programmes Linking Languages and Vocational Education ...................................................... 124
Acknowledgments

Simpson Norris International would like to acknowledge the contributions of the people and organizations who contributed to this research.

We would like to acknowledge the work of the project team in conducting the research and writing the report: Natalia Gemmell, John-Michael Gemmell and Simone Bruce.

We are grateful for the involvement of the Steering Committee, Anne Eckstein, Anne Roarty and Grette Toner, for their valuable feedback and advice.

In particular, we would like to thank the people who contributed information, from education and training systems and industry. We hope they will find the report informative and useful.

This project has been funded by the Commonwealth Department of Education, Science and Training (DEST) under the National Asian Languages and Studies of Asia in Australian Schools (NALSAS) Strategy.

© Commonwealth of Australia 2003

This work is Commonwealth copyright. Except as permitted under the Copyright Act 1968 (Cth), no part of this publication may be reproduced by any process, electronic or otherwise or stored in any form without written permission of the Branch Manager, Quality Schooling Branch, Department of Education, Science and Training.

Please address inquiries to the Branch Manager, Quality Schooling Branch, Department of Education, Science and Training, GPO Box 9880, Canberra, ACT 2601.

The views expressed herein do not necessarily represent the views of the Commonwealth Department of Education, Science and Training
Executive Summary

Purpose of the study

The purpose of this study was to investigate the links between Languages Other Than English and vocational education and training for students in years 10 – 12 at secondary schools in Australia.

Definition of vocational education and training

For the purposes of the study, a very broad definition of vocational education and training was adopted, encompassing ‘education and training for work’. This was to enable discussion of a number of initiatives that were making connections between second languages and the world of work, but were outside the traditional ambit of ‘VET’.

Why link languages and vocational education?

The study’s literature review revealed a high level of support for developing vocational language skills nominating economic benefits. Support was highest in relation to the tourism and export industries, and social benefits of promoting social cohesion in a multicultural society. To a lesser extent there was a recognition of the need for intercultural and linguistic competence. Additionally, for individuals, vocational language skills were seen as increasing employment opportunities particularly if combined with other vocational skills.

Existing links

From the study it appears that some scattered links do exist between Languages Other Than English and Vocational Education and Training for this cohort. For the most part, however, it appears to be individual teachers in individual schools who are making the connections, with few structures in place at either a state or national system level to support their initiatives.

The following seven programme models have been identified as operating in Australian secondary schools:
- The identification of generic workplace competencies associated with language learning
- The inclusion of a vocational focus into general language courses
- The incorporation of the Applied Languages Certificate in the secondary languages curriculum
- The incorporation of the National Association of Australian Translators and Interpreters (NAATI) Diploma in Interpreting/Translating (Paraprofessional) into the ESL or language classroom
- The inclusion of language competencies into VET training packages and courses
- Business exchange programmes
- Work experience programmes.

The key features, advantages and disadvantages of these models are discussed in Part 2, Section 4 of the report.

**Success factors**

Research commissioned by the National Asian Languages and Studies in Australian Schools Taskforce identified success factors\(^1\) for Languages Other Than English programmes. These include:
- The importance of making language learning meaningful, relevant and applied;
- The incorporation of socio-cultural perspectives;
- Appropriate pedagogy;
- The need for a strong profile for languages within the school; and
- The need to make links with other curriculum offerings.

These factors were found to be equally applicable to second language programmes in vocational education and training contexts. However, three additional success factors emerged for LOTE-VET programmes. These are:
- The need for the curriculum to be linked to industry needs;
- The need for appropriate certification and credit arrangements to be in place; and
- The need for clearly articulated learning and employment pathways to be established.
Currently, there is only one industry area in the Australian context where these three requirements have been attended to – Hospitality and Tourism.

**Silos the main barrier**

Interviews with education stakeholders indicated that in some states and territories the secondary education sector and technical and further education sector saw themselves as being in competition for places, rather than working together towards a mutual goal. These competing and conflicting views are represented in the following way:

![Thinking in silos](image)

Responses from industry stakeholders indicated that there is a perception that the education system was so far from the mark in terms of meeting their needs that it was hardly worth pursuing negotiations in this regard. This raises the question of whose needs are being considered, what the needs are, and how the stakeholder groups might co-operate to meet them.

**Benefits of linking revealed by the research**

---

1 National Asian Languages and Studies in Australian Schools Task Force. 1999 *Pathways for Australian School Students to Achieve High Levels of Proficiency in Asian Languages.* Sydney: NSW Department of Education and Training
The potential benefit for secondary schools in linking languages and vocational education and training comes down quite simply to increasing the number of students studying languages. By connecting languages and vocational education and training, language learning becomes more meaningful to students because it is applied learning, and directly relevant to their future careers.

The potential benefit for the technical and further education sector is that by establishing a clearly articulated learning pathway from secondary school to technical and further education with appropriate credit arrangements, it will be able to attract more students to TAFE courses, particularly advanced courses, which are often the most difficult to fill.

The potential benefit for industry is that it will be able to access future employees from a pool of people with requisite levels of socio-cultural skill and language proficiency to meet their needs.

For these and other benefits to be realised, a process would need to be initiated to allow linking to occur across the 'silos'. Experience in this field\(^2\) suggests that a number of mechanisms need to be put in place to enable a change of this nature. As a minimum, these are:

- **High level policy support.** An appropriate body would need to initiate the process by providing a policy framework that would stimulate activity in the various jurisdictions.

- **Articulation of a common and desirable goal,** which would inspire all three major stakeholder groups. People in each of the silos expressed goals that made sense within their silo, but were not necessarily applicable to people outside. A common goal that sits above each of the silos, linking them together, could be:

  \[
  \textit{To create an Australian workforce with the necessary skills to compete in a global marketplace.}
  \]

---

\(^2\) Simpson Norris International specialises in supporting systemic change, and has been involved in several projects involving the improvement of co-operation between multiple agencies since 1999.
Currently, there is no national or state policy which states the importance of such a goal. There are no structures in place to implement such a policy, or resources to support it.

**Forums to raise awareness of the issue.** Key system, jurisdictional and industry representatives would need to be brought together to be presented with the findings of research, and given the opportunity to talk to each other across the traditional boundaries. This would enable them to understand the initiatives that already exist, and consider ways in which these initiatives could be supported. As the study indicates, ‘bottom up’ initiatives are already operating. Simultaneous ‘bottom up’ and ‘top down’ support for change is much more likely to be achieve something worthwhile and sustainable.

**A mechanism for facilitating the forums to create cross sector partnerships prepared to take the process forward.**

**Recommendations:**

It is recommended that:

1. The MCEETYA Taskforce on Student Learning and Support Services be encouraged to consider the strengthening of linkages between languages and vocational education in its development of a national approach to languages education in schools.

2. Partnerships between school and technical and further education sectors and industry be strengthened through:
   a. developing a common goal for the stakeholder groups
   b. bringing stakeholders together at State/Territory levels to consider the desirability of the goal, and what would need to happen for the goal to be achieved
      A seminar/workshop to be convened in each state, with senior industry, TAFE and secondary education representatives to consider the goal as it might apply in that State’s context.
c. funding peak industry bodies, such as Industry Training Advisory Bodies (ITABs) or Business Councils, to facilitate the workshops

Interviews with members of the Business Councils indicated that they considered themselves to be primary players in terms of bringing education, training and industry together to facilitate a linking process.

If ITABs or Business Councils such as these were to accept a leadership role, they would need to be funded to facilitate the workshops. Ideally, such funding would include provision for resources to obtain expert advice in terms of structuring the workshops to give the best chance of delivering useful outcomes.

Useful outcomes could be:

i. A policy group or groups that would be prepared to articulate the importance of linking languages and vocational education and training in terms of developing an appropriately skilled workforce to compete in a global marketplace

ii. Partnerships that would be prepared to plan how to:
   - Move the curriculum closer to industry needs
   - Develop appropriate certification
   - Develop appropriate pathways

d. providing workshop participants with knowledge of successful partnering arrangements, and practical frameworks for implementation

The best chance of achieving a goal that impacts on Australia’s future workforce will occur if participants at the workshops have some understanding of how linking processes can be initiated in such a way as to become sustainable. There is little value in a ‘one-off’. Partnerships across traditional silos have huge potential to improve the output of linked systems if they are managed appropriately.

3. Information on existing and potential linkages between languages and vocational education be made available to schools through a range of print and electronic media, including the following:
   - The benefits of making such links
   - Models and elements of successful programmes
THE REPORT
Part 1: Literature Review

**Summary of Key Findings from the Literature**

The literature review suggests that there are considerable benefits for incorporating language courses into the Vocational Education and Training (VET) contexts. These range from economic and social benefits, to benefits for the individual in terms of career opportunities and potential remuneration, particularly when linguistic skills are combined with skills in other disciplines. The literature also identified a wide range of potential vocational pathways for people with skills in languages. Notably, however, many of the vocations identified in the literature require tertiary degrees, rather than Vocational Education and Training qualifications.

It was fairly difficult from the literature reviewed to develop a coherent understanding of the interface between languages and Vocational Education and Training in Australia. A national strategy was put in place in 1994 to promote the teaching of languages in the Vocational Education and Training context. However, the achievements of this strategy were not articulated in the available literature. Further, in 1996, the Australian National Training Authority (ANTA) investigated the possibilities for incorporating languages and cultural studies into VET programmes. Again, it was not possible to determine what happened as a consequence of this investigation.

Currently, however, there are two initiatives in place in the technical and further education sector to incorporate links between languages and vocational education. The first is the Australian Committee for Training Curriculum (ACTRAC) Applied Languages Certificates. The second is the recent inclusion of language competencies into the ANTA Hospitality and Tourism Training Package.

Some initiatives are in place in the secondary education context to link languages and Vocational Education and Training. For the most part these initiatives are scattered and uncoordinated, though some education jurisdictions are starting to coordinate particular initiatives at a state level. The initiatives that are described in the literature are:
• The incorporation of the ACTRAC Applied Languages Certificates into the secondary language classes;
• The identification of generic workplace competencies that can be gained from learning a language; and
• A structured work placement programme for language students implemented by the Catholic Education Commission of Victoria.

In addition, various strategies have been used to promote the importance of languages for vocations, including:

• A promotional package developed by the Modern Language Teachers’ Association of South Australia;
• A series of individual profiles developed by the Association of Independent Schools in NSW; and
• The LOTElinx website developed by the Careers Education Association of Victoria.

Several examples are cited in the literature which have incorporated language teaching into the vocational education domain or vice versa. Some of these examples have been implemented at a system level. Others have been initiated at a school or college level. Most of the literature examples cited are from the United Kingdom. From these examples it is possible to define four models of vocational language delivery. These are:

• The inclusion of a vocational focus to language learning;
• The inclusion of languages in vocational education programmes;
• Work experience and business exchange programmes; and
• Company training programmes.

From these models some key elements of best practice can be identified. One is the importance of ensuring that language used in the vocational setting is both meaningful to learners and relevant to their vocational context. There is considerable opinion to suggest that learners will be more motivated to learn a language if they can see the applicability of it to their work. A number of authors also stress the importance of combining vocational language with general purpose language, so that students are able to transact in the target culture both at work, and outside work. In particular, it was seen to be vital to ensure that occupational language programmes incorporated socio-cultural perspectives.
The issue of appropriate pedagogy was raised by a number of authors. In general, there was a sense that tasks adopted in vocational language courses should correspond with tasks offered in learners’ general vocational course. This was also true for assessment tasks. In addition, there was some opinion to suggest that tasks should be ‘concrete’ rather than overly conceptual. It was not seen to be necessary that teachers should be teachers of VET as well as teachers of LOTE. Rather, there was a sense that the language teachers should be interested in the vocational subject, and interested in learning about it, alongside the learners. This meant respecting learners’ greater knowledge in this area. In this regard, the teacher takes on the role of a facilitator of language learning, rather than the expert.

The development of appropriate teaching resources was identified as an issue for good practice. The importance of involving industry bodies and target language speakers in the development of the materials was raised by a number of authors. Two publications suggested that it may be more cost-effective to develop generic materials that could be used across a range of vocational areas. Other authors also referred to the opportunities for enhancing vocational language programmes through the use of information technology.

The importance of developing links within the community and with industry bodies was also mentioned in the literature. In this sense, needs analyses were seen to be important in ensuring that the vocational language courses continue to meet the needs of learners, industry and the wider community. In this regard, the development of clearly articulated pathways from school, to tertiary study, to employment was seen to be vital. The capacity to develop good practice programmes was also seen to be enhanced by the existence of a supportive policy structure in the country. This can be particularly seen in the European Union where such policy frameworks do exist.

From the literature it is possible to identify some contextual factors that can either facilitate or hamper the linking of languages and vocational education. This was not, however, an area dealt with in any great depth within the available literature and often factors were implicit rather than explicit. The key factors identified included:

- The importance of supportive policy in facilitating the implementation of vocational language programmes;
- The development of links with other stakeholders to give strength to programmes;
• The existence of strong industry links to support and promote initiatives in this area;
• The impact of community perceptions on either facilitating or hampering the implementation and uptake of vocational language programmes;
• The importance of promoting programmes appropriately for the context;
• The impact of funding in facilitating the implementation of vocational language programmes at both a system and a school level; and
• The role of organisational issues in terms of managing the effective implementation of languages at a school level.

Other issues which arise in terms of the implementation of languages in Vocational Education and Training contexts include the need to balance the time allocation for the language component of the courses with the desired language outcomes for learners. Appropriate teacher training was also identified as an issue, as well as the development of cross-disciplinary links for teachers of languages and vocational courses. In this regard, the use of background speakers to teach vocational language programmes is also discussed. The question also arose about when language teaching should start, as did the issue of whether vocationally-specific programmes were preferable to generic vocational language programmes.

Vocational language programmes provide an excellent opportunity to increase interest in LOTE among non-tertiary bound students. They can also be seen as a way of meeting the language and cultural needs of industry, and offering the potential to develop an appropriately skilled workforce for a global market. In seeking to incorporate language teaching into the Australian Vocational Education and Training context, however, it will be important to ensure that appropriate support, training and resources are available to language teachers, so that learners do not become disillusioned.
Purpose of the Literature Review

The purpose of this literature review is to explore the links between the study of languages and vocational education, with a particular emphasis on the study of Asian languages in years 10-12. Specifically, the review sets out to investigate:

- The types of vocational pathways that are available to people with skills in languages;
- What is being done in the way of implementing languages education in a vocational education context, how it has been done, and the outcomes that have been achieved;
- Examples of ‘good practice’ in the implementation of languages education in vocational education contexts;
- The elements that can be seen to constitute ‘good practice’ in this area; and
- The factors that facilitate and hamper the effectiveness of combining languages education and vocational education.

The review represents an analysis of national and international literature in this area published since 1990. Literature included in the review has been sourced from an extensive database and internet search, and supplemented with literature collected through the consultation process undertaken with key stakeholders as part of this research.

The initial search revealed very little Australian literature dealing specifically with the implementation of Languages Other Than English (LOTE) in vocational education contexts. With concerted effort from the researchers, further Australian publications were identified as part of the interview process. The bulk of this documentation was developed in the mid to late 1990s, following from the establishment of the National Asian Languages and Studies of Asia (NALSAS) Strategy. Since then, the Asian economic recession has dramatically changed the international economic context in which many of the publications were written. Documents collected in the Australian context varied greatly in nature from substantial evaluation and research documents, to policy documentation, curriculum packages and position papers, through to scattered pamphlets, brochures and websites. From this assorted array, two tables are presented that summarise:

- Perceptions of what vocational language learning looks like in Australia at present
Perspectives of vocational and occupational language learning from the European Union and the United States.

Defining what is meant by vocational education, in itself, presented some difficulties for this review. The term ‘Vocational Education and Training’ has been used to encompass both the Australian VET system and similar pathways/programmes in other countries, while the terms ‘vocational language learning’ and ‘occupational language learning’ are used interchangeably to refer to the learning of languages for future use in careers, irrespective of the learning pathway.

A primary aim of the review was to investigate vocational language learning for students in the post-compulsory years of secondary schooling; however little seems to have been written, either in Australia or internationally, that relates specifically to the linking of languages and vocational education in secondary school contexts. For the most part, the literature describes initiatives implemented in the tertiary sector, specifically in Technical Colleges, or the equivalent, and in the University sector. These initiatives, and others that focus on company-funded training, are included in the review where it is considered that they provide some insight into the need for languages in vocational education contexts and/or aspects of ‘good practice’ in combining languages and Vocational Education and Training.

One specific aim of this review is to identify case studies of ‘good practice’ in terms of the practical implementation of languages education in vocational education contexts. However, the literature describes very few actual examples of where languages have been incorporated into Vocational Education and Training or vice versa, and often, where examples of similar programmes are cited, the authors only provide a sketchy overview of the practicalities of the programme. There are disappointingly few Australian examples described in the literature. It was possible to glean examples of vocational language programmes from the international literature, and where these have been included, the contextual factors that distinguish them from the Australian situation have been identified.

Of particular note, is the fact that most of the literature available appears to have been written by LOTE specialists, who are seeking to promote languages as a viable part of the vocational education sector. Very few articles stand out as having been written by people operating in vocational education contexts who want to incorporate languages into their
programmes, or incorporate Vocational Education and Training courses into language programmes.

Key findings from the literature are at Appendix One. The first section of the report considers the economic and social benefits of having a workforce equipped with language skills. The second explores the potential career benefits available to people with language and cultural skills, while Section 3 describes the types of vocational pathways that may be open to them. The fourth section looks at developments in vocational language learning in the Australian context. Different models of vocational language delivery identified from the literature are outlined in Section 5, along with individual examples of different programmes offered both in Australia and in the international arena. Some of the key attributes of these programmes are also identified. The sixth section goes on to describe the elements of good practice emerging from literature. Section 7 sets out the factors that facilitate and hamper the effective linking of languages and vocational education, while the final section explores some of the issues that arise in terms of the establishment and delivery of vocational language programmes.
Part 2: Findings From the Interviews

Summary of Findings from the Interviews

Many of the themes and issues identified in the literature review are also reflected in the findings from the interviews; however, some specific considerations in relation to the Australian context also emerge. Moreover, the emphasis given to certain issues in the consultation process also differs at times from that of the literature review.

Although not dealt with in great detail through the consultation process, several respondents did identify potential benefits for individuals who can bring languages and cultural knowledge into their work context. Benefits identified related specifically to developing relationships with business colleagues from other cultures; developing an understanding of the way people from other countries operate in a business setting; and conducting business negotiations, if the linguistic fluency is appropriate. Respondents were also of the view that learners’ employment prospects could be enhanced if they had language skills. Nevertheless, the majority of business representatives were very clear that language skills were only a desirable criteria for job applicants, and had to be offered in conjunction with appropriate business/vocational skills and attributes. They also indicated that the proficiency levels of school leavers were rarely good enough for employment.

Education representatives also identified specific benefits for the languages other than English learning area, that could result from the linking of languages and Vocational Education and Training in the secondary school context. These included:

- Increasing the profile of languages in the school;
- Increasing student participation and retention in language classes; and
- Making languages more meaningful to students.

Respondents were able to identify vocational pathways where people with language and cultural knowledge would have an advantage. The main area mentioned by respondents was in Hospitality and Tourism. Business, marketing and export industries were the second
most commonly cited pathways. One respondent also saw an opportunity for Australia to export Human Resource management services overseas.

The consultation process indicated that there are a number of different initiatives in place to link languages and vocational education in each state. For the most part, these programmes have been instigated by individual teachers. There are no national coordinating mechanisms in place, and coordination at the state level is limited.

It is possible to identify seven different models for the linking of languages and vocational education in the secondary school context in Australia. These are:

- The incorporation of the Applied Languages Certificate in the secondary languages curriculum;
- The incorporation of the NAATI Diploma in Interpreting/Translating (Paraprofessional) into the ESL or LOTE classroom;
- The inclusion of language competencies into VET Training Packages and courses;
- The incorporation of a vocational focus into general language courses;
- The identification of generic workplace competencies associated with language learning;
- Business exchange programmes; and
- Work experience programmes.

There are a number of potential advantages and disadvantages associated with each of these models.

From the interviews, it is possible to identify some key elements from successful language programmes. Many of these elements are similar to those mentioned in previous Australian research into the factors affecting the sustainability of language programmes in general. These include:

- Making language learning relevant to learners;
- Focusing on communicative language use;
- Incorporating cultural understandings;
- Having a committed teacher; and
A good profile for the programme in the school.

The factors mentioned by respondents that relate specifically to vocational language programmes are:

- The importance of making the course relevant to the industry;
- The need for coordination between VET staff and language staff in the school;
- The importance of certification and credit; and
- The importance of fitting with other curriculum offerings in the school without extensive rearranging of timetables and teaching schedules.

A number of barriers were identified in relation to the implementation and uptake of vocational language programmes. Some barriers related to the lack of supportive national policy and the lack of structures for the implementation of policy. In addition, the lack of links between key stakeholders in education, technical and further education and training, and industry was seen to be a barrier. The fact that language competencies were not included in all bar one of the National Training Packages for VET was seen to be an issue, as was the lack of vocational content in secondary language syllabi. The over reliance on individual teachers was identified as a key issue. A number of other barriers were seen to come into play at the school level, including timetabling, class size, attitudes of teachers and the practicalities associated with implementing programmes in terms of funding, RTO requirements, lack of coordination, and the difficulty of merging to different assessment frameworks.

In addition, respondents identified the barriers to the uptake of vocational language programmes by students. The key barrier was the fact that students did not necessarily see the language to be relevant to them for their career. This was fed in part by prevalent community attitudes to languages.

A number of factors were also seen to support the implementation and uptake of vocational language programmes in secondary schools. Some of these were already in place. Others needed to be put in place, or further developed. The existence of supportive policy at a national level and the development of appropriate structures for accountability to implement the policy were seen to be necessary. Industry support was also identified as an important contextual factor that would facilitate the implementation of vocational language
programmes. The existence of programmes that incorporated languages and vocational education was seen to be important, as was the necessity to provide teachers with information about the programmes and how to implement them. In addition, having programmes to support access to and accreditation of such programmes was regarded as necessary. The development of links between key stakeholders was recognised as a factor that would facilitate the uptake of these programmes. Finally, having teachers who have the capacity, and are prepared, to run vocational language programmes was seen to be essential.

Also emerging from the consultations were a number of factors that would facilitate the uptake of vocational language programmes by students. These included:

- The need to make programmes relevant to learners’ needs and to enable them to see the benefits of languages for their future career prospects;
- Developing links outside the classroom;
- Making connections to employability skills for students;
- Making language programmes interesting to learners;
- Having structures to recognise their achievement through certification and credit arrangements; and
- Having clearly articulated learning pathways.

The issue of how to facilitate links with stakeholders was addressed separately, because of its perceived importance. The main facilitating factors that emerged from the interviews were the importance of ensuring that all parties could see mutual benefit in the process and being clear about the needs of all parties. In addition, respondents stressed the importance of building existing structures to facilitate liaison, such as the Business Councils, Chambers of Commerce and Industry Advisory Councils. They also stressed the importance of working with strategic priorities that have been identified by industries and companies, and capitalising on strategies that were mutually acceptable to all parties.
Introduction
A total of thirty-two telephone interviews were conducted with representatives from eight stakeholder groups. Some variation from the initial contract became necessary as the research process evolved.

Section 1: The Benefits of Linking Languages and Vocational Education

Throughout the consultation process, stakeholders commented on some of the benefits of linking languages and Vocational Education and Training. The benefits have been categorised under four headings. The first section addresses the benefits for languages as a learning area. The second section describes the benefits for students. The third section outlines the potential benefits for individuals who can bring language and cultural knowledge into their work context.

Benefits for the Languages Learning Area
From the interviews, it is possible to identify three key benefits for the languages learning area that may arise from linking languages more closely with vocational education in the secondary school context. The first of these is the potential to increase the profile and status of languages within the school. The second perceived benefit is the possibility of increasing participation in languages classes. A third benefit identified is the capacity to increase student retention in language classes in the post-compulsory years of schooling.

Increasing the Profile of Languages in the School
Two education representatives interviewed referred to the possibility of increasing the profile and status of the languages learning area in the school through a stronger linking of languages and vocational education.

The experience of a Victorian education representative who had been running a work placement programme for language students, suggests that well-run vocational language programmes can, in fact, achieve this outcome. For her, one aspect of the programme that worked specifically to increase the status of languages was the fact that links were being made between teaching staff in different parts of the school: Teaching staff see links they don't normally see. Teachers start to respect each other.
Increasing Participation in Language Classes
Several respondents alluded to the potential for vocational language programmes to attract more students. One Board of Studies representative remarked that the success of the programme was that they were being provided in response to student interest, and that they were a means of accommodating a group of students who wouldn’t otherwise have much interest in LOTE.

Increasing Retention in the Post-compulsory Years of Schooling
The capacity for vocational language programmes to increase student retention in the post-compulsory years of schooling was also remarked upon by a number of respondents. The Catholic Education Commission of Victoria had established their work placement programme with the specific purpose of increasing student retention into Year 11 and 12 language programmes. This aim appears to have been successfully achieved. A recent survey of 240 students who had participated in the programme found that 40% had continued to study languages to Year 12.

Similarly, a Western Australian respondent commented on a programme which linked Indonesian language into an aspect of a hospitality programme. She found from talking to the students that the programme had certainly made them interested in thinking that it was worthwhile to continue the LOTE.

Benefits for Students
Two key benefits emerge for students in relation to the linking of languages and vocational education. The first is that the language learning experience is made more meaningful and relevant through application in a work context. The second is that students’ future prospects may be enhanced through the development of cultural and linguistic skills.

Language Learning is Made Relevant
By linking languages with vocational education, respondents saw that the experience of learning a language could be made more meaningful for students. This was particularly true in cases where the language learning was linked to a practical and applied workplace context. One respondent commented on an initiative to link Indonesian language into a secondary school Hospitality programme, in which students ran an Indonesian restaurant for the school community. She perceived that the benefit of this kind of programme was that it took language learning out of a text book exercise [so they were] no longer experiencing LOTE at a distance, [but were] using it for a purpose in a real situation.
**Enhanced Future Prospects**

Other respondents were of the view that having vocational language knowledge and skills had the potential to enhance students' future prospects. An education representative from the Northern Territory remarked that it was his belief that the opportunity to develop vocational language skills enhances the students’ employment opportunities and future prospects in ways that the student, or in fact we as educators, may not yet be able to see. He was able to cite two examples of students who had profited from their language skills: *both of the people involved now have jobs overseas with major Australian companies.*

Respondents also identified benefits that extended more broadly than future employment opportunities. One New South Wales respondent, for example, commented on the importance of cultural understandings as a general life skill.

**Benefits in the Workplace**

All the industry respondents interviewed considered a combination of linguistic and vocational skills to be a desirable attribute of an employee in any company that has international business dealings. It was noted that linguistically capable employees enhanced business communication, heightened trust between businesses and generally made foreign national business more ready to do business with Australian companies.

From the interviews, it was possible to identify two key workplace benefits for individuals with vocational language skills. The first of these related to the ability to develop better business and workplace relationships with people from other cultures.

A representative from the Australian-Indonesia Business Council was of the view that *if Australian Business people display even basic appreciation of the language or culture* in Malaysia or Indonesia, the local people would perceive that they *have an interest* and so be more willing to do business.

Secondly, respondents referred to the benefits of language and cultural knowledge for understanding business processes in other cultures. A representative from the Australia-China Business Council was of the view that a person needed to understand the language and culture of the country in order to do business because this reflects *their attitudes, the way they organise things, the timing and processes they normally conduct business with.*
This backgrounding was seen to be important irrespective of the fact that most business in Asia is conducted in English.

A third benefit identified was in relation to conducting business negotiations with people from other cultures. In this regard, a representative from the Australia-Indonesia Business Council commented on the use of *displaying some language skill...in business negotiations.* In his experience, if the other side is not sure how much of what they are saying can be understood, they are *more likely to be honest, and not try to pull the wool over your eyes.* A Qantas representative also commented that having language skills provided a considerable advantage over using translators for business negotiations. He noted that, particularly if the *translator is being provided by your host company,* [the] *difficulty of neutrality* comes into play.

It is important to note, however, that industry representatives were quick to stress the fact that *language is just one skill* required of an employee, and that this was not necessarily an essential criteria for a successful employee. Interestingly, one Japanese respondent noted that *having managers with Japanese language ability may be useful, but it doesn’t matter to our company if they don’t speak Japanese.* What was left unsaid was the fact that we (the Japanese employees in the company) can all speak English. The respondent then went on to say that in business communication, an Australian manager *would need to be very fluent in Japanese, otherwise it would be best not to use it at all.* However, he did note that all the Australian companies that his company had a *long relationship with [tended] to use simple Japanese to build on the daily relationship,* but that was all.

From a company perspective, the Rio Tinto representative provided an interesting contrast to the other industry representatives interviewed. This company has a policy generally of employing Asian personnel, rather than Australian personnel, to meet all their language needs in that area. This policy was in place for two reasons. Firstly, Australians were perceived generally to not have the appropriate level of language proficiency or cultural knowledge. Secondly, Asian personnel were able to bring their own contacts in the target countries to the company. Nevertheless, this did not preclude the company employing Australian personnel who appropriately met their needs. The representative described the company’s ideal employee:
An ideal employee would have industry knowledge, business knowledge, [an] understanding of the Asian market place, highly skilled and knowledgeable in his/her own business, have extensive cultural and social understanding of the work context and display high levels of honesty, integrity and honour….and they come with their own set of business contacts in the Asian market place.

From a different perspective, two respondents remarked on the benefits for people with language knowledge working in Australia with people from different backgrounds. They both referred specifically to the Tour Guide industry in Australia which has been experiencing difficulties employing people with both the appropriate language knowledge and sufficient knowledge of Australia. As one respondent described it, they have a choice at the moment of guides without language skills, and language speakers without guiding skills. The industry is also finding that a number of tourists are coming to Australia with their own guide, or they pick up a student who is living here and is not trained in guiding, to show them around the city. The implication of this for the industry is that the quality of the guiding experience is lowered, and a lot of the profits are going out of the country.
Section 2: Vocational Pathways for People with Language and Cultural Skills

As part of the interview process, most respondents were able to identify possible career pathways for which people with language and cultural skills would have an advantage. A number of education representatives were of the view that languages would be useful for any possible career path. The area identified by most respondents was the Tourism and Hospitality area.

Within the Tourism and Hospitality area, specific connections were made to specific industries such as the wine industry and the tour guide industry. Specific jobs were also identified, including travel agents, flight attendants, tour guiding, tour organising, in-bound tourism sales, guest services officer in hotels, marketing people in hotels or tourist venues/attractions, waiters, food and beverage managers in restaurants with a large Asian clientele. Often people were unable to think of industries other than Tourism and Hospitality that would benefit from people with language and cultural skills in their employees.

The other pathway commonly mentioned by respondents was in relation to business and commerce in general, and the export industry in particular. This was particularly evident in comments from business representatives.
Section 3: Existing Links Between Languages and Vocational Education

It was apparent from the interviews that there were a number of initiatives in place to link languages and vocational education in the various states and territories in Australia. The first section outlines how languages link into Vocational Education and Training at the technical and further education level. This is followed by discussion of the links between languages and Vocational Education and Training in the secondary school curriculum in each state. Some of the programmes that are in place are occurring at a systemic level. Others are being initiated and negotiated at a school level. The final section provides an industry perspective on the linking of languages and vocational education, including a description of a company-training model developed by Qantas.

Developments in the Technical and Further Education Sector
Consultation was undertaken with an ANTA representative, TAFE representatives from three states and a representative from Tourism Training Australia, the national Industry Training Advisory Board (ITAB) for Tourism and Hospitality.

The researchers were informed that ANTA currently has no written policy about languages other than English, however general advice about integrating languages, literacy and numeracy into the workplace standards, which comprise the qualification structures in the VET sector is available to people who are developing Training Packages, through the Training Package Developers' Handbook.

According to the ANTA representative, training packages are best described as sets of competency standards that describe every bit of work in particular industry areas. These are all packaged together under the Australian Qualifications Framework. The development of the Training Packages is overseen by the relevant ITAB in conjunction with industry. There is no Training Package specifically for languages, as it is a cross-industry competency. There is currently only one training package that does incorporate units of language competency within their qualifications. This is the Tourism and Hospitality Training Package, recently developed by Tourism Training Australia (TTA). Languages that can be included vary from Arabic to Cantonese, Finnish to Hindi. Languages are included as optional units into the Training Package.
The researchers interviewed a representative from TTA who had been instrumental in having language competency units included in the Tourism and Hospitality Training Package. She explained that this initiative had developed from a report undertaken by the Australian Tourism Export Council and the Office of Multicultural Affairs in conjunction with TTA to investigate the language requirements of the Tourism Agency in 1996. The report found an urgent need for an increase in the foreign language skills in Australia, and recommended a two pronged approach by increasing language training in both schools and the VET sector to accommodate inbound tourists, and upskilling people who already spoke languages so that they could cater to this demand. The barrier that arose in implementing these recommendations was the fact that there was no way of assessing languages. For this reason, the development of a national framework was recommended to enable this assessment.

It was another five years before TTA was able to secure funding to develop such a framework. Funding was provided by the Department of Industry Science and Tourism through their rural and regional funding arrangements, and the research was conducted by Griffith University. On the basis of that, the competency standards were developed.

There are four levels of language competency incorporated into the Training Package, from entry level to fully competent speak, stopping just under the NAATI [Translating competencies]. Writing and reading are introduced in Levels 3 and 4. One criticism levelled at the competency units by a TAFE representative, is that there is a considerable jump in proficiency requirements from Level 3 to Level 4. The competencies that are assessed are generic to all languages, and are based on workplace outcomes, not just learning the grammar, and include items such as meeting and greeting to conducting meetings at a top level.

The standards were endorsed in January 2002. They were put up for national consultation last year. We were informed that there was not a huge amount of interest, but the feedback received was positive. The TTA is now trying to get funding for a professional development kit for teachers, to trial the standards, and to develop appropriate support materials.

There appears to be some interest in turning the language units from the Tourism and Hospitality Training Package into national standards for inclusion in a variety of other
Training Packages. According to one respondent, *I have been told that these competency standards may be turned into a national cross industry project, for people like public safety, transport and business that deal with tourists.* The TTA representative indicated that she was attempting to get funding for the development to trial the competencies in other industries. She had received some support for such a move from the National Wholesale, Retail and Personal Services ITAB, and the National Health and Community Services ITAB. Senior management from both of these organisations had apparently expressed support for working on a project to pilot the competency standards in their industries if funding for such a project could be obtained. The ANTA representative was also of the opinion that the Public Safety ITAB had shown interest in such a project.

In addition, a number of TAFEs also offer Applied Languages Certificates. According to the ANTA representative, *these certificates sit outside the training package structure.* People can undertake these Certificates as an adjunct to their training or occupation, and are useful for people involved in travel agency work, air traffic control, road transport and a variety of other professions that require language skills.

There are currently structures in place in a number of states and territories to enable secondary schools to incorporate these certificates into their curriculum (this is described in more detail below). For example, we attended a professional development seminar run by a representative from Perth Central TAFE that was designed to assist secondary language teachers to access this option. Interestingly, the ANTA representative had little knowledge about how this operated, *I am not sure how much those certificates are used in a VET in Schools context at year 11 and 12 level, but there could be a way that you could strengthen the use of LOTE in later years of schooling by inserting them into schools.* A languages teacher from Meadowbank TAFE in NSW was also unaware of the possibility of incorporating the certificates into secondary schools. He comments, *there is no system like that at the moment, no provision for languages like that, no.* He did, however, have a few secondary school students enrolled in his languages Certificate classes after hours who were hoping to improve both their language skills and their tertiary entrance score.

According to one respondent, the language competencies in the Tourism and Hospitality Training Package *don’t relate brilliantly with the* [Applied Languages Certificates]. She understood that there was an initiative to *write a diploma course which will hopefully bridge the gap.*
In addition to the Applied Languages Certificate, the TAFEs also offer the NAATI Certificate in Translating and Interpreting (Paraprofessional), which has a similar status. There is also potential to incorporate the NAATI Certificate into the secondary school curriculum.

Another initiative mentioned by the ANTA representative was the Workplace English Language and Literacy Programme which was being run through TAFE. This programme was not aimed at developing LOTE skills, but is rather aimed at providing bilingual workplace education for background speakers. She described a programme that had been run for Vietnamese lettuce growers in South Australia.

There are also opportunities for individual TAFEs to link with industries through providing fee for service courses that link with their needs. Meadowbank TAFE, for example, was offering a course called French for Healthcare Workers, Spanish for Healthcare Workers. This is a generic course that could be rewritten for each different language. The course had developed in response to a request from West Mead Private Hospital in Sydney to assist them in working with students who were coming over from New Caledonia to learn about new cardiac techniques. The course was tailored specifically for the needs of these doctors, but could easily be tailored to any medical situation. He noted that the programme had been highly successful – the hospital has a lot of other staff that want to do it. They want a beginners’ group and a continuing group.

Another similar programme developed in response to a request from Canon research in North Ryde. The company approached the TAFE to develop a programme for their staff who are frequently required to go to Japan for business. They wanted Japanese for a bit of language and a bit of business. The company did not expect to get their employees to a stage where they could conduct business in Japanese. Rather they were aiming for basic survival stuff - say hello, how are you, few pleasantries to break the ice, if you need to buy a train ticket. The course concentrated heavily on business protocol – what’s expected when you go to Japan – it’s more formal, they take you out to drinks, if you go to a meeting you have a name card – these are places where you could put your foot in it. The programmes were also well regarded by the company who wanted a further continuing and beginning course.

A TAFE respondent also informed us that the institution had previously linked with another local Registered Training Organisation (RTO), Wright College, to provide languages as an
elective for students undertaking Diplomas at the College. This programme was offered from 1996-1999 until the tourism department decided that languages were out. Following the endorsement of the new Tourism and Hospitality Training Package, tentative negotiations had been resumed between the two institutions.

A final initiative that the researchers were made aware of in the technical and further education sector was the MCEETYA sub-committee on Adult LOTE and Literacy, which was established in 1994. Only two respondents mentioned the sub-committee, both in passing. One provided the researchers with two brochures that had been developed under this banner, which sought to promote language learning as a marketable vocational skill. Her comment in this regard was: What happened to them? What did they do? No other respondents even referred to this group.

Developments in the Secondary Education Sector
There are a number of different kinds of vocational education programmes operating in the various states and territories of Australia. For the most part, the programmes appear to have been instigated at a school level, rather than a systemic level; however, there are examples of programmes that have been implemented by different educational authorities. While some similar initiatives are being implemented in different states and territories, there appears to be little cross-fertilisation of ideas. From the research, there would appear to be some considerable opportunities for the education authorities in different states to work together to investigate some of the different approaches, and to learn from each others experiences.

Australian Capital Territory
According to the respondent there is no policy about LOTE and VET in the ACT, nor is there a policy about the inclusion of any sorts of courses. She commented further, We don’t have any strict policies about what sorts of subjects you have to have on your Year 12 certificate. Students can choose what they like. The only restriction is that a student cannot have more than eight units taken from a particular learning area. In terms of the developing curriculum, it is up to the curriculum advisors in the individual schools and colleges to determine what they want to include in their curriculum offerings. The role of the Board is to ensure that the courses developed by the schools meet Board policy.

She noted that LOTE had previously been regarded as a sort of vocational subject in the ACT. This course was a generic language course, which cut across a variety of languages
and had a vocational focus; students *did simple things, like guiding people to various places.* There was no system level push for schools to take up this course, but a number of colleges had taken up the programme individually. This course became defunct *when the training package concept came in,* as LOTE was not attached to any ANTA Training Package. The respondent noted further that *unless the course is an [ANTA] training package, it does not attract a VET label* in the ACT. When questioned specifically about the ANTA Applied Languages Certificates, the respondent acknowledged that *most TAFEs have one of those,* but was not aware of them being applied in secondary schools.

The respondent did indicate that LOTE courses offered in the state do have a slight vocational focus in terms of the assessment requirements in that *they need to relate to areas where people might find employment.* Later in the interview she expanded on her description of the vocational orientation of the course – *It does have a bit of a vocational focus – purely from an assessment point of view – all introducing people and things like that and, you know, the basic oral communication.*

The respondent was aware that a new Training Package in Tourism and Hospitality had just been developed by ANTA, which allowed for one unit of LOTE to go towards credit. This course has not yet been approved by the Board, and will not be implemented until next year.

A Deputy Principal interviewed in the ACT informed us that there had been two previous attempts in the Territory to link LOTE to Vocational Education and Training. The first attempt was by a group of language teachers who wanted to link Beginner LOTE courses into the VET framework. The difficulty that arose, however, was the fact that there were no Training Packages for LOTE, so students could not receive credit for what they had done. Apparently a second attempt was made by a number of secondary colleges in the state who wanted to develop a ‘V Course’ (a course written across colleges) that would incorporate languages and VET. The teachers negotiated with the TAFE in order to ensure that they had the necessary competencies included in the course. The respondent was of the view that the inclusion of language competencies into the Tourism and Hospitality Training Package would make a considerable difference to the integration of LOTE and VET in the ACT.

Some initiatives to link LOTE and VET in different schools around the state were described:
Dickson College had also included Japanese within their VET Tourism course. This course has since been discontinued due to a teacher retiring;

Canberra Girls Grammar School had included Japanese within a VET Tourism course, this course was thought to have also been discontinued as a result of teacher turnover;

Hawker College has links with Thailand and students are encouraged to visit there, particularly if they are studying Tourism. This programme was considered to be very successful…because it has a strong base in the school; and

The principal at Narrabundah College had recently delivered a paper on the incorporation of LOTE and VET to a national VET conference. Several teachers at Narrabundah had also undertaken their Certificate IV qualifications in Workplace Training and Assessment, in order to meet the RTO requirements for delivery of TAFE Training Packages.

It was also noted that the ACT had some strong links with LOTE programmes outside the country, including a French exchange and the International Baccalaureate.

**New South Wales**

According to representatives from the Board of Studies NSW, there is no formal relationship between languages and VET in terms of studies for secondary school students in NSW. There is, however, provision for schools to design their own courses based around national standards. Where this is done, students are able to get credit towards TAFE Certificates for courses they have completed at school. Credit transfer arrangements between schools, universities and TAFEs, work both ways, so there is also the potential for students to undertake external study at a TAFE and receive credit towards their Higher School Certificate (HSC). One respondent commented, credit can be arranged to cover the full range of TAFE courses, in a whole range of industry areas.

The project team were informed by a LOTE representative from the NSW Board of Studies that there is potential for secondary LOTE teachers to get students accredited for the TAFE Applied Languages Certificates through year 11 and 12 LOTE courses. She noted, however, not all schools do this, very few I would say. The VET representative from the Board was not aware of any LOTE based units of competency that were currently accredited as part of the HSC, but felt that the most obvious [link that could be made] is Certificates II in Tourism, Sales and Office. He commented further that there is not really provision for LOTE to be
credited towards specific units of competency such as *IT, Business Services and Retail*...the *two most likely are Tourism and Hospitality*.

Schools are also able to incorporate the TAFE Translating and Interpreting (Paraprofessional) Certificate into their LOTE program. A representative from the Board of Studies noted that this had been done at her former school, where 25% of the students were from Chinese backgrounds.

We were told further that teachers are encouraged to make students aware of post school opportunities in their learning area, and information about these possibilities is included in all syllabuses. In this regard, a specific initiative to link LOTE and VET has been instigated by the Work in Schools Directorate in the Department of Education and Training, who sought input from the LOTE Professional Support Curriculum Directorate to develop a framework that makes explicit the link between skills developed in LOTE and other classes to vocational skills. This framework is known as the *Schools to Work Programme* and is a state government initiative, which seeks to develop *clear links between schools and what’s happening in the real world*. Students keep log books, in which they enter any work related skills developed inside or outside the classroom. Every teacher is given the opportunity to discuss how the skills learned in their classroom may be useful in a vocational context later.

According to respondents there is also the potential for teachers to develop their own vocationally-oriented LOTE modules and have them endorsed by the Board of Studies. In NSW there are two types of courses that can be offered in the compulsory years of schooling: ‘Board Developed Courses’ which are available for statewide delivery and ‘Board Endorsed Courses’ which are developed by individuals, and endorsed by the Board of Studies, but are not available for statewide delivery. The LOTE representative described a ‘Board Endorsed Course’ she had implemented in her school some years ago, which she named *Japanese in Tourism*. She did not get the course accredited. The idea for this program arose as a response to a perceived need in the community. She then commented, *as far as I know, I’m the only one*.

**Northern Territory**

Some years ago, the Northern Territory Education Department developed a curriculum document called *Languages for Careers*. Currently, however, there appears to be very little happening in the way of links between LOTE and VET in the Northern Territory.
A VET representative interviewed from the Northern Territory Education Department was unaware of any programs that linked LOTE with Vocational Education. Similarly, a representative from the Northern Territory School of Languages commented: *I don’t think we’re doing anything and I’m not aware of anything anyone else is doing.*

The VET representative was asked specifically about the relationship between VET and Aboriginal languages. She stated that, rather than teaching VET courses in Aboriginal languages in the Territory, it was normal for teachers to be teaching English to Aboriginal students within the VET program.

In addition, the AFMLTA representative thought that there might also be structures in place for teachers to embed the TAFE Applied Languages Certificates into the secondary curriculum in the Northern Territory.

**Queensland**

Interviews conducted with education representatives in Queensland suggested that there were no policies or programmes in place in the state to link LOTE and VET at a systemic level. When asked whether there was a policy on LOTE and VET, a LOTE representative at the Queensland Board of Studies informed us that, on the basis of suggestions from teachers, he had attempted to raise the possibility of developing a ‘*something else*’ course along VET lines for languages as a discussion item at a meeting of the LOTE advisory committee, which is the committee that recommends the syllabus. However, the decision had been made not to consider the proposal.

He was of the opinion that there were very few LOTE programmes in schools that had a vocational education focus. This was seen to be a consequence of the syllabus that had to be followed. It would appear that some TAFE courses used to incorporate LOTE into their curriculum, and that some schools *used to be able to tap into it*. But this possibility appears to be no longer available.

There is the possibility of teachers developing their own courses that combine LOTE and VET, one example mentioned was a course called *Languages for Tourism* that was developed by a school. The respondent also described how he had helped to develop a Board Registered Course called *Tourism Studies* at the school he had been in, which
incorporated a year of Japanese. Once the course has been developed the teacher then has to get the course registered by the Board of Studies. These ‘Board Registered Subjects’ do not count towards tertiary entrance; however, the modules may go towards the Secondary Education Certificate.

A representative from the VET in Schools Programme at the Queensland Education Department has been trying to arrange a work experience programme that combines languages and vocational education. She is currently arranging to take a group of students to Italy in December to show them what languages can do and the possibilities that exist globally. Students in the programme will be able to undertake work experience in areas such as mosaics, ballet, hospitality, and they are currently negotiating with a research centre to see if we can get work experience for top students in science who are also doing VET. A number of in-country contacts have been established for the programme, and the only barrier that may emerge is the insurance considerations. We were told that this innovative programme would be a first in Queensland.

When asked about pathways for students wishing to continue their study of LOTE in a vocational education context, one representative commented: There are no pathways at all. I am trying to build one! Another commented similarly: I don’t think there are any officially – we...try to motivate kids in certain subjects, if one of the banks has on the application for employment, what languages do you speak, we push it that way to make kids see that languages actually are useful.

It should also be noted that the AFMLTA representative interviewed was of the opinion that the Applied Languages Certificates were available for implementation in secondary schools in every state in Australia. It is therefore possible that this option is available in Queensland, but people are unaware of it.

**South Australia**

South Australia was mentioned by the AFMLTA representative, who had developed a position paper on good practice in incorporating LOTE and VET for the AFMLTA, as an example of where strong links between LOTE and VET were being established. She was under the impression that there was the potential for students to embed Certificate II and III in Applied Languages and receive dual recognition at the end of the day. An ITAB
representative also suggested that we contact Adelaide TAFE because of the work that they were doing to link LOTE and VET. Interviews with respondents working within the South Australian system suggested that, while they could see some achievement in the area, they were less enthusiastic about the systemic support for LOTE and VET at both a TAFE and schools level.

We interviewed one teacher who had incorporated the NAATI Certificate in Interpreting and Translating (Paraprofessional) into his Year 11 and 12 LOTE programs. Another teacher interviewed described how he had attempted to incorporate TAFE Certificate I and II levels into beginners’ courses in Chinese and German, through the one TAFE. This was not successful. He then approached a second TAFE about running a course that would embed LOTE through the Tourism School. Once again, this was unsuccessful.

A further interview was conducted with two representatives from the Senior Secondary Assessment Board of South Australia (SSABSA). One representative worked in the LOTE area, the other worked in the area of Health and Personal Development which supports a lot of workplace learning and community-based learning. She had been involved with the development of the first VET Curriculum Statement in SA and had been working with the TAFE sector to develop Vocational Education and Training pathways for students not intending to go on to University. Her work in this area also included work in the LOTE learning area.

The researchers were told that SSABSA does not currently have a policy specifically about incorporating LOTE in VET. There are structures in place for this to happen. According to two respondents, however, there hasn’t been a great take up. These respondents described some considerable barriers in relation to the implementation of LOTE in vocational education contexts in SA. One key barrier identified was a consequence of the South Australian policy context. According to the respondents, in 1989 the Minister responsible for the compulsory years of schooling and the Minister responsible for the further education signed an agreement that TAFE would not deliver general education and general education institutions would not deliver vocational education. The consequence of this has been that for a school in South Australia to offer a VET course, the school has to purchase the course from a Registered Training Organisation, or deliver the course under an auspicing agreement whereby the Quality Assurance of the course must be done by a Registered Training Organisation. In relation to LOTE, however, there is only one RTO in the state that delivers
language studies. This monopoly was seen to create a problem. As one respondent argued, *there is no such thing as user choice*. The consequence is that if the initial negotiations with the TAFE fall through, there are no other options available to them. One teacher interviewed, who had tried to incorporate LOTE into TAFE programmes, commented *it was impossible to pin the TAFEs down to an agreement...The stumbling block was with the TAFEs.*

In both instances, the teachers interviewed described how they had come up with the idea of incorporating LOTE and VET themselves. For one teacher it was a matter of ‘survival’ as the school was not getting enough enrolments. The other responded to a wave of *interest in careers and languages* throughout the state. It was also notable that both of these teachers were individually responsible for negotiating with the TAFEs.

Several specific examples were given of where LOTE and VET had been incorporated in the South Australian context. These examples included:

- An Italian programme at Mount Carmel College, where the teacher had done a lot of work developing VET accredited modules for her students;
- An Indonesian for Beginners programme at St Aloysius, where the teacher *battled her way through the bureaucracy and got accreditation for her girls*;
- A German teacher at Bladestone high school had been attempting to get VET accreditation for his students, *he battled with it*;
- A Japanese teacher teaching at several schools around Mt Gambier, who experienced a lot of frustration attempting to get VET accreditation for his students in the early couple of years, but finally got accredited through a local TAFE that did not offer a language;
- A French programme at Loretto College;
- A VET Unit for Spanish to be embedded in SOSE Stage 1 languages;
- A Private College which has an agreement with Onkaparinga TAFE with German and Tourism;
- A combined exchange program run for students from Victoria and South Australia. These students were taken to Thailand to work in range of businesses and enterprises in Chiang Mai for approximately 2 weeks. Students in South Australia gained accreditation towards stage 2 of their work education program. The respondent noted that they had hoped to be able to send students off to Thailand
with some *functional Thai*, but they *couldn't do that in the end*. She commented further, *Pity – that might have been a bit of a watershed in changing students' views and ideas. I don't know if they picked up any [language] but I didn't see any evidence of it;*

- A South Australian high school which was running exchange programmes to Spain. Students received credit towards Integrated Studies. Students who went were generally language students; and

- Another interesting programme mentioned was at Woodcroft College. The college is set in a tourist area. LOTE students at the school came up with an enterprise project to develop signage and brochures for students in Japanese. They received funding from the local council to do this. This programme was cited as being extremely successful. The teacher worked hard to get TAFE accreditation for the students, as well as assisting the students to get the enterprise project as well.

In addition, SSABSA has recently developed a draft recognition policy which is in the consultation and feedback stage. The draft policy looks at non-formal and experiential learning undertaken by students. The result of this policy may be that students who are background speakers of a LOTE and who have experience interpreting for family members, can obtain credit towards the South Australian Certificate of Education (SACE) for this non-formal learning.

One programme operating in the further education sector, which was mentioned by several respondents, was the Regency International School of Hotel Management. The School requires students to learn a LOTE as a pre-requisite for the course. However, languages are not taught through the school, and learners are required to develop their language skills elsewhere.

**Tasmania**
There is potential in Tasmania for VET coordinators to include LOTE into the VET Training Packages offered in schools. While national guidelines are set out by ANTA for each of the VET Training Packages, according to one respondent *there is considerable flexibility in how the Packages are delivered*, as long as all the necessary requirements of the programme are adhered to. The research team were directed to a coordinator of a VET Tourism programme in a senior secondary college in Tasmania, who had adapted the Tourism Training Package
so that LOTE could be incorporated as an option. Students were given the option of studying a tertiary entrance LOTE programme alongside their Tourism Certificate, and receiving credit towards it, or taking up ‘LOTE for Tourism’ Courses which focused on developing students cultural knowledge as well as the acquisition of some very basic language skills. He was very pleased with the success of this programme, and was of the view that if other tourism programmes in the state were not incorporating LOTE, they should be!

In addition, the Tasmanian Senior Assessment Board has adopted a process, akin to the NSW model, whereby generic criteria applicable to the workplace, that go beyond the old subject specific criteria we used to have, have been identified for each learning area. These criteria are essentially based on the old key competencies. It is a requirement that all syllabus writers must include three of the generic criteria into all non-tertiary entrance courses, and four criteria for pre-tertiary study. Year 11 and 12 LOTE courses must have fifteen criteria included within the syllabus. Five of these are externally examined, and of the other ten, four of them are generic competencies. These generic competencies are accorded the same weight as the subject specific criteria in terms of assessment. There is a standards document which describes the outcomes that students have to achieve. This set up was considered very favourably, this initiative is the one we think provides the best link, but time will tell.

When asked about similarities and differences between the Tasmanian and New South Wales programmes, we were told that:

In NSW they are not assessing work related criteria except by external assessment, we believe that external assessment is not the way of assessing any work-related criteria. [Internal assessment] gives more benefit to students because it is realistically assessed. It is often assessed in the context of the kids working in real situations. In this case, [they are] working in language scenarios, but in other cases, they might be working in school or outside school in the workplace.

Tasmania is currently at the point of accrediting its new language syllabus, and they are in the process of rationalising their syllabi. For this reason they have not developed a specific vocational LOTE syllabus. According to a respondent, we used to have syllabuses that were
little Mickey Mouse ones that were designed, if not for actually VET packages...for students undertaking VET study at the same time.

The LOTE syllabus has a series of levels (1-8) that correspond broadly with the different years of schooling. Levels, 2, 4, and 6 are designed for student in years 7-10. Level 8 courses are designed for students who are going on to tertiary study. According to the Board of Studies respondent, the Level 7 courses, are most appropriate for students undertaking vocational language courses. According to a respondent,

Level 8 is designed for students who envisage going on to languages at University. Level 7 is for students who have an interest in languages, who want to learn a language for personal interest, or to develop an interest in a vocational area – Tourism or Hospitality – who have a background in that language. The course is really designed with that client group in mind, but there is no way we’re going to call it a VET course, or a language for employment course, nor do we want it to be...The major element is what schools can do to emphasise the useful and worthwhile nature of [the course] in a vocational context. At least we have provided a syllabus that the community can identify as being useful in that area. In addition, students with no previous knowledge of languages who want to have a feel or a smattering of a language because it is of interest to them, can take levels 2, 4, or 6 in the language.

At the moment in Tasmania, all VET courses are offered at colleges and some district high schools, and these schools are all RTO’s who have responsibility for the VET programmes. The Board of Studies has the responsibility for the TCE. The representative from the Board of Studies indicated that it was beneficial to keep these two curriculum offerings separate:

We don’t want to be seen to be venturing into this area at the moment, in fact we have withdrawn from it. What that means is that most of the students at colleges do a VET course, and supplement it by doing some TCE subjects that they figure are related to what they do. Currently we do not provide that. We are negotiating with a University to examine ways of doing that and we have to have something available in the next year or two.
Victoria

From the interviews it is possible to identify three specific initiatives that link LOTE and VET in Victoria. The first is the potential in Victoria for students to embed the TAFE Certificate II and III in Applied Languages at the same time as completing a Victorian Certificate of Education (VCE) LOTE study. We were informed that this is not being implemented at Year 11 and 12 levels at the moment. According to a representative from the Victorian Curriculum Authority (VCA), some schools are taking on Certificate II at Year 10 level, and are doing pre-VCE work with a view to Certificate III. This was seen to be a result of a number of factors:

*Partly a staging thing [particularly in terms of aligning] the requirements for VCE and requirements for Certificate III. There is a substantial area that needs to be covered. There is a time factor. Also it is a factor of being a very new area – teachers are looking for more guidance and more advice in relation to how they map the Certificate against the VCE or against the P-10 framework.*

Another factor that was slowing down this process was the fact that the accreditation period for the VCA was not in line with the accreditation period for the TAFE Certificates. With modifications to the TAFE Certificate this year, the VCA chose to delay promoting the Certificates to schools until they had had an opportunity to assess it.

Some work has been done to facilitate the incorporation of the Certificates by the VCA, including the development of draft documents mapping the secondary LOTE outcomes with the TAFE competencies. In addition, the VCA has mapped out options for teachers in years 9 to 12 to look at how they might cover components of the Certificates in their classes.

There was a strong sense from the VCA representative interviewed that it was important to look at how the Certificates were working in Schools before promoting them as an option. She comments:

*From a VCA perspective, I would not want to see it taken up further by schools, before I had a sense of how schools were managing it, what the issues were when they’re actually implementing it…At the moment don’t have that.*
A second initiative is a website developed by the Careers Education Association of Victoria two years ago, and funded by the LOTE Unit in the Department of Education, Employment and Training. The website provides extensive information about:

- Why students should study a LOTE;
- How LOTE competencies can contribute to future career paths;
- Profiles of people who have continued to use LOTE in their careers;
- What languages can be studied and what the benefits of the languages are;
- Work experience locations;
- Information about educational pathways for students who wish to study LOTE; and
- Support for LOTE teachers.

In addition, the website provides information about different kinds of jobs that use LOTE skills, and links to different career websites so students can search for jobs in that area. It also provides profiles of people who have used language skills in their careers, as well as information about specific languages and their potential benefits for future careers. The website can be found at http://www.lotelinx.vic.edu.au.

Thirdly, the Catholic Education Commission of Victoria (CECV) has developed a programme, which places work experience students in contexts where they are required to use their language. The programme targets year 10 students. Students participate in two weeks of structured workplace learning in business environments where LOTE is spoken. They also participate in structured Vocational Education and Training modules which are delivered by Victoria University, TAFE Division, as the RTO, and supervised by the LOTE teachers. The modules link with Training Packages in three areas: Hospitality, Retail and Business (Office Administration). VET organisational and assessment support is provided through consultancy. Students negotiate with the assessor how assessment will take place and negotiate the date when any required essays, time-logs, completed manuals and completed diaries will be submitted.

Students in the programme enrol in Victoria University, TAFE Division and receive credit for the modules they complete and can receive exemptions against Diploma Courses in their further education. On completion of the project students receive three certificates, A
Statement of Completion from the TAFE Unit at Victoria University, A Record of Achievement from the participating school, A Certificate of Participation from the CECV.

Some 411 students have participated in the programme since its inception in 1997. The programme was designed to increase student participation in LOTE through the post compulsory years of high school. In this regard, it appears to be very successful. A recent survey of participants indicated that 40% continue LOTE study to TEE. Teachers have also noted a significant improvement in student classroom performance and personal confidence. The work placements allow students to experience first hand the relevance of studying a LOTE. A representative from the Catholic Education Office commented, I have a firm belief in this project – I have seen great value – more so than any other project I have been involved in.

Another respondent who had some knowledge of the programme spoke highly of it, commenting that it was enjoyed and appreciated by those students who undertook it. She did note however, that the programme had not taken off in a big way, precisely because it is linked to a work placement, which created logistics problems. She also had some concerns about the certification students received through the programme as, in her view, it was not as transferable as the Applied Languages Certificates.

The programme appears well-coordinated at a system level. A database of possible work experience placements has been developed over a number of years. Network meetings are held for teachers, and both the LOTE teacher and VET coordinator in the school have to attend. Throughout the program, support is available from the Victoria University (TAFE Division) and the CECV.

**Western Australia**
Part of the post-compulsory review in Western Australia involved a policy that any course of study in the post compulsory years of secondary school must have links to the VET area (see ‘Our Youth Our Future’). In line with this, there is a strong desire from the Curriculum Council of WA to incorporate a vocational education focus into LOTE in years 11 and 12. Currently, students in years 11 and 12 can undertake either a Curriculum Council accredited LOTE programme, or a Beginner LOTE programme (known as a Common Assessment Framework program). The Beginner LOTE programmes have more of a vocational education focus than the other programs, which are aimed at young people wishing to enter
university. Respondents indicated that the problem with the Beginner LOTE courses is that they are just that ‘beginner’ courses. There was a perception that young people are either turned off by the name, or are not eligible for the courses because they have already completed 4 to 5 years of study in the language.

A recent innovation in the state has been the incorporation of TAFE Certificate II and Certificate III in Applied Language Studies into secondary school LOTE classes. These certificates are made up of 55-60 week modules known as Units of Competency. According to one respondent, Certificate II is roughly equivalent to Year 11, and Certificate III is roughly equivalent to Year 12, though nowhere near as demanding. For this to occur, the LOTE teacher needs to liaise with the VET coordinator in the school, the TAFEs and the Curriculum Council to ensure that they are appropriately registered to deliver the Certificates. Teachers who do so have a choice of either:

- Offering the TAFE certificates only as stand alone units; or
- Embedding the TAFE certificates into the Curriculum Council accredited courses.

Where the course is appropriately registered, students who successfully complete the requirements will be awarded TAFE Certificates, and this will be noted on their Year 12 Certificate. If students complete the course as a stand-alone unit they will only receive a pass grade, which translates to a ‘C’ grade on their Year 12 Western Australian Certificate of Education. Where the courses are embedded, learners will receive a Grade as part of their Curriculum Council Assessment (from A-D) as well as an assessment of competency as part of the TAFE assessment. This is because TAFE courses are assessed according to competencies – a learner is either competent or not competent – while secondary courses are assessed according to Student Outcomes, which involves greater gradation in assessment. This may better benefit students who receive a grade higher than a C. This may not benefit other students, who while they successfully complete the TAFE Certificate, only receive a D towards their Secondary Education Certificate.

Respondents remarked on there being considerable interest from LOTE teachers who want to incorporate the TAFE Certificates into their Year 11 and 12 classes. Fourteen teachers from Catholic, Independent and Government high schools attended the seminar offered by the Modern Language Teachers’ Association of WA (MLTAWA), TAFE and the Curriculum Council.
The opportunity to incorporate the Certificates into the Secondary curriculum has only recently been made available, and very few teachers have piloted these programmes. One example we heard was of a secondary teacher at a government school who had received her Certificate IV in Workplace Assessment and Training and was incorporating the TAFE Certificates into her Year 11 and 12 classes, she was described as passionate about this, passionate about having more kids doing languages. Another teacher at a Catholic High School, who had been one of the first to incorporate the TAFE Certificates into her Year 11 and 12 classes, was also described as a real advocate for this.

In addition, respondents commented on how individual teachers/schools had adapted their LOTE units so that they were more vocationally-oriented. A specific programme mentioned in this context was an Indonesian programme that had been integrated into a hospitality programme. This programme received NALSAS funding. At the end of the year students ran a college restaurant. Students welcomed people using the language, explained the Indonesian menu and served Indonesian food they had prepared. Another example mentioned was of a high school in a tourist area of Western Australia. The principal at the high school had developed links with businesses around the town, predominantly in the hospitality industry, to enable LOTE students to undertake structured workplace learning using the target language.

The MLTAWA have also identified another opportunity for promoting links between LOTE and VET through the National VET in Schools Awards. The MLTAWA was distributing nomination forms to LOTE teachers around the state and asking them to think about nominating LOTE teachers working in the VET area. The MLTAWA were themselves hoping to nominate one of the teachers who had been involved in pioneering the LOTE Applied Language Certificate in schools.

**An Industry Perspective**

As part of the consultation process, interviews were conducted with a range of industry representatives, including personnel from Qantas, Rio Tinto, and the Mitsui Company Australia Ltd, as well as representatives from two bilateral trade agencies. When asked how well prepared school leavers were in terms of their knowledge of Asian languages and cultures, the answer from the majority of respondents was a resounding Not at all! Qantas personnel had a slightly different view. In their view, the year 12 education standard could
not be used as a reliable language competency measurement, as *Language competency varies a lot from language to language*. They noted that if one person had a *year 12 pass in German or some other Anglo Saxon language* then they are usually fluent, however a *university language qualification is required if the language is Japanese*. They also commented:

*Direct exposure to the language is a distinct advantage…For a person with significant prior language training, a one-month consolidated structured school excursion would be all that is needed to gain the type of fluency we require. For [someone with no background in the language] immersion for about a year would be required.*

Industry representatives were able to identify some different kinds of training programmes that had been implemented with the purpose of developing language and cultural knowledge skills for people in the workforce. Some of these initiatives were working at a whole of industry level, while others were company initiatives.

One respondent referred to training which was provided to people working in foreign aid programmes. These programmes were run by the various state and territory governments, each of which *has its own coordinating body for foreign aid*. In addition, some companies had arranged for customised training programmes to be run through TAFE institutions. More information about these programmes can be found in the Section on *Developments in the Technical and Further Education Sector*. Another respondent referred to the existence of University exchange programmes in areas such as Law, Media and Commerce.

Two specific company training initiatives were also mentioned. These were:

- A training programme in Asian languages run by Clough Engineering. This programme is designed to assist employees in the social component of business negotiations; and
- The Qantas foreign language training programme, which is described in more detail below.

Qantas currently targets ten priority languages in their training programme. These are divided into, five Anglo-Saxon languages: French, German, Portuguese, Italian, Dutch,
Spanish and five Asian languages: Mandarin (both mainland & Taiwanese dialects), Cantonese, Tagalog and Indonesian. The priority languages change regularly, with their selection being both operationally & financially driven. In choosing the languages attention is paid to International Routes and Competitive Advantage via in-flight language competencies.

The competency level required by Qantas ranges from good conversation fluency through to native standard fluency. The company is most interested in developing oral proficiency in their employees. One of the company representatives interviewed commented that it’s common to find people with theoretical and grammatical proficiencies. We need them to be able to use the language, be fluent in it.

Within the Qantas training framework, specific workshops are delivered that address different skill sets. The workshops include:

- Skills Development Workshops which attend to cultural awareness including: how to do your job in the target language, how to deal with a disgruntled customer, how to serve food and beverage with the language. The workshops require a high degree of competency in the language and focus on developing vocabulary and phrases through role-playing.
- Public Announcement Skills Workshops, which are set up to enable employees to deliver unprepared announcements in unprepared ways. The workshops also focus more specifically upon the technical language associated with an airplane.
- Grammatical Skill Workshops are offered on the occasions that our training needs analysis dictates that our staff require them.

In addition the company offers computer-based training. This component was described by a respondent as entry-level stuff, you know, publicly available CD ROMs. We also use translating phones and pre-recorded announcements that our staff can play back.

Qantas runs ongoing training workshops for staff to enable them to maintain their fluency. In the past these workshops have been non-compulsory, but a recent needs analysis indicated that the linguistic skill-base of employees was deteriorating. For this reason, the programme is going to become mandatory for staff.
Qantas’ policy in relation to hiring employees has changed somewhat in the past 10 years. In 1992 it was company policy to employ people with a minimum of year 12 language skills. Applicants were required to be able to read and speak the language fluently and correctly, we allowed for a couple of mistakes. Their skills were assessed through role playing scenarios: eg you’re in the cabin and someone is ill. They were then required to read from a text and were asked to paraphrase the text. The company found, however, that this strategy eventually exhausted the market, and that the only people applying were background speakers of the language, who often did not have the requisite English language skills. So they were forced to discontinue this policy. They are now about to reintroduce a policy of employing people with language skills. According to one respondent: we figure that with the new graduates from university programs and schools that the market will have refilled.
Section 4: Models for Linking Languages and Vocational Education in Secondary Schools

By synthesising the information from the previous section, it is possible to identify six models of LOTE-VET delivery in Australian schools. These are:

- Incorporation of the TAFE Certificate in Applied Languages either as a stand-alone course, or embedded in the general LOTE course;
- Inclusion of LOTE into VET Training Packages, or other VET courses;
- Application of generic workplace competencies in LOTE courses;
- LOTE courses with a vocational focus;
- Business exchange programmes; and
- LOTE-oriented work experience programmes.

The TAFE Certificate in Applied Languages
According to an AFMLTA representative, there is the potential to embed the TAFE Certificate in Applied Languages into secondary language courses in every state and territory. While this may be true, it was apparent that key Education Department and Boards of Studies representatives in some states and territories were unaware of this option. The two states that have come the furthest in developing this option are South Australia and Western Australia. Victoria is currently developing systems to assess the viability of embedding these certificates. Each of these three states has developed documentation to enable language teachers to map tertiary LOTE outcomes against the TAFE competencies. It would appear that each state has been working independently to do this.

The Applied Languages Certificates are not specific to any particular vocation. Competencies achieved are intended to be generic so that they can be applied to a range of vocational contexts. This can be seen in the descriptors which follow, taken from the LOTE 3002 TAFE Certificate:

- Obtain information through a telephone inquiry;
- Negotiate a routine problematic spoken exchange;
- Respond to routine oral instructions;
- Relate a range of information from an oral presentation;
• Relate a range of information from a written procedural text; and
• Write a note or message.³

This particular Certificate is seen by the Western Australian Curriculum Council to be best offered to students in the second half of year 11. The Certificates focus mainly on the development of oral competencies. The courses are assigned 55 hours delivery time for non-character-based languages and 60 hours delivery time for character-based languages. One respondent informed us that they were generally assigned 80 hours in the secondary language classroom to give leeway to mixed levels.

The Certificates are organised into four levels. Certificate II and III are generally seen to be aligned with years 11 and 12 respectively. There is the potential to incorporate Certificate I into year 10 language classes; however, if the course is to be linked with a TAFE institution, this may cause problems as the TAFEs are only able to enrol students over 15 years of age.

There are two potential ways of incorporating the Certificates into secondary school classes. They can either be adopted as stand-alone modules, or they can be embedded into the general LOTE course. In the states where this option is possible, students may opt to either undertake just the secondary school LOTE course, or just the TAFE Certificate, or they may choose to undertake dual certification. This will be dependent, of course, on the individual school structures.

Where the module is adopted as a stand-alone unit, students are instructed purely in the TAFE Certificate, following the TAFE curriculum and TAFE assessment models. Their achievement in the course will be noted on their Secondary Education Certificate, however, their grade cannot be credited towards tertiary entrance.

It is also possible to incorporate the TAFE Certificate into the general LOTE course. In this model the teacher may either run the TAFE Certificate course with one group of students, and not with another, or they may meld the two courses and run both the TAFE Certificate and the tertiary entrance oriented LOTE programme simultaneously, to enable students to achieve dual certification. Teachers may choose to run both programmes with the whole class or segment the class into two groups, one of which is tertiary focused and the other

which is not. The dual certification framework may present some difficulties for teachers as students’ work needs to be assessed against two different assessment frameworks, the competency-based TAFE model, and the outcomes-based schools model. In addition, there is a difference in the type of assessment tasks required by the TAFE Curriculum and the school LOTE curriculum. To address this, it would appear that teachers have the option of designing two assessment tasks for each component of the course, conducting additional assessments throughout the course, or adapting their current assessment tasks so that students can receive two types of marks from the same work. While this may sound daunting, it is worth noting that many upper secondary school teachers are in a position where they are combining Year 11 and Year 12 students in the same classes, and according to literature distributed by Central TAFE, in Perth, the TAFE Certificates offer the potential for ‘Strong and viable upper school LOTE classes [which] will eliminate the need to combine small Year 11 and Year 12 groups.’

Respondents identified a number of benefits of the Applied Languages Certificate model. A Board of Studies was of the view that this model addressed the problem of student retention to year 12, by attracting the students who were being disillusioned by LOTE because it is too content-based and aimed at kids bound for tertiary level. Another teacher commented, we now have a new courses, it satisfies the Curriculum Council, it blends in more easily. There is a lot more benefit for schools. A TAFE respondent claimed that, it does actually increase numbers in LOTE classes, while one of the teachers who had been involved in the programme extolled, It is working! The pathway is working! An AFMLTA representative was particularly supportive of this model, particularly in relation to embedding the programme into the ordinary LOTE classes.

A limitation of the model was also identified by the AFMLTA representative who noted that as No VET Training Package or course contains LOTE as a requirement, [so] the credit that is given is not that valuable for many students.

The ease of incorporating the certificates into the school curriculum appears to differ in the different states. Some of the factors that affect the ease of incorporation are:

---

4 Central TAFE (2002) VET LOTE in Schools. Brochure put out by the Centre for Languages at Central TAFE.
• The availability of necessary information about this option;
• The structures in place to assist teachers and schools to incorporate the Certificates;
• The relationship between the education authorities and the TAFE sector in the state;
• RTO delivery requirements; and
• The internal coordination between the school LOTE staff and school VET staff.

The possibility of incorporating the TAFE Applied Language Certificates into the secondary school system is relatively new, and there is little information available to make LOTE teachers, VET coordinators and schools aware of this option. In Perth, for example, there is a concerted push from the MLTAWA, the Curriculum Council and the TAFEs to make teachers and schools aware of the possibilities offered. There are only a few pioneers available to describe their stories to others. The representative from the Victorian Board of Studies, indicated that the Board was not promoting the programme until they had some evidence that this way of working would be successful.

Overall, the structures in place to assist teachers and schools to incorporate the Certificates are only just being developed. In South Australia it would appear that, for the most part, it is up to the individual school to negotiate with the TAFEs in order to incorporate the programme. There has been some information developed by the Modern Language Teachers Association of South Australia (MLTASA) to assist teachers to successfully integrate the certificates. Similar draft documentation has also been produced in Victoria.

Some moves were being made to systematise the process at a state/system level in Western Australia, so that the incorporation of the certificates was not merely the responsibility of the individual school. One element of this is the collaborative professional development programmes being put in place, and the promotional material being developed which is endorsed by both the Curriculum Council and Perth Central TAFE. In addition, they have also developed materials which map the competencies achieved through the TAFE Certificate against the Curriculum Framework and against the International Second Language Proficiency Ratings (ISLPR). However, there is still some way to go, and the structures that are in place are not necessarily fool proof. For example, one Western Australian teacher had taken his students through a year of the TAFE Certificate, but had not advised the Curriculum Council that he had enrolled the students. The result was that the

---

5 Language Competency Framework for Vocational Education
students were unable to receive recognition of their TAFE Certification on their Secondary Education Certificate. To address issues like this, the Curriculum Council representative in Western Australia has indicated the need for a flow chart for schools to use with information about who to contact and what to do at each step of the process in order to implement the Certificates successfully.

In situations where both the secondary school system and the TAFE sector can perceive mutual benefits in schools delivering the Certificates, there appears to be more chance of this programme being successful. In Western Australia. For example, a TAFE representative interviewed regarded the integration of the Level I-III Certificates into secondary schools as a great way of encouraging enrolments into TAFE courses when students leave the school system. By contrast, there was the perception among respondents from South Australia that the TAFE sector was obstructing the inclusion of the Certificates into secondary schools because the schools were poaching [their] students. It was not possible in the course of this research to confirm whether this perception was actually held by the TAFEs or not. Another factor which appears to have affected the relationship between the TAFE sector and the schools sector in South Australia is a Ministerial Agreement, adopted in 1989, which clearly articulated the roles that each sector would play. The effect of this agreement is that only TAFEs can deliver vocational programmes in this state. This has created some difficulties, as there is only one TAFE institution in the state currently offering language programmes.

TAFE Certificates must be delivered by a Registered Training Organisation, or auspiced by an RTO. The general scenario is that the school will link with a TAFE or other RTO to do this, for which there is a cost. In Western Australia, there is a $600 charge per school, and a further $10 charge per enrolled student to cover the administrative fee for certificates. Schools can currently apply for funding from the VET in Schools Program to cover this cost. The RTO is then responsible for monitoring the assessment and issuing the Certificates. The School and auspicing RTO sign a Memorandum of Understanding, which details their obligations. The auspicing agreement may require the LOTE teacher to provide the RTO with copies of assessments to ensure the standards are the same, and a potential school visit. The LOTE teacher then incorporates the Applied Language Units of Competency into the Year 11 and Year 12 program and submits the program to the RTO for approval. All the teaching and instruction is delivered by the LOTE teacher at the school, and is moderated by the RTO. While it appears to be easy in some states to find an RTO that will auspice the
inclusion of the Certificates into the secondary curriculum, the interviews suggest that it can be more difficult in others.

According to the AFMLTA representative, however, there is no necessity for the programme to be delivered by the TAFE. *It can be delivered by any registered provider, which can be the school.* There was some suggestion from the consultations that if this is the case, then the LOTE teacher may have to undertake Certificate IV in Workplace Training and Assessment. One teacher who had undertaken this commented that it *was really easy – no sweat whatsoever.* An MLTAWA representative remarked that there appeared to be a general move towards all LOTE teachers undertaking the Applied Languages Certificates having their Certificate IV.

An essential element in the successful incorporation of this model appears to relate to the level of cooperation between the LOTE teacher and the VET or careers coordinator within the school. At a professional development programme run in Perth specifically to provide teachers with information about how to incorporate these certificates into their classes, teachers commented on difficulties experienced liaising with their VET Coordinator, who was unaware of this option.

Example:
The LOTE teacher at Secondary College A wanted to find a way of improving retention in year 11 and 12 LOTE classes. She approached the VET coordinator in her school to inquire about running the Applied Languages Certificates in her classroom. The VET coordinator was amenable, but not aware of the programme. She then found out from the local TAFE what was required to run the programme, and chose to undertake her Certificate IV in Workplace Training and Assessment. She decided to embed the programme into her Indonesian classes in Year 11 and 12. She received a grant from the VET in Schools initiative to cover the cost of the TAFE auspicing, and then enrolled her students in both the Board of Studies tertiary-oriented LOTE programme, and the TAFE Certificates. She is *passionate about this programme, and passionate about having more kids doing languages.*

The researchers have identified a number of potential advantages for students, schools and teachers as a result of adopting the Applied Language Certificates Model, as well as some potential disadvantages of the model. These are listed in the table below.
### Incorporation of the Applied Languages Certificates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Potential Advantages of the Model</th>
<th>Potential Disadvantages of the Model</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• The course is non-vocationally specific so that it can be applied to a range of vocational contexts, irrespective of what career path students are intending to achieve.</td>
<td>• The fact that the course is not linked to any specific vocation may mean that students may not see the relevance to their career path.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Students have the potential to achieve dual certification, by achieving credit towards their Secondary Education Certificate as well as TAFE Certification.</td>
<td>• The procedures required to achieve RTO status may be costly, or may require additional training for teachers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The TAFE Certificate is nationally recognised and accredited.</td>
<td>• Where appropriate structures are not in place at a system level, it becomes difficult for individual schools to negotiate with TAFEs to incorporate the Certificate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Students who successfully complete components of the course may receive additional credit points for entry into a range of TAFE Certificates.</td>
<td>• The processes appear to be cumbersome because of the number of players involved: the LOTE teacher, the VET coordinator, the Curriculum Council/Board of Studies, and the TAFEs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Students who complete Certificates II and III will only need to do 1 more year of part time study to receive their Certificate IV, which may encourage them to continue with languages as part of their further education.</td>
<td>• Vocational competencies are made explicit through the course framework.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Vocational competencies are made explicit through the course framework.</td>
<td>• There is an option available for students who are not interested in studying towards Tertiary Entrance but want to continue with their LOTE.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• There is an option available for students who are not interested in studying towards Tertiary Entrance but want to continue with their LOTE.</td>
<td>• Where the Certificates are delivered as stand-alone modules there is the potential of dividing the LOTE cohort in two, leading to even smaller classes;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Where the Certificates are embedded into the curriculum, teachers will have to look at their assessment procedures, processes and tasks in some detail to ensure all assessment requirements are covered for both TAFE and the Curriculum Council/Board of Studies; and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Where teachers combine both the stand-alone model and the embedded model in the same class, they will need to put in place processes and procedures for</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In addition to the advantages and disadvantages of the model listed above, there are also specific issues associated with the different methods of incorporating the Certificates into the curriculum:

- Where the Certificates are delivered as stand-alone modules there is the potential of dividing the LOTE cohort in two, leading to even smaller classes;
- Where the Certificates are embedded into the curriculum, teachers will have to look at their assessment procedures, processes and tasks in some detail to ensure all assessment requirements are covered for both TAFE and the Curriculum Council/Board of Studies; and
- Where teachers combine both the stand-alone model and the embedded model in the same class, they will need to put in place processes and procedures for
delivering different classroom activities and assessment tasks for each cohort of students.

**Incorporation of the NAATI Diploma of Interpreting/Translating (Paraprofessional)**

It is possible for schools to link their curriculum with the NAATI Diploma of Interpreting/Translating (Paraprofessional) Certificate offered through the TAFEs. The researchers interviewed one teacher in South Australia who had implemented such a programme in his secondary college. The course focuses on bilingual competency for interpreting and translating – not just Vietnamese or English, but both languages, and how to switch nicely between them and not conflate them. The course delivered essentially covers the first year of the NAATI Diploma Course, which is a four-year course. Lecturers from TAFE are brought in to assess the students, and successful students are then selected to do the Diploma Course. Students also receive credit for the course towards their Secondary Education Certificate.

**Example:**
At Senior College B, the LOTE coordinator, recognising a decline in the level of enrolments in LOTE, decided to incorporate the NAATI Diploma as part of the LOTE programme in order for languages to survive. The language taught is Vietnamese. The college only caters for students over the age of 18. The programme is promoted through advertisements in the Vietnamese community newspaper, in the school curriculum booklet and in the local newspaper. In delivering the programme he focuses on the legal side – health, education and social issues…and relates to what students know. To do this he works closely with a TAFE, following the National TAFE curriculum. He currently has 30 students enrolled in the programme, with the majority of the class being background Vietnamese speakers. A number of people in the course are currently employed as community workers at a local hospital who want to refresh their skills. Other students have come straight from high school.

For obvious reasons, the level of proficiency required of students enrolled in this programme is considerably higher than that required of students in the Applied Languages Certificates. It is notable that both of the examples described in the consultation process had been implemented in schools/colleges where there was a high proportion of background speakers. There is no reason, however, why this programme could not be implemented with a non-
background speaker cohort, if the level of proficiency acquired in the language classroom is sufficient.

An AFMLTA representative was very complementary about the possibilities of embedding the NAATI Diploma into the language classroom. She was of the opinion that the model was really useful for first language learners, because of the cross-cultural component. She also indicated that there was the potential for students to achieve dual certification in relation to their ESL Certificate. The Diploma also has the potential to be embedded in ESL programmes for tertiary entrance. She did highlight that there was one limitation to the model in relation to the secondary context, stating *there are limits to the components of the course that students can do. They demand a certain social maturity.*

Some of the potential advantages and disadvantages of the model that have been identified by the researchers are outlined in the table below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NAATI Diploma of Interpreting/Translating (Paraprofessional)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Potential Advantages of the Model</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Students have access to a direct career pathway, which can be useful across a variety of vocations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Students prior knowledge is valued and the course can be tailored around subjects that interest students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The language used in the programme is relevant and meaningful to students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Students achieve credit towards a nationally recognisable TAFE Diploma as well as towards their Secondary Education Certificate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The programme caters for background speakers of a LOTE, and assists them to improve their English as well as the target LOTE.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Potential Disadvantages of the Model</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The level of proficiency required to participate in the programme is much higher than generally achieved through the school system, and is therefore best suited to background speakers of the LOTE.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- RTO delivery requirements mentioned in relation to the Applied Languages Certificate also apply to this course.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Students do not receive a Certificate as a result of the course, but only credit towards the Diploma.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The course only takes one year which is not sufficient to develop the necessary linguistic skills to become an interpreter/translator.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Inclusion of LOTE in Other VET Certificates**

Another model for integrating LOTE into Vocational Education and Training, involves the inclusion of LOTE as a creditable subject into another vocational education course. For the most part, LOTE is included as an optional subject that can be credited to the course. The examples that were cited through the interviews were generally tourism and/or hospitality courses.
The researchers had the opportunity to speak at length to a coordinator of one of these programmes. He was running a VET Tourism programme in Tasmania and encouraged all students in his programme who had some language learning experience to continue with LOTE in conjunction with the VET programme. The programme, in fact, won the national award for the best VET college trainer in Australia in 2001. The VET Tourism programme is a national programme with national guidelines that cover things as unit content and assessment. According to the VET coordinator, the programme is *pretty well set out, but how I deliver it is up to me. This is good in terms of flexibility, as long as I cover the key criteria and assess the competencies.* Students in the programme can take a general language course as part of their study, or cultural taster courses that have been designed specifically for the VET Tourism programme. LOTE is optional. When asked whether he would consider the incorporation of LOTE as a compulsory unit, the coordinator commented, *I would probably not consider it as a compulsory unit because it might turn some students off. Some students just want to go into retail travel that sort of stuff.*

Students in the programme have a pathway from school into the TAFE Tourism Diploma, or the Bachelor of Tourism Course. The project team was told that study of a language is a compulsory part of the Bachelor of Tourism Course.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Senior Secondary College C offers French and Japanese as optional modules to the Tourism Course. The school caters only for year 11 and 12 students. Year 10 students from nearby feeder schools who are interested in applying for the Tourism course have to undertake a formal interview to get into the programme. During the interview process, the VET Tourism Coordinator strongly encourages [students who have done a language previously] to continue with their LOTE, especially for Japanese, or for kids wanting to go on to University. In addition, the LOTE teachers at the school tailored a series of ‘A Courses’ (Japanese for Tourism and Indonesian for Tourism) specifically for students in the VET-Tourism programme. The A Courses are of 50 hours duration and are taster courses which provide some very basic language and an overview of Japanese/Indonesian culture. The response of students to the A Courses have been very successful. They enjoy it and can see the relevance of it all...if just language-based it would turn them off. Other students who are not enrolled in the VET-Tourism programme have also asked if they can enrol in the A Courses. Of the twenty students in the class, two are studying French as a language elective, three are studying Japanese, while an additional nine have taken up Japanese for Tourism, and four have taken up Indonesian for Tourism.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As mentioned in the previous section, units of language competency are now included as optional modules in the Hospitality and Tourism Training Package developed by ANTA. This
programme has only recently been endorsed, and will not be incorporated into the secondary school VET context until next year, if it is approved by the various state/territory Boards of Studies. The programme described above does not reflect these recent changes. It would appear that it is possible for LOTE to be included in any VET in Schools programme offered. However, most VET programmes offered through schools are linked closely to the National TAFE Curricula. Currently, the only ANTA Training Package that incorporates LOTE as an option at TAFE level is the recently reviewed Tourism and Hospitality Training Package, which is due to be introduced next year. There are also moves to investigate the inclusion of LOTE as an option in the National Training Packages for Retail, and for Community Services and Health and possibly the Public Safety Training Package. Without the endorsement of LOTE as a creditable option in the ANTA Training Packages, it is unlikely that many VET coordinators in schools would consider incorporating LOTE as an option into the school VET programme.

Example:

In [High School D] we had a course we made up called tourism studies. As part of the course we had a year of Japanese. Since then they have produced Tourism as a [National Training] Package...I registered this and that and kids got a certificate. They learned about tourism, understanding theme parks, excursions to airport, flash hotels. The idea of the clientele – how you had to dress, make them really dress up and look professional – learn some Japanese and you can at least say hello, how are you going, how can I help you. They didn’t progress very much in Japanese, but the language was geared to use at the reception desk.

Some potential advantages and disadvantages of this type of model are listed below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Inclusion of Language into VET Courses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Potential Advantages of the Model</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The language is seen to be meaningful to students because it relates directly to their career path.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Language competencies can be customised explicitly to match with vocational competencies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Students receive credit towards a TAFE Certificate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Students gain extra credit points for entry into TAFE courses.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Students may be encouraged to continue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Heavy reliance on the VET Coordinator for inclusion of LOTE within the curriculum, and promotion of the LOTE option to students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Reliance on recognition of LOTE within the ANTA Training Packages.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The only ANTA Training Package which does include LOTE is the Hospitality and Tourism Training Programme, and then LOTE only has optional status.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Perceptions of the crowded curriculum.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
with LOTE in conjunction with their further education.
- Links are encouraged between LOTE and VET staff within the school.

Application of Generic Workplace Competencies to the LOTE Course
This model involves in the identification of generic workplace competencies that are achieved through studying LOTE. This model has been adopted in both New South Wales and Tasmania, although in slightly different forms.

Example:
The following example of how VET Competencies can be linked to LOTE is adapted from materials provided by the NSW Department of Education and Training.

**Subject:** Japanese (Years 9 & 10)

**Activity:** Eating Out

**Experiences:** I had to research Japanese food and eating etiquette using the Internet. I accessed language information from textbooks and videos to learn Japanese expressions for going to a restaurant and ordering and eating food. I then had to work with a group to construct and produce a role play for recording on video/digital camera. We evaluated our videos on completion. Then an excursion was organised for us to go to a restaurant and use our Japanese in a real situation.

**Employment related skills:**
* Research, analyse and use information related to understanding other cultures
* Understand the needs of others and work in a team
* Communicate with others in another language
* Monitor and evaluate our own and others performances on tape
* Utilise available technology utilising the Internet and video/digital camera

In Tasmania, the development of this model has involved the identification of generic criteria that **go beyond the old subject specific criteria that we used to have**, and are based on the **old key competencies**. All syllabus writers must include at least three generic criteria for programmes that are vocationally-focused, and four generic criteria for pre-tertiary courses. In the LOTE context, the LOTE syllabus identifies four generic criteria as well as language specific outcomes. There is no LOTE syllabus available in the state that is not focused on tertiary entrance. Students are assessed in the class about their competency in relation to the generic criteria.

The NSW model has developed as part of the Schools to Work Programme which is a state government initiative. The programme assists students to gather and record the work-related skills they are developing both inside and outside the classroom and **across the board**. According to a LOTE representative from the state, **every teacher in the school has the opportunity to discuss with students what work-related skills might look like, how they**
can gain them, and how they might be useful in a vocational context later. The LOTE sector of the Education Department identified language skills and then linked the outcomes to the VET in Schools taxonomy, and drafted a series of employment-related skills. They also produced a series of materials with examples of how teachers could make explicit these employment related skills in relation to specific language learning activities used in the classroom.

A key benefit of this kind of initiative, identified by respondents, is that it reduces the amount of work involved in integrating a vocational focus into the language classroom. At a system level, there is no need to develop additional syllabus documents. At a school level there is no necessity for teachers to change their programmes to suit a vocational focus. As one respondent commented, It's not adding another layer, it's adding to a potential. One respondent did note, that there had been some discomfort expressed by teachers with regard to [the generic criteria], but they are now very much accepted that new basics should be incorporated into the curriculum.

Some of the possible advantages and disadvantages of this model are listed below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Incorporation of Generic Workplace Competencies into Language Classes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Potential Advantages of the Model</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Assists in the development of a portfolio for students that can be used when applying for jobs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The alignment of LOTE and VET competencies at system level.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Low cost option.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• If taken up at a system level, there is little work for teachers or schools.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Makes explicit vocational skills and competencies learned through LOTE classes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Teachers do not need to change the LOTE course they are presenting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Presents relevance of language skills to the workplace.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Non-vocationally specific.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Presentation of Language Classes with a Vocational Education Focus**

There is some suggestion from the interviews that there have been moves at a national level to incorporate a focus on vocations and career options into language courses. We were
informed by one respondent that this is a *national trend with languages, and is built into the Collaborative Curriculum and Assessment Framework for Languages*. She stated further that it has been *recognised nationally that you have to make that link* between all learning areas, and the world of work. One respondent was of the view that in general LOTE syllabi were written with the student as the *tourist*, not the provider of services.

**Example:**

High School E was located in a tourist area. The students and LOTE teacher noted that there was no signage available for tourists in the area. The LOTE teacher assisted the students to get money from the local councils to produce signs and brochures in Japanese. She later sought accreditation for the course through TAFE and was able to get students involved in an enterprise project that helped them to put something back into their community.

In addition, there are numerous examples of teachers throughout Australia who are undertaking LOTE classes with a vocational focus. These examples are often initiated by the teacher with no systemic support. For the most part, they appear to have been designed as a way of increasing student interest in studying LOTE and as a means of making languages more relevant, meaningful and applied.

A representative from the Catholic Education Commission of Victoria commented that, in conjunction with the work placement programme, the Commission had also been *encouraging schools to adopt a work-centred approach* in their general language programmes. They suggest, for example, having a theme related to an industry area, getting students to conduct an interview between an employer and an employee or asking students to complete an application form, in order to encourage schools to relate language learning to careers in general.

**Example:**

The LOTE teacher at Senior Campus F applied for support from the Education Department to integrate LOTE into an aspect of the hospitality programme, *because there were two members of staff who were interested in working together*. They received a small amount of funding which gave them time to plan the programme, which was conducted over the year. Students then ran an Indonesian restaurant, they welcomed people using the target language, introduced the menu, and cooked Indonesian food - *generally the atmosphere was Indonesian*. Students reported that they really enjoyed the experience. The respondent we spoke to considered the programme to be very successful in terms of getting students interested, but was not sure that *the LOTE element had achieved all that it could have*. 
The table below highlights some of the potential advantages and disadvantages of incorporating languages and vocational education.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Presentation of Language Classes with a Vocational Education Focus</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Potential Advantages of the Model</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- There is the potential for students to perceive the practical relevance between LOTE and the workplace.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- This may be a cheap option for schools.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- There is the potential to develop strong community support for LOTE through this kind of programme.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Potential Disadvantages of the Model</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- There is no additional certification available.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- There is a heavy reliance on the individual LOTE teacher.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Teachers will be required to adapt activities to meet curriculum requirements.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Some respondents mentioned that the level of proficiency achieved by students is variable.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Business Exchange Programmes**

Some schools have put in place international exchange programmes with a business focus. Some of the programmes described to us involved short work experience placements. Others included visits to different businesses in the target country. Not all of these programmes have been run through the LOTE learning area. One example involved students receiving credit towards Integrated Studies. While the business exchange programmes have the potential to develop students’ language skills in a vocational context, this does not always happen. Often the focus is on the business culture without any inclusion of language learning into the programme. Two programmes described to us were being coordinated at a state-wide level. Other programmes described were school level initiatives.

**Example:**

Students from South Australia and Victoria went on an exchange to Chiang Mai, Thailand to work in a range of businesses and enterprises. Students had to apply for the programme and, if successful, gained accreditation through their work education programme. There had been a desire to at least give [students] some functional Thai to go with – at least be able to greet. But this had not been possible. One respondent commented, It’s a pity – that might have been a bit of a watershed to changing students views and ideas. I don’t know if they picked up anything, but I didn’t see any evidence of it.
Example:
A programme is currently being developed in Queensland to take students for work experience to Italy. Work placements range from mosaics and ballet, hospitality and the possibility of getting work experience for top students in science who are also doing VET. The purpose of the programme is to show students what languages can do and the possibilities for work that exist globally.

Possible advantages and disadvantages of this model are listed below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Business Exchange Model</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Potential Advantages of the Model</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• This kind of programme can prove a great motivator for students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Opens students’ eyes to the possibility of international commerce, which in turn may assist in the development of an enterprise culture.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Has the potential to make language appear meaningful and relevant.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Can be credited to a range of subjects.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

LOTE-Oriented Work Experience Programmes
In addition to the international work experience programmes described above, two examples of work experience programmes operating in the Australian context also emerged from the interviews. One model operating at a system level has been developed by the Victorian Catholic Education Office with the express purpose of increasing student retention in LOTE in the post compulsory years of education. The other example described was initiated by a school.
Example:
The Principal at F Senior High School has worked hard to develop connections with local industries in the area. He also has a strong desire to promote the language programme in the school. The school is located in a tourist area, and the Principal has negotiated with local industries that cater for incoming tourist populations to take students on for structured work placements. The programme is proving to be extremely successful.

Example:
The Catholic Education Office has developed a programme whereby year 10 students participate in work experience placements which require them to make use of language and cultural skills. As a result of the programme students are expected to be able to:

1. Make some arrangement/s;
2. Interact with clients/colleagues;
3. Ask, give and follow directions;
4. Inquire and respond to expressions by others in the LOTE;
5. Use the telephone;
6. Comprehend a simple, short conversation in the LOTE;
7. Write a short dialogue, notes, message or narrative passage; and
8. Develop some cultural awareness.

The programme has proved to be extremely successful. 411 students have participated in the project between 1997 and 2002. A recent survey of 264 students indicated that 102 of these continued LOTE study to VCE (Almost 40% of students surveyed). Anecdotal evidence suggests that by opening the door to new pathways student interest in LOTE study increased.

Potential advantages and disadvantages perceived by the research team are described in the following table.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The LOTE-Oriented Work Experience Model</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Potential Advantages of the Model</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language skills are required to be used in real workplace settings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The language can be seen to be meaningful to students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students can see the applicability of foreign language skills in terms of careers within Australia.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The teacher does not need to make significant changes to the programme that they currently run.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In the way that it has been implemented by</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Potential Disadvantages of the Model</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students do not necessarily have their certification noted on the Secondary Education Certificate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students do not automatically receive credit towards their technical or further education.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There can be difficulty accessing appropriate work placements for students in relation to their area of vocational interest, and language knowledge.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is the potential to create a glut of</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
the Victorian CEO, there is a strong need for cooperation between the LOTE and VET coordinators.

- Students receive certification from a University, and can receive credit towards courses offered through the University.
- Vocational competencies are linked to LOTE competencies.

students in the marketplace.

- Without the appropriate system level support in place, it may be difficult for individual schools/LOTÉ teachers to access.

An Issue for Consideration - A Vocational Specific Approach versus a Generic Approach

A particular issue raised in relation to the different models of vocational language delivery, revolved around the benefits of a vocationally specific approach as opposed to a generic approach. In general it appeared that education representatives were in favour of the generic approach because it provided an easy administrative solution to what could possibly become an unwieldy structure. It also assisted in the development of national standards for vocational language.

By contrast, industry representatives were interested in language courses that would meet their specific needs. There was also considerable evidence to suggest that students would be more interested in participating in vocational language programmes if they could see a direct relevance to their future career path.
Section 5: Elements of a Successful LOTE-VET Programme

As part of the interview process, participants were asked to identify any programmes that linked LOTE and Vocational Education and Training, and what specifically made that programme successful. Some of the elements that were identified are outlined below under the following headings:

- Making language learning relevant to the student;
- Developing industry relevant programmes;
- Incorporating cultural understandings;
- Incorporation of grammatical concepts into communicative language learning;
- Developing links between LOTE and VET staff;
- A committed teacher;
- A profile within the school;
- Certification; and
- Linkage with other curriculum offerings.

Making Language Learning Relevant to the Student

A number of respondents highlighted that successful programmes were ones in which the language being learned was relevant to the learners. A NSW representative commented, any connection made with language and VET needs to connect outside the classroom.

According to an ITAB representative a successful programme dealt with living languages in a workplace context and relevant to students…they need to be able to see a use for it in their career. From her perspective, this was particularly important for people in careers who were undertaking language training. While this respondent was referring to language learning for people already embarked in their careers, similar sentiments were expressed by respondents in relation to work experience programmes and in-country exchange programmes for students, as both of these methods were seen to make language learning applicable in a career setting.

Two respondents saw the benefit of in-country exchange programmes as being a result of the fact that they made the language use relevant. Another described the success of a hospitality programme that incorporated Indonesian language use as being because
students were incorporating LOTE into a context that was really meaningful for them. They were taking it out of just a textbook exercise where they experience LOTE at a distance, and using it for a purpose in a real situation. This was seen to be particularly important for students who were not tertiary bound.

A teacher in South Australia who has incorporated the NAATI Diploma in Interpreting and Translating into his year 11 and 12 class, also described how he made the content of learning relevant to his learners by looking at health, education and social issues, and relating to these topics [and focusing on] how students can bring their own knowledge to the classroom, relate to what the students know.

**Functional Language**

Many respondents felt that successful vocational language programmes offered students the ability to develop functional language use, with the focus on communication. This was in line with industry needs. For example, one industry representative commented, *we need oral proficiency.* In this regard, the TAFE Applied Languages Certificate places a strong emphasis on oral communication.

**Industry Relevant**

Respondents, particularly from industry, stressed that programmes that successfully linked languages and vocational education would also be linked to industry needs. A respondent from Tourism Training Australia, for example described a successful programme as *industry relevant.*

The coordinator of a VET-Tourism programme also commented on how he had developed customised ‘taster’ courses as options for students in his programme. The courses were tailored specifically to meet the needs of the Tourism and Hospitality industry. A Board of Studies representative was also of the view that language structures changed across industries and that this should be taken into account in developing vocational language courses.

It is interesting to note, however, that two respondents interviewed place stress on the development of generic vocational language courses, as opposed to the development of vocationally or industry specific courses. Their thinking in this regard tended to emphasise the logistic and operational issues associated with coordinating a wide range of vocationally-specific courses. Nevertheless, it would be quite possible to develop a generic
language curriculum at a system level, and have individual teachers orient the programme towards different industries in the implementation of the curriculum.

**Incorporating Cultural Understandings**
The importance of linking cultural understandings into any vocational language course was highlighted by a number of respondents. One comment by a representative from an ITAB was, *you can’t separate culture from language*. A respondent from NSW also referred to the need for successful programmes to *emphasise intercultural understandings, as useful for anyone entering the workforce*. The Tasmanian VET-Tourism Coordinator interviewed, described how he had developed as a Core Module in his programme a subject called *Work in a Socially Diverse Environment*. The module was presented to provide an overview of a range of different cultures. The course focuses on differences between cultures.

The incorporation of cultural understandings as a key component of a vocational language course aligns with comments from industry which place emphasis on the utility of cultural knowledge.

**Development of Links Between LOTE and VET Staff**
*Good communication between the LOTE teacher and the VET teacher* was identified as one of the factors leading to the success of an vocational language programme by an SA Board of Studies representative.

One respondent outlined a programme in which Indonesian had been integrated into one aspect of a hospitality programme. This programme had developed as an initiative by two teachers who were interested in working together. In another example, a coordinator of a VET-Tourism programme who was interviewed described how he had worked with language staff in the school to design some A-level modules that were *tailored specifically for me*. A third example is the teacher in South Australia who had embedded the NAATI Professional Interpreting and Translating course into his year 11 and 12 classes who viewed the success of his programme as being due to the fact that he *worked closely with TAFE*, in respect of course design and assessment.

**A Committed Teacher**
A number of respondents saw that the key factor that would lead to the success of a vocationally oriented LOTE programme, was the commitment and perseverance of the teacher, or as one Board of Studies representative described it: *Lots of good will on the part*
of the teacher. The critical role played by the teacher was highlighted in descriptions of successful programmes. For example, one teacher who had designed an enterprise project for her students that involved developing brochures for tourists coming to the area was described as a real stormtrooper. The importance of the teacher was also evident both from discussions with teachers who had got vocationally oriented language programmes up and running in their schools, and with those who had not been able to.

Persistence emerged as a common theme, and a number of teachers who had managed to get LOTE-VET programmes up and running were those that battled their way through the bureaucracy, or really battled hard to achieve accreditation.

Another quality that was evident was the teacher’s ability to conceive and initiate a suitable programme. In each of the interviews with individual teachers undertaken through the consultation process, it was evident that it was the teacher who had been the sole driving force in instigating the links between languages and vocational education. The two South Australian language teachers had both conceived the idea themselves, and then negotiated individually with the TAFE institutions to try to develop appropriate structures for the programmes to operate. The Tasmanian VET coordinator interviewed was solely responsible for encouraging students to undertake languages as part of their VET-Tourism course.

A third quality that emerged was the teachers’ commitment to the cause. A Western Australian teacher who had incorporated the Applied Languages Certificates into secondary LOTE classes was described as a very enthusiastic exponent of VET in schools, while another was described as being passionate about this programme, and passionate about having more kids doing languages.

Profile in the School
Programmes that had a good profile in the school were considered more successful than those that did not. A South Australian respondent identified Hawker College’s exchange programme to Bangkok as an example of a successful programme linking LOTE and VET. In her view an important aspect underpinning this success was the fact that the programme had a strong base in the school. The representative from the Victorian Catholic Education Office saw that one of the things that made her programme a success was the fact that it had an effect on building the status of language at the school. For her, this was because it
was more than just the individual student involved in a project. This was evidenced by the fact that students begin to respect the LOTE teachers far more, it’s not just Japanese class, but Miss So and So’s class – like a ripple effect – changes slowly.

Certification
Two respondents identified certification as an important element of a successful LOTE-VET programme, as it recognised students’ work. One respondent commented: certification is important. It’s very important. It is interesting to note, that the work experience programme implemented by the Catholic Education Office Victoria, did not adequately meet her criteria for formal certification, despite the fact that students were in fact awarded three certificates on completion of the programme, one from the school indicating their participation, one from the Catholic Education Office, and one from the Victorian University of Technology, TAFE division, crediting their work towards any further TAFE Certificates undertaken by the student through the University. She compared this to the Applied Languages Certificate that could be undertaken in conjunction with other courses. Successful completion of the Applied Languages Certificate results in the TAFE Certificate being noted on the student’s Secondary Education Certificate, and is also nationally recognised. Nevertheless, she also perceived difficulties with this programme, as the credit that students received towards their technical and further education could only be applied to further study in the Applied Languages Certificates as, at the time, no Training Packages incorporated language competencies.

Ease of Fit with Other Curriculum Offerings
One respondent was of the view that a programme was more likely to be successful if it fits easily with other curriculum offerings and does not require extensive rearrangement. She was of the view that model of embedding the TAFE Applied Languages Certificate offered particular advantages because they did not require additional timetabling of different classes, or coordination between different staff members.

This issue was raised by two other respondents in relation to the inclusion of generic workplace competencies into LOTE programmes. The success of this kind of programme for them, was that there was no necessity to rearrange school structures and timetables, or to make any changes to the LOTE curriculum itself.
Section 6: Barriers to the Linking of LOTE and VET

Respondents identified a number of barriers that were currently preventing the effective linking of languages into the Vocational Education and Training context. Some of these barriers are operating at a system level, while others are affecting the implementation of vocational language programmes at a school-level. These are described below.

National Policy Barriers

Lack of Supportive Policy

Seven of the 34 respondents interviewed identified a lack of policy support at the national level as a key barrier to the linking of languages and Vocational Education and Training. This was seen to have resource implications, as well as an impact upon both educational and community attitudes and perceptions of the importance of languages in a vocational education context.

Some respondents were of the view that the lack of a systemic commitment to the teaching and learning of LOTE is the result of short-sightedness on the part of policy makers. Comments related to lack of funding, lack of vision, and we often seem to be reacting to what comes. For several respondents the cessation of NALSAS funding was just another indication of the Government’s lack of vision in this area.

Issues Associated with Implementation of Policy

The existence of policy will not, in itself, change the situation. The policy also needs to be effectively implemented at a national level. Two business council representatives identified the development of language programmes that could meet the needs of industry as an issue that needed to be addressed at a national level. They were, however, sceptical about the capacity for this to get done if left solely to government.

A Board of Studies representative referred specifically to the MCEETYA Adult LOTE and literacy sub-committee established in 1994 to strengthen the links between languages and vocational education at a technical and further education level. In her view, the sub-committee was doomed to failure:
If we go back to the history of it, each state set up LOTE and VET advisory group in 1994. Unfortunately, [the responsibility was] given to the wrong mob to run and it fell into a heap. Somebody set out and did the right thing, set up the structures, and it couldn’t be sustained. [They] handed it over to people who aren’t believers. Where is it on their performance indicators? What were they supposed to achieve and be accountable for?

Networking Barriers

Lack of Links Between Stakeholders

The lack of links between key stakeholders involved in languages and vocational education was identified as an issue by respondents. One Board of Studies representative commented:

Things have to be linked at all levels. We are not good at that. We create our own empire, but not the network for it to be linked strategically to wider agendas.

Two TAFE representatives in the languages area noted that they received little information from ANTA in relation to new policies and packages and were not consulted in relation to the development of the recent Training Package. One representative had concerns about the competency standards included in the Package and was concerned that there had been so little consultation. A Board of Studies representative also noted that the secondary education sector was not consulted in relation to the development of Applied Languages Certificate developed ACTRAC. She was of the view that increasing consultation in this regard could lead to the development of better products and programmes in the long run: Input into ACTRAC is highly important.

Barriers to Linking With Industry

In this regard, input from industry in relation to links between languages and vocational education was seen to be noticeably absent. A representative from the International Business Council commented that any demand for language skills or cultural knowledge in the job market is either very poorly transferred to the education system or there is a lack of transmission. Another Business Council representative noted that the links between industry and the education sector were not well defined. He noted further that links between the Australian education sector and international business were even less apparent. He did note that Curtin University was trying to establish some links through their international arm, but
questioned their effectiveness, stating that their success in establishing overseas industry links is measured in the number of coffee cups they have cleaned.

One Board of Studies representative had found in the past that there were difficulties obtaining industry input into languages in the secondary education context. He described how he had been part of a Subject Advisory Committee to oversee the development of the language syllabus. An industry representative was required to be involved in the Committee by legislation, but he rarely turned up… This had led him to the view that in languages [industry representation] doesn’t seem to count for anything.

The School-TAFE Interface

In some states the relationship between schools and the TAFE sector appears to pose a considerable barrier to the successful linking of languages and vocational education. In South Australia, for example, there was considered to be a monopoly on the delivery of LOTE in Vocational Education and Training by one of the TAFEs. This is a particular concern because under a 1989 agreement, schools are not allowed to deliver vocational education without the auspicing of a Registered Training Organisation such as a TAFE. This was considered to be highly problematic, particularly because there was a sense that the TAFE in question was not amenable to the concept of auspicing schools to deliver LOTE. A number of respondents were of the view that the TAFE regarded the cross-accreditation of VET as a threat, because if [they] have to give credit now, [the students] won’t come to us later. A TAFE representative from Western Australia, suggested by contrast that they regarded the incorporation of TAFE level Certification into secondary LOTE classes as a way of attracting people into their higher level Certificates, which they have traditionally had difficulty filling. A South Australian respondent commented, the man in charge doesn’t have enough clout. If he had more clout then we could show that we are starting a pathway and not closing off a pathway. One teacher of Japanese who was teaching across several schools in rural South Australia had managed to bypass this monopoly and was able to achieve TAFE accreditation for his students by being auspiced by another TAFE. The TAFE did not, apparently, offer any language programmes itself.

Funding Barriers

Funding arrangements at a systemic level were also identified as being a crucial factor in either facilitating or hindering the development of links between languages and Vocational Education and Training. This issue was raised specifically in the South Australian context.
where a 1989 Ministerial Agreement meant that funding for general education and for vocational education were kept quite separate.

The project team also interviewed a teacher from South Australia who had unsuccessfully attempted to collaborate with Adelaide TAFE in order to incorporate languages into a vocational education course for tourism. Although he was unaware of the actual funding arrangements, he was left with a strong impression that the TAFEs were not interested in such collaborative arrangements as it reduced their client base – *It could be seen as poaching…TAFEs are funded according to ‘bums on seats’.*

**Lack of Agreement about the Purpose of Vocational Language Programmes**

There appeared to be a general lack of agreement among stakeholders about what the aims of vocational language programmes should be. For example, the view was expressed by one education respondent that the outcome of vocationally oriented language programmes should not be language proficiency. Two other education respondents commented on the fact that the language proficiency of students is not necessarily high on completion of LOTE-VET courses. One respondent commented in relation to a Japanese for tourism program that students had very low-level language skills, but enough to work behind a desk at a hotel and greet people and make bookings for them.

By contrast, industry respondents were of the opinion that the current education system was not meeting their needs because school leavers were not obtaining requisite levels of proficiency in the language. The AFMLTA representative interviewed commented that the level of language proficiency had to be linked to the technical capacity of learners.

Negotiating a clear understanding of what the proficiency requirements and expectations are for different stakeholder groups, and possibly in relation to different industries would appear to be vital to address this current issue.

**Programme Barriers**

**Lack of Language Competencies in ANTA Training Packages**

A number of respondents saw a key barrier to the linking of LOTE and vocational education in secondary schools as a result of the fact that languages were not incorporated as a unit into any of the ANTA Training Packages at the technical and further education level. Once again, it is worth noting that while there is an Applied Languages Certificate, which is run
through the TAFE system, this does not have the status of a national Training Package which is approved by industry.

The importance of the Training Packages in relation to the secondary VET context appears to differ slightly in each state. In the ACT, for example, a course cannot be included in Vocational Education and Training delivery in the secondary context unless it is linked to a Training Package. In other states, the Training Packages appear to guide what will be included in the vocational education subjects in secondary schools. A VET coordinator from Tasmania was running a Hospitality and Tourism course that was based on the ANTA Training Package in this area. He had, however, gone beyond the Training Package to incorporate elective units in Japanese, French and Indonesian. Nevertheless, he noted that this was his own initiative and it would be unlikely to be taken up on a broader scale, until [languages are] put in core module or elective units in the Training Packages.

A second respondent from the ACT was of the view that now that languages had been included as an elective in the Tourism and Hospitality training packages, there was potential to overcome this barrier. She described how there had been an attempt in the ACT to develop a VET programme with a LOTE component, but now this had been placed in the too hard basket because there was no training package.

**Lack of Vocational Orientation in Language Syllabi**

One way of linking vocational education and languages is to incorporate a vocational orientation into an existing LOTE course. One respondent noted that there had been some attempt at the national level, through the Collaborative Curriculum and Assessment Framework for Languages, to incorporate some focus on vocational skills development. By contrast, three other respondents indicated that the syllabus they were required to teach had little or no application to vocational education, and therefore posed a barrier to the successful orienting of language programmes to incorporate a vocational focus.

A respondent from Qld regarded the existing syllabus as a limiting factor in terms of implementing LOTE and VET, because the syllabus was compulsory and did not contain any reference to LOTE and VET. A respondent from NSW commented similarly that the *themes and topics* [in the current syllabus] are very much youth oriented. A proportion of the syllabuses are about travelling holidays…aspects of cultural life in that language. In these cases, the student is the traveller, not the worker. When the same quote was put to another respondent from SA, their comment was *I don't think it’s 100% true, where VET courses are happening with a view to providing a service. Perhaps some students are interpreting it that*
way. But it really should be the recipient and the active doer. Similarly, when questioned, a WA representative indicated that the level to which the syllabus was regarded as prescriptive varied from state to state.

Teaching Barriers

**Reliance on Individual Teachers**

It is evident from the interviews that most of the vocational language programmes that have been implemented in Australia have been dependent on individual teachers as there have been no state or system level mechanisms to support them. The result of this is that teachers who are already feeling overworked, will not necessarily be able to find the time to implement such a programme.

A WA respondent commented on workload issues for teachers who were interested in combining TAFE Certification programmes into their TEE LOTE courses. She noted that it was important for teachers to be supported so they can work smarter, rather than harder. She referred particularly to the need to modify assessment items so they could be used for both types of assessment, and getting brighter kids to help other students in the class. Interestingly, even a Qantas representative commented that language teachers should be paid more and supported more so that they can actually do the job.

**Shortage of Good Teachers**

The issue of a shortage of good language teachers was raised by two respondents, both of whom were from Queensland.

**The Aging Teaching Population**

This issue was also alluded to by another respondent who commented on the aging teacher population. She noted that current policies meant that the system would pick up new graduates as contracts for many years. Without security of tenure she couldn’t see why younger teachers would stay. This was seen to present difficulties for teachers in terms of coming to grips with the fact that what worked for the post industrial era, won’t work for the knowledge era: policies, procedures, attitudes. The younger teachers who do take on the new ideas and attitudes were often seen to burn out.
Declining Status of LOTE Teachers

A specific issue that was raised was in relation to the decline in the status of LOTE as a learning area, as a result of the cessation of NALSAS funding. One respondent was of the view that this would have a negative impact on the status of LOTE teachers within schools, and thought that linking with other learning areas might be more of a threat than an opportunity:

Burnout of VET Coordinators

One respondent commented that VET Coordinators in schools are in a difficult position. She noted that: 

It is unlikely that a VET coordinator who is overworked and overwhelmed would feel inclined to assist with the development of links between languages and vocational education.

Barriers for Schools in Taking Up Vocational Language Programmes

Attitudinal Barriers

A key barrier to the implementation of vocational language programmes by schools is the perception among some educators that LOTE and VET are very separate learning areas. The attitude was particularly noticeable at a departmental administration level, and was a cause of much delay in terms of arranging interviews with representatives from the various education departments. An education department representative made the statement: It's an interesting request, LOTE and VET. You don’t really think of them as being connected. Still if you want to look at them…. 

The perception of difference appears to stem from an underlying historical presupposition that LOTE is for ‘academic’ kids while VET is for ‘non-academic’ kids. Another respondent commented that not everyone regarded VET as a good thing. In her view, a lot of LOTE teachers did not see the point of including VET in language programmes or vice versa.

These perceptions seem to have fed a general mistrust between educators in the two learning areas. Three respondents saw the attitudes of VET coordinators and staff towards languages as a particular barrier to the incorporation of LOTE and VET. One respondent referred to what she regarded as revisionist thinking on the part of VET personnel in relation to LOTE. Another stated: I think a lot of VET coordinators in schools come from old Tech Studies background and further enhance that view. It would appear, however, that there might also be room for improving the attitudes of LOTE teachers towards the VET
option in schools. A LOTE representative from one of the state/territory Board of Studies was implicitly patronising about the VET option: *You get a little VET Certificate which mentions which little modules you did and were successful at.* Another LOTE representative commented that there was a view of VET as a *poor man’s subject.*

**Lack of Information about Programmes**

Three respondents interviewed considered that a key barrier to the implementation of vocational language programmes was the lack of information about the programmes. One Board of Studies representative commented in relation to the development of cross-competencies in languages and vocational education, *it’s not very well known at all.* This raises a particular issue about how such programmes get promoted.

An ITAB representative made a similar point, identifying the issue as *lack of knowledge in most people’s minds.* In her view, many industry people and others associated with Vocational Education and Training did not have *enough experience of language [to] know how to fit languages in with VET.* She commented further, *If you talk to industry they know what they want, but they don’t know how it fits in.*

**Structural Issues Within Schools**

Several respondents identified school structure as a major issue for the effective linking of languages and vocational education. Two respondents raised concerns about the issues associated with timetabling and planning of classes. Two other respondents raised the issue of the cramped curriculum, and the difficulties associated with trying to insert a new programme into an existing school timetable.

Another structural issue raised by two education representatives was the difficulty attracting large enough classes to run stand-alone LOTE-VET classes, that were not combined with more traditional tertiary-oriented LOTE classes. Similar comments from two other respondents referred to the difficulties faced by language teachers in trying to tailor their courses to mixed-level classes. On the same issue, another respondent indicated that embedding the Applied Languages Certificates into tertiary-oriented LOTE programmes within the same class structure, offered the most viable way of offering year 11 and 12 language classes. This was because the Certificates appealed to students who wanted to learn languages, but did not want to have their grade credited towards their Tertiary Entrance Score, and therefore attracted more students. Further, by embedding the classes, the problem of dividing the student cohort into two separate classes was avoided. Another
respondent noted that there was no hard evidence to prove that if courses like that were offered, then more kids would take it. But it’s hard to say how, because we can’t offer it, we can’t prove it.

**Practicalities Involved with Implementing Vocational Language Programmes**

A number of practical and logistical barriers were raised in relation to the implementation of vocational language programmes. As an AFMLTA representative commented:

*The problem with VET is precisely that – the cost, the organisational problems that arise, the actual slotting it into a school timetable and staffing structure.*

A number of practicalities were raised specifically in relation to implementing the Applied Languages Certificates in secondary school language classes. One issue raised was the number of people that had to be involved to ensure that the Certificates were properly coordinated and accredited. This process involves the language teacher and VET coordinator in the school liaising with both the auspicing TAFE institution and the Board of Studies within the school. Three respondents from Western Australia referred to difficulties faced by language teachers trying to coordinate this process. One commented that teachers were really frustrated at all the lines of communication and contact they have to go through to make it happen. A Board of Studies representative commented on the lack of a streamlined set of procedures firstly, so that teachers are a bit put off. (It goes into the] too hard basket. Another respondent noticed that teachers were having difficulties, firstly locating the VET coordinator within the school, and secondly negotiating with them. She stated, the language teacher has to deal through the VET coordinator. There are too many channels at which it gets too hard for people. The example was given of one LOTE teacher, who had been teaching her students the TAFE curriculum for a year, only to find that the VET coordinator had not enrolled students properly and so the students would not get recognised for the work they had done.

**Funding Barriers**

A second practicality that was raised by respondents specifically in relation to undertaking vocational language programmes was the issue of finding the necessary funding to enable the programme to be auspiced by an RTO. The current cost of auspicing is approximately $600. For example, a South Australian respondent commented in relation to offering TAFE certification through school vocational education, that in terms of a curriculum offering, it is
expensive. Another education representative commented that she had been approached by two schools asking for money to implement the programme. She noted that *this was a real stumbling block to the school*. In both cases, she provided the schools with grant money to proceed.

**RTO Requirements**

There is a general confusion about what schools and teachers need to do to comply with RTO requirements. It would appear that the school needs to be registered as an RTO in order to run Vocational Education and Training programmes, for which there is a cost and, as one respondent noted, an *enormous set of procedures*. Many schools are already registered, and it may just be a matter of extending the scope of registration to cover languages. This information, however, does not appear to be readily available to schools.

In addition, there is a perception among some respondents that the LOTE teacher needs to have a Certificate IV in Workplace Training and Assessment. This does not appear to be the case, at the moment. However, this does seem to be unusual in relation to other learning areas, which do require teachers to have a have Certificate IV in Workplace Assessment. This is not the case for LOTE teachers in some states who are qualified to teach TAFE Level Language Courses by virtue of their training. Nevertheless, this does not appear to be common knowledge. For example, one VET representative from an Australian Curriculum and Assessment Authority was unaware that LOTE teachers were exempted from this requirement. The perception that LOTE teachers will have to undertake further training was cited as a factor that hampered the incorporation of TAFE Certificates into the LOTE classroom. For example, a LOTE teacher in South Australia regarded the fact that the Workplace Assessor Certification ran out after three years as a difficulty for him. He had undertaken the Certification in 1997 in order to implement a LOTE-VET programme, but had not been successful in doing so. His certification had run out: *I have to do it again, but there is no incentive. Why bang my head against a brick wall?* In addition, there is some suggestion that LOTE teachers may have to undertake this training in the future.

**Practicalities in Relation to Work Experience Programmes**

There appears to be a general lack of information available to educators about the work experience requirements of VET programmes. One respondent commented that even though work place experience was not a formal requirement of the Applied Languages Certificates at the moment, it may become any issue in the future. Nevertheless, she was of the opinion that linking with the work place is ultimately *what a lot of it is about* in terms of
developing effective vocational language programmes that would be appealing to students. She saw that this presented a logistical issue for schools and teachers.

**Pedagogical Barriers**

Another barrier to the linking of languages and Vocational Education and Training is the need to introduce a new assessment model into the language class. TAFE courses are assessed according to Competencies. This is different from the way in which secondary courses are assessed for tertiary entrance.

A number of respondents also expressed their concern about the competency-based assessment used in the Vocational Education and Training sector. It was considered to be unfortunate because schools were being forced to adopt the TAFE competency framework, without being asked for any input from TAFE. A South Australian respondent commented, that the Vocational Education and Training context adopts very much a functional view of languages – low-order task oriented. This was seen not to reflect developments in language curriculum and assessment at secondary school level. There was seen to be a mismatch of aligning VET outcomes with the current expectations of SACE.

**Barriers to Student Uptake of Vocational Language Programmes**

**Community Attitudes**

A number of LOTE representatives interviewed commented on a general bias against languages both in the community and in the education sector. This was seen to be a particular barrier to the uptake of vocational language programmes by students in the post-compulsory years of schooling.

**Languages not Seen as Relevant or Interesting**

A number of respondents indicated that a barrier to student uptake of vocational language programmes related to the way languages were being taught in the early years of schooling.

According to one VET representative: *In a lot of cases year 7 or 8 classes are just Mickey Mouse – map of Japan, class party, basic counting…generally they dislike it.* This type of programme, in which there was continuous, but not cumulative learning for students, has the potential to turn students off further language study.
**Which Language?**

Another barrier faced by schools in attracting students to language programmes is the decision about which language to teach. One Board of Studies representative noted that different languages appeared to wax and wane in terms of popularity. This issue was echoed by another Board of Studies representative in the ACT, who was of the view that industry could not be relied upon to provide guidance in this regard.

**Compulsory Languages**

Only one respondent, a VET representative, referred to the issue of mandating languages for particular vocational courses. He was of the view that this would not be a good idea, as it may have the effect of turning students off the language component of the course.
Section 7: Factors Facilitating the Uptake and Delivery of Vocational Language Programmes in Secondary Schools

Through the course of the interviews, respondents identified a number of factors that could be seen to facilitate the linking of languages and vocational education. In addition, they also described possible opportunities that could be built upon to further develop links between languages and vocational education.

Factors Facilitating the Uptake and Delivery of Vocational Language Programmes by Educators

From the consultation process it was possible to identify a number of factors that could be seen to facilitate the uptake of vocational language programmes by educators. These include:

- The existence of supportive policy;
- Structures for accountability;
- Industry support;
- The existence of programmes that link languages and Vocational Education and Training;
- Information about different programmes and how to implement them;
- Mechanisms to facilitate access to programmes;
- Resources and support to facilitate the implementation of programmes;
- Existence of links between key stakeholders; and
- Teachers who are prepared to implement the programmes.

The Existence of Supportive Policy

In line with comments from the previous section, which regarded the lack of supportive policy as a barrier to the effective implementation of vocational language programmes, a number of respondents felt that a supportive policy structure that promoted connections between languages and vocational education would facilitate the uptake of such programmes at a school level. In this regard, one respondent referred to the need for a national push. Another commented on the importance of official recognition for any vocational language programmes that were developed. Yet another argued that it was important for the Government to work out what is in the national interest and push that.
Structures for Accountability

One respondent raised a very important point that, in relation to the effective implementation of policy, there need to be appropriate structures put in place for performance measurement and accountability. She noted that the MCEETYA Adult LOTE and Literacy Sub-Committee had the right strategy in place, but that the issue was about the way in which the policy was implemented.

Industry Support

The existence of industry support was mentioned by some stakeholders as an important aspect that would facilitate the linking of languages and vocational education in schools. In this regard, it is evident that a key factor that has facilitated the development of language-oriented work experience programmes has been the development of links with industry bodies at either a school level or a system level. In this context, the industry support was seen to be important in changing educators’ attitudes about how relevant and useful vocational language programmes can be for students in terms of their future prospects.

The Existence of Packages, Programmes and Pathways

Responses to the interviews often touched on the need for vocational language packages and pathways that can be implemented and accessed by teachers. Respondents referred particularly to the inclusion of languages in the ANTA Training Packages and, more generally, to the incorporation of vocational content in the secondary LOTE syllabus.

It is evident from the interviews that the inclusion of units of language competency into the ANTA National Training Packages would facilitate the inclusion of languages in Vocational Education and Training in the secondary context. As discussed in the previous section this is because the ANTA Training Packages inform the content of Vocational Education and Training delivery in secondary schools in most states and territories. A coordinator of a VET-Tourism programme argued, that for vocational language programmes to work, the direction needs to come from those preparing the national guidelines...People who are preparing the national Training Packages. He noted that all VET coordinators in schools had to follow the national guidelines, and that it would be the inclusion of languages as either a core module, or an optional module within the packages that would make the difference to the linking of languages and vocational education at a secondary level.

This view was also held by an education representative from the ACT who saw the recent inclusion of languages into the Tourism and Hospitality Training Package as an opportunity
to increase the links between languages and vocational education. Similarly, a number of other respondents referred to the need for greater connections to careers in the general language syllabus, and the need to focus on the student as the service-provider not the traveller. Some of the issues around this are elaborated in the previous section.

An AFMLTA representative, in her discussion about the different kinds of programmes and models that are available in terms of linking languages into vocational education, made the statement that: what you really need is a good model that will work…I think that by getting good stuff working…it will build its own momentum. I’m quite convinced of that. This view was shared by a Board of Studies representative, who felt that if there was something to link into at the VET side, I think teachers would jump on the bandwagon. The AFMLTA representative was of the view that Australia now had the beginnings of such a model, in terms of the Applied Languages Certificates.

**Information about Programmes**

Several respondents cited the need for teachers to be made more aware of the fact that it was possible for teachers to link languages and vocational education, and to provide them with information about how they could do that. Another identified a need for the development of packages to address the current information gaps. Specifically, she thought information should be available about standards, assessment criteria [and] qualified assessors in relation to languages and vocational education. A second Board of Studies representative suggested that there was the potential to capitalise on the Modern Language Teachers’ Associations to promote awareness of possible programmes and links.

The need to raise awareness among school VET coordinators about the possibilities of incorporating LOTE and VET was raised by three people in the Western Australian context, who cited several instances where LOTE teachers had approached their VET coordinators only to be told that it was not possible. It was also seen to be important to make both language teachers and VET coordinators aware of the fact that there were no additional training requirements for language teachers wanting to teach VET courses.

In addition to general practical information about what is required to implement different vocational language models, other respondents also identified the utility of having case-studies of programmes that have been successful. A New South Wales education representative thought that providing teachers with information about anything [that had
been] designed [and the] components that would contribute to success, would facilitate the uptake of vocational language programmes in schools. In this regard, a Victorian representative explained that this had not yet been done in relation to the Applied Languages Certificate because the model was still new in the state, and they were waiting to find out how successful it would be in the school context. Another education department representative argued that it would be useful to model how teachers could have discussions with their students about vocations so that the teachers can develop a meta-awareness of the possibilities.

Two respondents felt that models from the tertiary sector could be drawn on in this regard. For example they noted that the Engineering and Business course offered at the University of South Australia required students to travel to Indonesia for three months. They also noted that in Singapore and Malaysia, students studying finance go to Germany for the same reason. They also argued that Unis here have really pushed themselves forward in allowing people to do a degree, continue languages at the same time, get their diploma in languages at the end of a sausage machine. In their view, the tertiary sector is doing the right thing. The School to TAFE interface is the block.

Other respondents referred to the utility of finding out what was going on in other countries, and building upon their initiatives. For example one Tasmanian representative remarked, I guess we would need to be much more aware of what other countries are doing to develop people with those strengths.

A Board of Studies representative did warn, however, against putting all [our] eggs into the European basket...Hard to find comparable models; never matches up. She was of the view that the context in Europe and Australia were so different that programmes implemented there may not be transferable to the Australian context. She was also of the view that the Europeans had adopted a strongly ‘functional’ view of language in vocational education programmes, which might not be the best model to adopt.

**A Strong Rationale for Vocational Language Programmes**

Having a really good rationale for any policy, strategy or programmes adopted in relation to vocational language programmes was also identified as an issue by some respondents. One VET representative warned, for example, that communication on its own was not sufficient. Similarly, a Board of Studies representative referred to the importance of proving
that there is a need for LOTE and VET to be incorporated. This was echoed by another teacher who argued for convincing evidence of why this [the linking of language and Vocational Education and Training] is important. In her view, if language teachers and vocational education teachers could be persuaded of the importance of such programmes, they would take it on: regardless of how far down the evolutionary path some teachers may be, they have the best interests of the kids at heart. To prove this need a third respondent argued for the importance of conducting feasibility studies to identify what the needs were both in the community and in industry.

**Links Between Key Stakeholder Groups**

In order to further facilitate the take up of vocational language programmes by schools, three respondents referred to the need to develop greater links between organisations that have an interest in languages and vocational education. A Board of Studies representative noted that there was a tendency at the moment for different groups and organisations to be doing things in this area, without necessarily making any connections to one another. She considered that the linking was crucial, for teachers particularly, in order for teachers to be presented with a coordinated approach and consistent information. She noted, as an example, that she had inadvertently come across a colleague who was attending a conference about Vocational Education and Training, and only through that chance meeting had managed to get an invitation to that conference. A New South Wales education representative also felt that there was a need for some kind of dialogue between educators on this subject. She stated, we need a mechanism for talking to happen.

In her view, there was no need to necessarily create a new forum or committee. Rather, she suggested it might be more appropriate to look at the forums that do currently exist and build on those. She also indicated that specific professional development programmes for teachers would be required to facilitate the implementation of vocational language programmes at a school level. In Western Australia, the MLTAWA, Curriculum Council and Perth Central TAFE have already come together to deliver professional development programmes of this nature in relation to the Applied Languages Certificates. The seminars appear to have achieved three aims:

- They increased teachers’ awareness of the Applied Languages Certificates option;
- They gave teachers an opportunity to explore the possibilities; and
- They provided teachers with a forum for sharing experiences in relation to linking of languages and vocational education.
Practical links between languages and vocational education at a school level appear also to be facilitated by the development of strong links between languages and Vocational Education and Training within the educational authorities. For example, in the WA Department of Education, the LOTE and VET learning areas now fall under the same directorate, which appears to have led to greater connections between the two areas. In the New South Wales Department of Education and Training, the VET in Schools Directorate approached the languages section directly for input into an initiative to embed generic workplace competencies in each learning area.

As discussed in the previous section, the nature of the links between the secondary education authorities and the technical and further education sector can also have the impact of facilitating the development of links between languages and vocational education at a school level. This can be seen in the Western Australian context where the Board of Studies, the TAFE and a teacher professional association are working together for the same goal.

**Mechanisms to Facilitate the Implementation of Programmes**

Two respondents referred to the need for appropriate mechanisms to be in place to facilitate the implementation of programmes in schools. Such mechanisms included information and procedures about who to contact, where to go to access information, who to inform that you are undertaking such a program and how to organise credit for the programme.

Another Board of Studies representative suggested that, in her jurisdiction, it would be useful to develop a *flowchart of procedures* for teachers to follow, particularly in relation to the implementation of the Applied Languages Certificates as there were so many parties that needed to be involved in the implementation and credit arrangements for such a set up.

It was also evident that such mechanisms would be most appropriately set up by the educational jurisdictions, rather than by individual schools. In this regard, there appears to be a difference between the mechanisms in place in South Australia and those in Western Australia to facilitate the incorporation of vocational education programmes at a secondary school level, whereby the school is responsible for negotiating with the TAFEs without system level support. The Western Australian set up appears to be more effective and more user-friendly. In this situation it has been the Board of Studies and the Central TAFE that
have negotiated arrangements at a system level, and schools can approach either of these bodies in order to embed such programmes in their schools.

**Resourcing and Support**

Another factor which was seen by respondents to be vital in facilitating the take up of languages and vocational education programme was the existence of appropriate resources and support. In this regard, one respondent commented that lack of resourcing or support for any initiatives in this area would ensure the initiative failed. A teacher from the ACT also commented on infrastructure needs and the importance of teacher training, and structures for linking education with industry in order to ensure that the competencies are current.

The first respondent outlined some of the questions that, in her view, needed to be considered by policy makers in setting up a strategy to link languages into vocational education. These included such things as:

- What are the considerations? What are good things we can build upon?
- What doing already? How will it be administrated in schools? Who keeps the database? On-line? Video accessible?

**Teachers to Implement the Programmes**

The critical role of the teacher in designing, developing and implementing vocational language programmes cannot be downplayed. It is often one or two teachers in a school who will be solely responsible for such programmes, and having good teachers who are committed to, and passionate about, their programmes is a key facilitating factor in the uptake of vocational language programmes at a secondary school level. A Board of Studies representative suggested that there was potential to further promote the benefits of linking languages and vocational education to teachers in order to develop, what she referred to as *a new generation: hearts and minds*. In keeping with this, another respondent commented on the value providing pre-service teachers with information about VET and what it is possible to do in terms of linking LOTE and VET.

Two respondents identified some specific characteristics of the current contingent of language teachers in relation to teachers of other learning areas, that they felt enhanced the potential to implement new initiatives in the area of vocational language learning. One Board of Studies representative in the ACT commented that she had found that language teachers appeared to have very strong consensus in terms of standards. A Board of Studies representative from Tasmania was of the view that because of the training that
language teachers had undergone as a result of the NALSAS Strategy, they were very much aware of the need to change, and so had been more amenable to the introduction of the generic workplace competencies into their learning area than teachers from other learning areas had been.

Factors Facilitating the Uptake of Vocational Language Programmes by Students

A number of factors came through in the interviews which could be seen to facilitate the uptake of vocational language programmes by students. These factors are discussed under the following headings:

- Programmes that are relevant to learners’ needs;
- The promotion of benefits to learners;
- Making connections outside the classroom;
- Making links to employability skills;
- Making languages interesting to students;
- Appropriate credit and certification; and
- Clear pathways.

Programmes that are Relevant to Learners’ Needs

The key factor that was seen to facilitate the uptake of vocational language programmes by secondary school students was the perception that it was relevant to their needs. A VET representative commented on the need to develop more awareness among learners of how languages can be useful in a Vocational Education and Training context – *Kids want to know what the use is of doing LOTE within their VET programme. What opportunities does it open up for them?* A Board of Studies representative commented in a similar vein: *Kids want to see relevance [that it’s] going to get them somewhere…*

In this regard, a VET coordinator explained that it was important that students needed to be able to connect the programme directly to their vocational training. Another respondent suggested that vocational language programmes may be perceived to be more relevant to the needs of individual students if a differentiated curriculum could be developed.
Promotion of the Benefits

A substantial number of comments from respondents alluded to the importance of promoting the benefits of vocational language programmes to students so that they could see the benefits, particularly in terms of their future employment prospects. For example, a South Australian teacher commented that to increase uptake in vocational language programmes it was important to give students a chance to see the implication of the language at work.

In this regard, the coordinator of a VET-Tourism programme noted that students in his programme have no hesitation doing the vocational language classes. *It comes from my push. Kids can see the relevance.* A third respondent thought that for students to see the benefits of vocational language use, it might be important to make them aware of the possibilities of integrating LOTE with other discipline areas, such as Engineering in China or Indonesia.

One respondent argued that in order for students to take on board the potential benefits of undertaking a vocational language programme, there needed to be *more of a push wider in society: The idea of Australia being part of a globalised world – What’s going to be good? What will help your kids get on in life?* This perspective was reinforced by another Board of Studies representative who thought that students would be more interested in studying vocational languages if there were some incentive from the Federal Government saying if you want to do this job, you need a language to go with it. From a slightly different perspective, another respondent commented that the benefits need to be promoted at a school level, not just a national level, as it is what kids see in action that influences them, not just what they hear. Two respondents warned against drawing *too long a bow* in terms of the benefits between linking LOTE and VET, especially if it was unlikely that the benefits would be delivered. A Western Australian representative was of the view that a vocational focus of some sort was required even in the early years of language learning.

Industry support also emerged as an important element in promoting the importance and relevance of vocational language skills to students.

Making Connections Outside the Classroom

A New South Wales representative argued that LOTE and VET need to connect outside the classroom. One strategy for doing this is presenting students with case-studies and models of real life people. Someone putting their language learning skills from the classroom into
use in a vocational context... ‘In the flesh’ evidence is more of a motivator than something classroom-based. Another strategy identified was to highlight to students employment opportunities for people with language skills that are advertised in the Australian newspapers.

Another offered we see if one of the banks has an application for employment jobs, ‘What language do you speak?’ push it … to make kids see that languages actually are useful. Using job applications to promote employment opportunities for people with language skills is a strategy that was adopted by the MLTASA in their package Talking your way into Languages.

Work placement programmes, such as the one developed by the Catholic Education Commission of Victoria, were seen to be very successful in making links between language and the workforce. International exchange programmes were also seen to have this potential. One Board of Studies representative noted that programmes where people do actually go to the home country of the language [are] a nice way of linking [languages outside the classroom]. Encouraging that would be nice. Two other respondents saw a strong case for international exchange programmes that incorporated some kind of work experience placement for students, as a way of both making the language seem relevant to their career, and also expanding their vision to incorporate global employment opportunities.

Another way of connecting outside the classroom was by making links between the language programme and the local community in order to enhance the relevance of the programme to the students.

**Make Links to Employability Skills**

Two respondents also held the view that students might be encouraged to take up vocational language programmes if they could see the general employment skills that they could gain from such a programme. For this strategy to be effective, another respondent felt that the language competencies would need to be integrated into vocational education structures, for example, if it were included on the new employability skills. It was her understanding that cultural knowledge was already included on the employability skills criteria.

**Make Languages Interesting to Students**

Respondents also referred to the importance of making language study interesting to students. Two respondents were of the view that a way of doing this was to capitalise on the use of information technology into vocational language programmes.
Credit and Certification

According to respondents, students are motivated to undertake vocational language courses if they will receive appropriate certification for it. There was also a suggestion that students were particularly receptive to the possibility of receiving TAFE Level Certification on completion of their secondary schooling, which is then recorded on their Secondary Education Certificate. A VET representative commented that, in relation to a recently introduced Retailing course (with no LOTE component), one of the things that generated success was students exiting with separate credentials, separate qualifications. A second commented similarly, ideally kids who were doing language courses at secondary school automatically gained TAFE Certification. This can be achieved through the incorporation of the Applied Languages Certificates into the secondary language classes. In this regard, the AFMLTA representative suggested that the main problem with the Victorian Catholic Education Commission work placement program was the fact that students did not receive a full TAFE Certificate on completion of the project, but only credit towards its completion.

Respondents also commented on the importance of receiving credit towards their VET programmes both in terms of VET in a secondary context and in relation to their technical and further education. In this regard, a VET coordinator argued that it was important to have LOTE courses as optional units of study which count toward the completion of the VET programme, [so they get] recognition for their VET programme. At the time of the interviews, the new Tourism and Hospitality National Training Package was not yet in place, and he felt there was no incentive for students to either continue with their language, or to take up a new language.

The importance of having transferable credit was raised by the AFMLTA respondent who noted that as none of the national Training Packages included language competencies, the credit received from undertaking the Applied Languages Certificates was worth little as it could not be transferred to industry-endorsed Training Packages. Once again, it is worth noting that this situation may have changed with the introduction of the language competencies in the Tourism and Hospitality Training Package.

Industry support and recognition of national qualifications in vocational languages was seen to be important. Similarly, the need for certification structures that are both recognised and understandable to industry. The AFMLTA representative suggested that one way of addressing this issue was to develop descriptors of what can be achieved in the language.
Another way that she saw was to come up with set of desirable outcomes, and for students to be aware and be able to articulate what their outcomes are.

Clear Pathways

Linked to the issue of certification and credit is the notion of the learning pathway. One respondent felt that it was important to make students aware of the advantages of being involved in a vocational language programme, not just in terms of a pathway to technical and further education, but also in terms of a tertiary pathway. A Board of Studies representative from Queensland commented on this, particularly with the push of varying pathways for kids, whether senior constitutes 11 or 12 or 10-12, [students need] a multitude of pathways that will take them into tertiary, traineeships, internships, and a smorgasbord of possibilities that kids could do. He was of the opinion that there might be something to be learned in this regard from Queensland, which according to him, is the state in the country that has VET more embedded than anywhere else.

Factors Facilitating Links Between Key Stakeholders

The importance of creating links between key stakeholders with an interest in languages and vocational education emerged as a specific factor that would facilitate the development of vocational language programmes in the secondary education context. In particular, respondents referred to the need to create links between the following stakeholder groups:

- Education authorities;
- ANTA;
- Technical and further education institutions;
- Industry Training Advisory Boards;
- Business Councils; and
- Relevant industry bodies.

Some of the key themes relating to the development of links between these bodies are outlined below under the following headings:

- Mutual benefits;
- Meeting industry needs;
- National standards;
• Structures to facilitate liaison
• Linking with strategic priorities; and
• Developing mutually acceptable strategies.

**Mutual Benefit**

The concept of mutual benefit was a factor that was mentioned by a number of respondents. For a number of South Australian respondents, this was seen to be particularly important in terms of developing links between the secondary education sector and the technical and further education sector. There was a perception among education respondents that the TAFEs could not see any benefit in offering vocational language programmes through the secondary school structure.

A number of industry respondents also emphasised the need for a perceivable benefit for industry in the process. In this regard, they stressed the importance of the education system specifically addressing industry/company needs. It is apparent that at least some parts of Australian industry know exactly what their needs are, and are prepared to liaise with the education system to work out a way of addressing these needs, if they can see a benefit in doing so.

**Meeting Industry Needs**

The interviews with industry suggest that industry bodies would be more likely to be involved in discussions with the education and training sector on this issue, if they can see that it will meet their needs. For example, the Qantas representatives said, in relation to their own training programmes, that the decision to pay for language training was operationally and financially driven. Similarly, a Japanese representative noted that companies would be more interested in providing training programmes if there were *clear concrete skills that the employer would like to see improved*.

However, it is also apparent from the small number of interviews done, that different industries, and different companies within these industries, have different needs. This may be in terms of the types of language used in the industry, for example, a Japanese businessman noted that *business communication* has a big *technical word* component that is *industry dependent*.
The level of proficiency required in different macro-skills also varies across industries and companies. From the interviews conducted, it was apparent that Qantas had a need for a high level of oral proficiency (ranging from good conversation fluency through to native standard fluency) for its employees. They were not interested in grammatical or theoretical knowledge. Rio Tinto was interested in employing people who are fluent in both written and spoken Asian language. The Business Council representatives were of the view that business people in Asia would benefit most from native-level proficiency in the language, but would also find benefit in having some limited language skills for the social setting that could facilitate the development of business relationships. The Japanese businessman was of the opinion that without extensive experience in Japanese culture and language, taking into account historical and contextual information, Australian business people would be better to use English in business situations, because then they would not run the risk of offending Japanese business people.

For this reason, the secondary education sector would need to put in place some processes to find out what the needs of different industries are. They would also need to be clear about what they could provide in terms of meeting those needs. It may be that different companies and industries would be prepared to support a process that went some way to meeting their needs, so that the cost involved in company training programmes was reduced.

In this regard, the AFMLTA representative was of the view that it was important that education not to be seen to be telling industry about the importance of LOTE, presenting them with pre-conceived solutions, or commencing negotiations with pre-conceived value sets. She saw the negotiation process as a balance between what the marketplace wants and what the educational value is.

A National Standard

A specific need identified by Qantas representatives was the development of a National Standard in languages. They noted that they were not able to use the education standard as a reliable language competency measurement as language competency varies a lot from language to language. For example if a person has a year 12 pass in German or some other Anglo Saxon language then they are usually fluent, however a university language qualification is required if the language is Japanese. In there view what was really needed was a universally transferable standard of language education.
**Structures in Place to Facilitate Liaison**

Industry representatives were also of the view that there were some existing structures that could be taken advantage of in order to increase the development of links between different stakeholders. The business councils, in particular, considered that they had a role in facilitating links between education and training and industry bodies. One representative from the International and Australian Business Council commented that *educators should be liasing with [the] Business Councils and Chambers of Commerce on an ongoing basis.*

He mentioned further that his Business Council was already in the process of *developing links* between industry and education sectors. Another business council representative suggested that the Industry Advisory Councils could play a role in this regard.

**Linking to Strategic Priorities**

One way of facilitating links between the education sector and industry may be to link in with their strategic policies and directions. For example, the Qantas representative interviewed commented that the organisation was about to reintroduce a policy of employing people with appropriate levels of language skills. Given that this is a strategic priority for them, they are likely to be more amenable than other companies to participate in this kind of process. By contrast, the respondent from Rio Tinto commented that their company did not fund training programmes for employees.

In this regard, specific companies to target in terms of developing networks with industry may be companies who already have language or cultural training programmes in place. This is because these Industry bodies are already paying for in-house training and can see a benefit in doing so.

**Mutually Acceptable Strategies**

Another factor that would facilitate the development of links between industry and the education and training sector would be through the introduction of strategies that were perceived by all parties to be effective in terms of achieving the desired outcomes. Interestingly, three of the five business representatives interviewed were of the opinion that that the best strategy for developing language and cultural skills was in-country experience. The Qantas representatives were of the view that students of European language, with year 12 language skills, would only require *a one month-long consolidated structured school excursion to gain* the type of fluency they require. The representative from the Mitsui company also regarded exchange programmes as the most effective way of developing the
requisite linguistic and cultural knowledge. He noted, that if Australia wants to do business in Japan then the *Australian education system should send students to Japan, to meet our demand they should go on exchange programs for 1 to 2 years.*
Part 3: Conclusions and Recommendations

Silo Thinking Versus Strategic Outcomes

The consultants' analysis of the consultation data focused on the different perceptions held by different categories of respondents. Respondents from within the secondary education sector had a relatively homogenous perception of the issues, which was different from TAFE and industry perceptions. TAFE and industry perceptions, while internally consistent, differed from each other and from secondary respondents. This analysis suggested that perceptions of each group were shaped by their individual contexts, and that people within each group tended to look 'inward', that is, conforming to the structures, rules and culture of their systems. This has sometimes been called a 'siloing' effect, illustrated in the diagram below:

Thinking in silos

Those people who were linking, or wanting to link, languages and vocational education, appeared to be able to see outside the silos. It could be said that they had developed an 'external' perspective, which seemed to provide the motivation for them to create links and connections, even though the individual systems within which they worked offered little support for them to do this.

This exploration of the links between the study of languages and vocational education reveals that links exist across the boundaries of the secondary and TAFE systems, and between those two systems and industry. However, those links are rare. Since the systems were originally designed to administer and maintain themselves, it is not surprising that few
mechanisms exist to link them together. It is also to be expected that if mechanisms are put in place, they will need nurturing so that they can become sustainable.

From a strategic point of view, linking ought not to be an option. If secondary and TAFE systems are, in fact, primarily internally focused, as suggested by our analysis of the data, they will over time become more and more divorced from the needs of their clients as they seek to maintain their existing structures and courses and the boundaries between them. If they are to combine their resources to meet the needs of the potential workforce and industry, they will have to develop new structures that can do this efficiently.

The strategic question for the researchers became what is the desired highest level outcome of linking languages and Vocational Education and Training? Such an outcome would be necessary to give direction and legitimacy to linking activities. At least three possible strategic outcomes appeared to be implied in the responses. These are:

**Outcome 1: An Educational Outcome**
To sustain and build upon the achievements of the NALSAS Strategy in relation to languages other than English by increasing student participation and retention in language courses.

**Outcome 2: An Industry Outcome**
To address the needs of Australian industries in relation to the language and cultural skills and competencies required of the workforce.

**Outcome 3: A Meta-Outcome**
To foster an Australian workforce that has the necessary skills to compete in the global marketplace.

Each of the three outcomes listed above operates at a different level of strategic complexity.

- **Outcome 1: An Educational Outcome** can be seen to operate at a lower level of strategic complexity than the two that follow, as it is focused internally on the existing school system, and is confined within the boundaries of that system.
- **Outcome 2: An Industry Outcome** can be thought of as operating at a higher level of strategic complexity, as it involves influencing both the school and
TAFE systems to co-operate together. It is less internally focused than outcome 1, but it is confined within national boundaries.

- **Outcome 3:** A Meta-Outcome involves the highest level of strategic complexity, because it would require linking across several systems in pursuit of a national priority. This outcome is externally focused, seeing Australia as being in competition with other nations for its share of the global economy.

National and State Government policies normally articulate outcomes and goals for different systems, which are resourced accordingly. It is only recently, however, that state and federal government agencies have begun to investigate ways of combining scarce resources to achieve higher level outcomes. Inevitably, this means a higher level of strategic complexity. The recommendations which follow are based on the assumption that spending additional resources on linking languages and Vocational Education and Training would be neither practical nor sustainable while a silo mentality exists. Building sustainable links between the sectors will need to be based on articulation of a goal that would stimulate the schools systems, TAFE and industry to reach beyond the silos, and begin the process of linking. The goal or goals would need to be supported by a suitable policy framework.

**Strategies to Achieve the Desired Outcome**

One way to minimise the difficulties involved in accomplishing a complex strategic objective is to build on existing practice. Part 2, Section 4 of this report, identifies seven examples of ‘good’ practice in terms of linking. Due to the lack of performance measurements in relation to the linking of languages and vocational education, there was no attempt in this research to distinguish ‘good’ practice from ‘not so good’ practice in the area. The seven examples are consolidated below into five strategies that are currently being implemented in the Australian secondary context.

**Strategy 1: The Identification of Generic Workplace Competencies**

This strategy involves the identification of generic workplace competencies that can be gained from studying a language. This is the primary strategy being used in Tasmania and New South Wales to link languages and vocational education. Coordination and support at a system level would be necessary to strengthen this strategy.
**Strategy 2: Incorporation of a Vocational Focus into Existing Language Programmes**

This strategy involves the incorporation of a vocational focus into existing language programmes by including vocational content into language courses and promoting a perspective of the student as the service-provider. The key input required to implement this strategy more effectively is changing the way teachers view languages education. This could be achieved in two ways:

- By promoting the value of such an approach to teachers and pre-service teachers; and
- By changing existing language syllabuses to reflect this approach. The effect of changing the syllabus will vary in impact from state to state, depending on how prescriptive the language syllabus is in each state.

**Strategy 3: A Generic Vocational Language Programme**

This strategy involves the development or adoption of a generic vocational language programme. Such a programme does currently exist in the form of the Applied Languages Certificates offered through TAFE; however, for this strategy to be most effective, the following four factors would need to be put in place:

- The course would need to be able to be tailored by teachers to meet the needs of learners and the needs of specific industries and companies;
- Learners would be able to receive credit towards their technical and further education studies;
- There would need to be mechanisms in place to facilitate the incorporation of the course into the secondary school context; and
- National standards and competencies would need to be developed that are acceptable to industry.

The key inputs associated with the effective implementation of this strategy are:

- The development of appropriate mechanisms in place at a system level in each state to make it easy and desirable for teachers to find out about, implement and achieve accreditation for the programmes;
- The provision of support to teachers to enable them to both access the programmes and tailor them to meet the vocational needs of their learners and the needs of industry;
- Liaison with industry to enable the generic course to be modified to suit industry needs; and
- Negotiation with industry to facilitate the development of national standards and competencies which are acceptable to industry and education sectors. In negotiating with industry the important aspect will be to ensure that it is a process of meeting industry needs, rather than trying to get industry to agree to a pre-conceived administratively convenient solution, and a pre-conceived set of values about the importance of language and cultural knowledge in the workplace.

**Strategy Four: Inclusion of Language Competencies into Industry Endorsed Training Packages for VET**

This strategy involves the inclusion of language competencies into the national industry-endorsed Training Packages for VET. For this to occur successfully would require negotiation between the secondary education sector, the technical and further education sector, ANTA, ITABs, industry and the Business Councils. There is a model to build on in the form of the newly endorsed Tourism and Hospitality Training Package.

The input associated with this strategy will be the coordination and acceptance of the competencies by industry, and the time that would be involved in coordinating such a process. The same considerations outlined in Strategy 3 regarding negotiation with industry will also need to be taken into account in relation to this strategy.

**Strategy Five: Work Experience and Business Exchange Programmes**

This strategy involves the development of work experience programmes and business exchange programmes for students of language. The difficulties associated with the implementation of this strategy are primarily logistical: arranging work experience placements that can involve the use of languages, and funding international exchange programmes. For this strategy to work most effectively, there is a need to bring industry on board, to provide work placements, or fund exchange programmes. This would require negotiation with industry to ensure that mutual needs are being met.

A representation of the extent to which the five strategies contribute to the three outcomes is shown in the table on the following page.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Id Generic Work Place Competencies</th>
<th>Out Come 1: Education Outcome</th>
<th>Out Come 2: Industry Outcome</th>
<th>Out Come 3: Meta Outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Incorporation of Vocational Focus</td>
<td><img src="chart" alt="Blue" /></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Generic Vocational Focus</td>
<td><img src="chart" alt="Yellow" /></td>
<td><img src="chart" alt="Green" /></td>
<td><img src="chart" alt="Green" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inclusion of Lang Competence’s Into Industry Endorsed Training Packages For VET</td>
<td><img src="chart" alt="Red" /></td>
<td><img src="chart" alt="Red" /></td>
<td><img src="chart" alt="Red" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work Experience &amp; Business Exchange Programs</td>
<td><img src="chart" alt="Pink" /></td>
<td><img src="chart" alt="Pink" /></td>
<td><img src="chart" alt="Pink" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Impact of Strengthening Existing Practices

The researchers concluded that re-inforcing through policy any or all of the existing strategies would impact on the outcomes identified. All the strategies have the capacity to impact on the educational outcome, and three have the capacity to impact on outcomes for industry and the competitiveness of the Australian workforce. Considering that the NALSAS Taskforce that commissioned this research has now been discontinued, it was considered that the MCEETYA Taskforce would be the appropriate body to consider which outcome(s) ought to be the focus of further linking practices, and which practices, if strengthened, would have the greatest impact on those outcomes.

It is recommended that:

1. The MCEETYA Taskforce on Student Learning and Support Services be encouraged to consider the strengthening of linkages between languages and vocational education in its development of a national approach to languages education in schools

If implemented, the potential benefit for secondary schools comes down quite simply to increasing the number of students studying languages. By connecting languages and Vocational Education and Training, language learning becomes more meaningful to students because it is applied learning, and has greater relevance to future careers. The potential benefit for the technical and further education sector is that by establishing a clearly articulated learning pathway from secondary school to technical and further education with appropriate credit arrangements, it will be able to attract more students to TAFE courses, particularly advanced courses, which are often the most difficult to fill. The potential benefit for industry is that it will be able to access future employees from a pool of people with higher levels of socio-cultural skill and language proficiency than is currently the case.

If the decision is taken to implement this recommendation, then a process would be necessary to enable successful implementation. As siloing is seen by the researchers to be the greatest barrier to strengthening links, two other recommendations follow which refer to a process for reducing the effect of the silos.
Mechanisms to enable implementation

Four mechanisms are seen by the researchers to be essential to begin the process of strengthening links. They all relate to communication across the traditional sectoral boundaries. As such, they are not particularly costly, but if the communication does not occur, there is no chance of any sustainable change occurring, beyond that which is currently being instigated by a few committed people. Given appropriate communication, it is likely that change will occur by more people taking the initiative to re-organise existing resources – after all, that is how the current linkages have been achieved.

A communication process that will support strengthening of links at low cost would contain, at a minimum, the following elements.

a. **High level policy support.** A policy framework would need to be articulated and disseminated by federal and state authorities that would stimulate activity in the various jurisdictions.

b. **Articulation of a common and desirable goal,** which would focus collaboration of effort between the three major stakeholder groups. People in each of the silos expressed goals that made sense within their silo, but were not necessarily applicable to people outside. The common goal that emerged from the research, that sits above each of the silos linking them together, is:

   **To create an Australian workforce with the necessary skills to compete in a global marketplace.**

Currently, there is no national or state policy which states the importance of such a goal. There are no structures in place to implement such a policy, or resources to support it. If this was the goal, linkages between LOTE and VET would be part of a larger strategy to improve global competitiveness of the Australian workforce, rather than a minor initiative unlikely to attract the support of bureaucrats.

c. **Forums to raise awareness of the issue.** Key system, jurisdictional and industry representatives would need to be brought together to be presented with the findings of research, and given the opportunity to talk to each other
across the traditional boundaries. This would enable them to understand the
initiatives that already exist, and consider ways in which these initiatives could
be supported. As the study indicates, ‘bottom up’ initiatives are already
operating. Simultaneous ‘bottom up’ and ‘top down’ support for change is
much more likely to achieve something worthwhile and sustainable.

d. A mechanism for facilitating the forums to create cross sector
partnerships prepared to take the process forward. An outcome of the
forums would need to be some commitment to take action. Ideally, some
groups would emerge within each state and territory made of representatives
from secondary education, Vocational Education and Training, and industry.
These groups would be prepared to plan some linking processes, or co-
ordinate, support and publicise existing linking processes. Representatives of
Business Councils indicated in their responses to the consultation that
facilitating such groups was a responsibility that they would be prepared to
accept.

It is recommended that:

2. Partnerships between school and technical and further education
sectors and industry be strengthened through:
   e. developing a common goal for the stakeholder groups;
   f. bringing stakeholders together at state/territory levels to consider
      the desirability of the goal, and what would need to happen for
      the goal to be achieved
      A seminar/workshop to be convened in each state, with senior industry, TAFE
      and secondary education representatives to consider the goal as it might
      apply in that State’s context;
   g. funding peak industry bodies, such as Business Councils, to
      facilitate the workshops
      Interviews with members of the Business Councils indicated that they
      considered themselves to be primary players in terms of bringing education,
      training and industry together to facilitate a linking process.

If groups such as these were to accept a leadership role, they would need to
be funded to facilitate the workshops. Ideally, such funding would include
provision for resources to obtain expert advice in terms of structuring the
workshops to give the best chance of delivering useful outcomes.
Useful outcomes could be:

i. A policy group or groups that would be prepared to articulate the importance of linking languages and Vocational Education and Training in terms of developing an appropriately skilled workforce to compete in a global marketplace

ii. Partnerships that would be prepared to plan how to:
   - Move the curriculum closer to industry needs,
   - Develop appropriate certification, and
   - Develop appropriate pathways.

h. providing workshop participants with knowledge of successful partnering arrangements, and practical frameworks for implementation

The best chance of achieving a goal that impacts on Australia’s future workforce will occur if participants at the workshops have some understanding of how linking processes can be initiated in such a way as to become sustainable. There is little value in a ‘one-off’. Partnerships across traditional silos have huge potential to improve the output of linked systems if they are managed appropriately.

**Provision of Information**

The final recommendation applies regardless of whether or not other recommendations are implemented. It is to provide information on existing linkages in a form that is easily digested by the target audiences. As an example, the researchers have prepared a short summary of the seven examples of current practice in the field, described in Part 2 Section 4, in an abridged version that could be provided to schools.

**It is recommended that:**

3. Information on existing and potential linkages between languages and vocational education be made available to schools through a range of print and electronic media, including the following:
   - The benefits of making such links; and
   - Models and elements of successful programmes.
Bibliography

Books and Journal Articles


Australian Committee for Training Curriculum (1994) *Diploma of Interpreting (Paraprofessional) and course in Language Consolidation for Professional Interpreting/Translating*. ACTRAC Products Ltd: Vic.


Australian Federation of Modern Language Teachers Associations *Languages other than English at the Senior Secondary Level and Vocational Education and Training (VET) Position Paper*. Unpublished position paper, AFMLTA. Date of publication unknown.


Branaman, L. “Foreign Languages and Job Opportunities” Taken from Access Eric accesseric@accesseric.org Downloaded 25/2/02


Byrnes, H. *Foreign Language Programme Articulation from High School to the University*. ERIC Digest. Eric Identifier ED321586, Publication Date 1990-07-00. Source Eric Clearinghouse on Languages and Linguistics, Washington DC.


Gibney, A. *Implementing Languages Other Than English in Vocational Education and Training: Tourism and Hospitality*, June 1996, Southbank Institute of TAFE: Research and Development Centre.

Graf, P. 'Multilingual School Education as a Key Qualification in the European Employment Area', *Vocational Training, No 18 European Journal*.


Hayman, E., *How Language Competent are Americans?* ERIC Identifier ED 276304, Publication date: 1986-11-00, Source ERIC Clearinghouse on Languages and Linguistics Washington DC.


Hodson, Elizabeth. 'LOTE in hospitality training: The Tasmanian experience', Asian Studies Review, Vol 19, No 1


Modern Languages Association, “The World is Full of Languages” ADFL web site. Page last updated 5/19/00

Modern Language Teachers Association of South Australia Inc. (1996) Talk your way into…Languages. Modern Language Teachers Association of South Australia Inc, the Multicultural Education Co-ordinating Committee, the Catholic Education Office: Adelaide


Southbank Institute of TAFE Research and Development Centre (1996) *Implementing Languages Other than English in Vocational Education and Training: Models for Best Practice.* Australian National Training Authority.


Victorian Curriculum and Assessment Board, Languages Other Than English (LOTE): Languages Other Than English Field of Study: Initial Proposals for CATs (Draft)

Voight, G. and Schaub, R., “Foreign Languages and International Business.” ERIC Digest. ERIC Identifier: ED 347851, Publication Date 1992-09-00. Source ERIC Clearinghouse on Languages and Linguistics Washington DC.


**Websites**


[http://www.reed.co.uk/multilingual](http://www.reed.co.uk/multilingual) Search conducted 5 March 2002.

Appendix 1: Literature Review

Section 1: Benefits of a Workforce Equipped with Vocational Language Skills

The literature is unanimous in promoting the benefits of developing vocational language skills, both for individuals and for national economic development and social cohesion. The Australian literature primarily emphasises the economic benefits of learning languages, specifically in terms of the tourism and export industries. Less commonly, Australian authors refer to the social benefits of learning languages for promoting social cohesion in a multicultural society. Recognition of the need for intercultural and linguistic competence is also evident in both European and North American literature. Literature from the United States, whilst similarly emphasising the benefits of learning languages in an increasingly globalised economy, emphasises more strongly the benefits of languages in terms of working with United States residents from culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds. The European literature takes a slightly different slant again, focusing on the need to increase knowledge of European languages in order to develop the mobility of the European workforce, and to mobilise an increasing sense of European citizenship.

Perceptions of Economic and Social Benefits of Combining Languages and Vocational Education in the Australian Literature

Language Fluency and International Business

- Australia needs to diversify its trade and enhance business relationships by increasing cultural sensitivity to remain competitive.
- We are slow to adapt to the global economy, we neglect lucrative business opportunities in the international market.
- We need management, scientific, technical & service personnel with Asian language, culture and market knowledge.
- Australian business uses Asian languages in operations, many big companies have Asian speaking employees.
- Mandarin, Japanese and Indonesian language/cultural skills are used in contract negotiation, product promotion, after sales service and investment negotiation.
**Vocational Education**

- VET must support globally competitive small business. We need to understand and communicate effectively and sensitively with the market.
- Increased company size reduces reliance on the education system, even so many believe language training is the responsibility of the education system.

**Tourism**

- To reduce foreign national recruitments the Tourism and Hospitality Industry in Queensland needs appropriately skilled Australians with Asian language and cultural skills.
- Tourism industry in the NT has a strong base of Japanese, Korean and German customers.

**Merchandise**

- Merchandise companies and larger companies understand that our economic success depends upon how we sell our products. We need to be familiar with the languages, history, customs and business culture of the countries in our region,
- Australian companies will not be able to respond to the global economy if export staff are not linguistically able to break into new markets or retain old ones.

**Social Impact**

- The modern world is undergoing a technology revolution, affecting cultural dynamics, knowledge and power structures. Language is a key factor in economic and social opportunities. Democratic societies are obliged to support language skills, to ensure social benefit of added opportunity for individuals and groups.

**Perceptions of Economic and Social Benefits of Combining Languages and Vocational Education in the American Literature**

In the United States, the literature consistently cites the increasing globalisation of the economy as the primary motivation for people from a diverse range of technical and occupational backgrounds to learn another language. According to Geoffrey Voight and Ray Schaub:
‘[F]luency in a foreign language and multicultural sensitivity are essential...if the United States is to participate effectively in this global community and if we expect to maintain our standard of living in the context of increasing global competition and cooperation.’

The consensus among the authors is that Americans are not prepared either linguistically or culturally for the global market. Inman argues that while proficiency in English is often an essential hiring criterion for European and Japanese companies, in English speaking countries, proficiency in a foreign language is considered “desirable, but optional”. She sees this as stemming from an underlying assumption that business matters will be handled in English, and that foreign language skills, if they are required at all, will be used in social settings only.

**Language Fluency and International Business**

- In a global market the US cannot expect to maintain its standard of living if it does not improve its occupational foreign language fluency and multicultural sensitivity.
- English speaking businesses assume business will be conducted in English. Proficiency in English is a hiring criterion for European and Japanese companies.
- US business entering the Chinese market often have no language, cultural or economic system knowledge so they encounter bureaucratic delays, communication problems, losses in efficiency, difficulties in strategic planning and business relations.
- In 1998, US companies lost 40 % of international sales because they had few employees who could relate to the foreign country.
- Foreign aid projects and service provision requires the ability to personally communicate across cultures.
- The need for sales and marketing representatives who understand their buyers’ culture and language is increasingly important.

---

6 Voight, Geoffrey and Schaub, Ray, “Foreign Languages and International Business.” ERIC Digest. ERIC Identifier: ED 347851, Publication Date 1992-09-00. Source ERIC Clearinghouse on Languages and Linguistics Washington DC., p 1
7 Inman, “How Foreign Language Study Can Enhance Career Possibilities” ERIC Digest, ERIC Identifier: ED 289363, Publication Date, 1987-12-00 Source ERIC Clearinghouse on Languages and Linguistics Washington DC, p 1.
Social Impact

- American workers involved in emergency and social services (police officers, nurses, paramedics, parole officers and court officials) need the skills to communicate with area residents who do not speak English.
- A multilingual workforce enhances America’s economic competitiveness abroad, helps maintain our political and security interests and promotes tolerance and cultural awareness.

Perceptions of Economic and Social Benefits of Combining Languages and Vocational Education in the European Literature

Literature emanating from the European Union focuses on the economic benefits of learning languages, specifically emphasising the need for an increasingly mobile workforce within Europe. In addition, the literature stresses the importance of developing a multilingual society in order to promote the concept of European citizenship.

Vocational & Language Education

- Languages, should be a key skill alongside literacy and numeracy, they contribute to economic competitiveness, cultural tolerance and social cohesion. Language skills should be built into the culture and practice of British Business.
- Internationalisation of industry and commerce makes foreign language a necessary professional and vocational skill. Foreign language should be introduced into all professional, vocational, upper secondary and adult programs.

Five Education and Training Objectives

- Encourage the acquisition of new knowledge;
- Bring school and the business sector closer together;
- Combat exclusion;
- Develop proficiency in three European Languages;
- Treat capital investment and investment in training on an equal basis.
Euro Employment Mobility

- Economic and trade internationalisation, global technology, and the information society means freedom of movement for capital, goods and services.
- The two richest countries in Europe are also the most multilingual.
- Mobility between cultures is an asset for adapting to the new world. Training should build social and technical knowledge that is broad and transferable, it should build self-reliance and occupational capacity. Language as a key skill should be included in Vocational Education and Training.

Social Impact

- Language development is a major element in a person’s general cultural growth. As a foundation, for social interaction it belongs with cognitive, social and in some cases emotional competency.
Section 2: Vocational Pathways Available to People with Skills in Languages and Cultures

The literature review and netsearch considered different career opportunities available to people with language and cultural knowledge skills. A number of authors provide lists of careers for which, in their opinion, people with a linguistic and cultural knowledge have a distinct advantage. It is notable that most of the jobs listed require a tertiary degree, and thus fall outside the scope the VET sector. Notably, eight of the nine people profiled on the LOTElinx website have a tertiary education. In addition, only seven of the 42 profiles described in the Language Advantage handbook do not have a tertiary education (of these seven, two are native speakers of the LOTE), and only one person undertook further education through the TAFE system. Likewise, many of the occupations listed may be seen to fall outside the Vocational Education and Training ambit, as they require University qualifications.

A number of articles, however, are quite specific in their argument that it is not just university graduates, professionals and senior level management that will benefit from a knowledge of languages and cultures.

Peter Graf and Jacob Kornbeck, writing from a European perspective, also contend that languages are not just a necessity for people in senior positions, but also to people in middle level careers. Graf notes that steel companies operating internationally not only need managers with language skills, but also trained fitters with linguistic and cultural knowledge.8 According to Kornbeck, ‘It is not merely the idea of a philologist that butcher apprentices should be given good language instruction. It increases their mobility on the European labour market.’9

Inman argues that ‘while fields such as librarianship, government and politics and some areas of education seek employees who possess foreign language proficiency…it is business that places the greatest emphasis on both foreign language capability and knowledge of specific subject areas like management, tourism or finance.’10 In support of this view, Brandle points out that the largest private employer in Australia of personnel with language skills is QANTAS: ‘It was realised long ago that cabin staff with no knowledge of Japanese cannot function adequately on flights between Australia and Japan, particularly when taking into account the fact that Japanese nationals represent the vast majority of

8 Graf, p 40.
9 Jacob Kornbeck, Foreign Language Instruction, Vocational Training and Location Securing, Vocational Training No 16, European Journal, p 34
10 Inman, p 2
passengers. It is apparent from the literature that language and cultural skills may also be invaluable for defence force personnel.  

11 Brandle, p 38  
Section 3: Programmes Linking Languages and Vocational Education

The purpose of this section is to explore the types of programmes available, both in Australia and overseas, that combine a study of languages with vocational education or a vocational focus. The Australian situation is described first. To do this, the researchers drew upon unpublished documentation collected through the consultation process undertaken with key stakeholders as part of this project. This is followed by examples of different kinds of programmes described in the literature.

The Australian Situation

Due to the paucity of available literature dealing with the subject, it was extremely difficult to get an accurate picture of the interface between languages and vocational education in Australia. It was even more difficult to determine what was happening in relation to languages and vocational education in secondary schools, as none of the literature sourced through the initial database and internet search addressed this issue. Following leads from the interviews with stakeholders, some scattered documentation was collected from which the following information was gleaned. The information is divided into two parts: developments in the technical and further education sector, and developments in the secondary education sector.

Developments in the Technical and Further Education Sector

Following from the introduction of the NALSAS Strategy, a National Collaborative Strategy on Languages Other Than English in Vocational Education and Training was developed by the Adult LOTE and Asian Studies Sub Committee of the MCEETYA Australian Language and Literacy Policy Taskforce in 1994. The aim of the strategy was to encourage the expansion of adult LOTE provision in the Vocational Education and Training sector. The Sub-Committee was disbanded, however, in December 1995, and State Implementation Groups were developed to maintain carriage of LOTE at the State and Territory level. Tellingly, the research team was unable to locate any information about the role and achievements of the State Implementation Groups.

In 1996, there was a move by the ANTA to investigate the possibilities for implementing LOTE and cultural studies programmes into the technical and further education sector. Two separate studies were commissioned. The first was undertaken by the Southbank Institute of TAFE. Its aim was to identify industry needs and priorities for languages other than English and how these could be met by the VET sector. The evaluation explicitly explored the development of Best Practice models for integrating languages other than English into identified VET courses. The second was conducted concurrently by

13 Smart, D. p 22
the Asia Research Centre at Murdoch University. The aim of this study was to investigate and assess the demand for Asia literacy by Australian business, and to determine how this demand could be met by the technical and further education sector. Southbank TAFE considered data collected from both studies to develop recommendations about future LOTE curriculum development for the VET sector. The Southbank report concluded that there was an immediate business imperative for cultural awareness courses which relate to workplace needs. Four priority languages, aligned with the NALSAS languages, were identified. The report recommended that these languages be reviewed on a regular basis, to ensure their relevance to the community.

As part of the Southbank study, a best practice model was also developed for integrating LOTE into VET. The model was designed to offer a range of opportunities for the delivery of LOTE, including:

- Short courses with specific/industry content;
- Integration of LOTE modules with existing vocational offerings;
- Accessing the national generic language curriculum; and
- The completion of modules which are transportable across State boundaries and across VET providers.

The model developed was seen to offer a way of creating pathways and opportunities for students without incurring high costs to providers and governments, and included guidelines for consultation with industry bodies. As part of the model a curriculum framework was recommended that would draw upon existing vocational courses, linking language and cultural awareness into existing studies. Three advantages of the proposed model are described in the report. The first is the fact that the framework accommodates both existing and new modules of study. The second is that students can access the courses through a range of venues, delivery methods and alternative options for study. Thirdly, that the study programmes would be based on nationally accredited material, thus enabling transferability between institutions, and across states.

The framework comprises five different programmes. These are:

- **LOTE Studies – National Generic Curriculum:** The **LOTE Studies – National Generic Curriculum** encompassed the pre-existing generic language studies courses available in the VET

---

14 The ANTA Report, p 4
15 The ANTA Report, p 18-19
sector (now referred to as the Applied Languages Certificates). These courses are not tied to any particular industry or vocation, and are divided into different modules or levels.

- **Vocational Studies – Current Accredited Modules:** This component of the framework was to allow for the incorporation of pre-existing generic language modules to be incorporated as elective units into any other accredited VET course, for example courses in tourism and hospitality, business or retail.

- **Integration Studies:** Integration Studies modules were to be developed. These were designed as optional modules which provide contextual support through which language study and work culture study can be pitched to the vocational outcome, and through which the vocational outcome can be linked back to both language and work culture studies. Such modules might include courses such as German for Tourism, or Korean for Business.

- **Work Culture Studies:** These modules were to focus directly on the work related culture associated with the target language being studied. It was intended that they would include culturally-based practices and processes used within the industry, trade and commerce of different overseas countries. The purpose of these modules was to facilitate business dealings with overseas clients.

- **Vocational Enhancement Project Module:** These were envisaged as single modules, which could be offered as an alternative additional elective to the Vocational Skill Project often incorporated into other VET modules. Students undertaking a Vocational Enhancement Project Module were to complete a set number of hours of relevant work activities while immersed in the LOTE. These projects were to be designed on an individual basis, and were to be determined in consultation with teaching staff from both languages and the vocational area.

The model was to be trialled by TAFE Queensland in 1997 and evaluated at a national level in 1998. The literature search did not, however, reveal any evaluations of the model, and it is not possible to determine which of the above modules were implemented.

Two curricula documents were located in a search of the National Clearinghouse for Vocational Education and Research (Australia). One was a National TAFE Language Course for Japanese developed in 1994, which is encompassed under the umbrella of the LOTE Studies – National Generic Curriculum referred to above. This course has since been superseded by the Applied Languages

---

16 The ANTA Report, p 5
Certificate in Japanese developed by ACTRAC. The other document was the Diploma of Interpreting (Paraprofessional),\textsuperscript{18} which falls outside the model described above.

The National Training Information Service website currently describes one Certificate Level Course in Applied Languages available through the technical and further education sector. This course does not have the same status as an industry-endorsed Training Package. These Training Packages are developed to train people for specific industries. There is currently only one Training Package, for the Hospitality and Tourism industry, which incorporates units of competency in languages other than English. These are optional units.\textsuperscript{19} The LOTE standards are available on the NTIS website at http://www.ntis.gov.au.

**Developments in the Secondary Education Sector**

A recent position paper put out by the Australian Federation of Modern Language Teachers Association (AFMLTA) deals expressly with the issue of the incorporation of languages into vocational education in Australia. The paper concludes that:

\textit{‘…on the basis of some preliminary research carried out in 1996, there appears to have been little action occurring nationally in respect of VET and languages other than English at the senior secondary level.’}\textsuperscript{20}

There was little in the literature analysed as part of this review to suggest that there had been any great developments in the area since then. The AFMLTA does recognise that there are some vocationally oriented language courses offered in Australia, but these are often initiated at a school level, rather than a system level, and thus have ‘no official industry recognition.’\textsuperscript{21} Examples given include Japanese for Tourism in WA and Translation in NSW. The lack of programmes combining language learning and vocational education in the secondary context is attributed by the AFMLTA to the ‘absence of industry endorsed modules for languages, such as those developed for the Hospitality, Small Business or Metals Industries.’\textsuperscript{22}

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{18} Australian Committee for Training Curriculum (1994) \textit{Diploma of Interpreting (Paraprofessional) and course in Language Consolidation for Professional Interpreting/Translating}. ACTRAC Products Ltd: Vic.
\textsuperscript{19} NTIS Website, Search conducted 14 July 2002
\textsuperscript{20} AFMLTA, p 1
\textsuperscript{21} AFMLTA, p 1
\textsuperscript{22} AFMLTA, p 1
\end{flushleft}
One option identified for incorporating languages and vocational education in the secondary school context is to embed the ACTRAC generic Applied Languages Certificates into the year 11 and 12 curriculum. The benefit of this model is perceived to be that these certificates can be incorporated into secondary school classes without the need for any additional time to be devoted to LOTE. In addition, there is also the possibility that students can receive dual certification upon successful completion of the modules, receiving credit towards both their secondary education certificate and credit towards a variety of further education courses. At the time that the position paper was written, only the ACT and SA had structures in place to enable the modules to be incorporated. Since then, the Western Australian Curriculum Council and the Perth Central TAFE have developed mechanisms for incorporation of the Certificates into the secondary school curriculum. Both WA and SA have also developed materials to assist teachers through the process of embedding the course into their curricula, and to understand how the competencies outlined in the Applied Languages Certificates relate to the outcomes required under the secondary education syllabuses used in each state.23

One aspect of this model is that the Applied Languages modules are non-industry specific. The advantage of this is that they can be customised to suit any vocational focus. The disadvantage, however, is that ‘they have not been officially recognised by any industry (except possibly by the Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade), they do not yet have any real currency.’24 The inclusion of units of competency in the Tourism and Hospitality Training Package, mentioned above, may go some way to changing this situation.

Two other pieces of documentation collected through the consultation process provide some insight into other models that are being adopted in different states to connect languages and vocational education. The first is a draft document produced by the NSW Department of Education and Training.25 The document outlines a sample set of generic workplace competencies that can be achieved by students through their language classes. The example given aligns workplace competencies with outcomes from a Japanese lesson. The document is designed as a model to be used by teachers in designing classroom activities for languages, so that specific competencies achieved can be made explicit to students.
The second is a draft paper provided by the Catholic Education Commission of Victoria. The paper describes a structured workplace programme for language students. The programme targets year 10 students, and places them in work experience contexts in which they are required to use their language skills. The programme was designed specifically as a means of increasing student retention in language classes in the post-compulsory years of schooling. In this regard, the programme appears to have been very successful. A recent survey undertaken by the Catholic Education Commission suggests that of 240 participants surveyed, approximately 40% have carried on to study LOTE in years 11 and 12.

Other initiatives to promote the inclusion of a careers focus into language programmes in Australian secondary schools include the following packages and promotional materials:

- A package developed by the MLTASA, incorporating short descriptions of people who have used language in their careers and a selection of job recruitment advertisements that have language skills as either an essential or desirable criteria;
- A promotional document developed by the Association of Independent Schools in NSW which also provides profiles of potential role models who have used language in their careers
- The LOTElinx website in Vic which promotes the kinds of jobs available to people with skills in language, provides justifications for learning particular languages in terms of personal and professional development and, again, contains profiles of people who have used language in their careers.

Examples of Programmes Linking Languages and Vocational Education

A number of descriptions of specific programmes that combine languages and vocational education emerge from the literature. Most of the examples cited are taken from the international literature. Some of the examples described have been implemented in the secondary schools, others are being implemented in the further education context, while others are company-training initiatives.

The examples have been categorised according to four programme types. The first type of programme described involves the inclusion of a vocational focus into a language class, while the second encompasses the incorporation of a language component into a pre-existing vocational education course. The third type of programme described involves work experience and/or international exchange as a key component. The last model described is a company-training model. Within each of these models, it is possible to identify programmes that have been developed as a result of governmental

---

policy and operate at a systemic level, and those that have been initiated by an individual school or college, or company.

**Inclusion of a Vocational Focus to Language Learning**

One system level initiative described in the literature is the EU-LINGUA programme introduced by the European Union. The programme promotes training for teachers and trainers that focuses on a knowledge of languages used in work relations and economic life. The programme involves international exchange programmes for teachers involved in delivering language programmes in professional, vocational and technical education.²⁷

Another system level initiative is the National Curriculum adopted in the United Kingdom, which makes the recommendation that at the pre-sixteen stage it is important to develop within language programmes a relevance to working life and to encourage the use of languages outside the classroom. The UK National Curriculum Council also recommends the development of cross-curricular activities to encourage the use of foreign languages in range of different contexts to enhance their applicability outside the language classroom.

A school-level example of this kind of programme is an Applied French Course being undertaken by Wirral Schools Technology Centre in the UK. The course integrated a focus on Information Technology and Business Communications into an Applied French Course. Its objective was to offer skills which would be of benefit in everyday life, study and employment. The programme targeted sixth form students with a GSCE Grade C pass who wanted to study French, but who were not interested in taking an ‘A’ level in the language. Science students were particularly targeted. The course room was operated as an office to create an ‘adult working atmosphere’, and all activities were carried out as business activities.²⁸

The first element of the course involves students playing host to a Francophone visitor to the Centre. The visit is recorded on video, and students are then encouraged to assess their performance at a later date. The students also produce a personal portrait of the visitor for inclusion in a course magazine. Students are connected by email to a school in France and conduct business simulations. Simulations cover the basic processes involved in buying and selling of goods, from the advertising of a product through to the conclusion of the sale. Students have access to translation software (TICK-TACK) to help

²⁷ Wolf, Brigitte, 'Occupation Related Foreign Language Instruction', p 68.
²⁸ Stevens, p 29
them compose business correspondence in the target language. This software is regarded as a complement to language skills, not a substitute for them, as students are required to edit and adapt the computer produced letter to meet their specific needs. Students are also required to develop a visitor’s guide for English visitors to a French town. To do this, they must use a French telephone database (Télétel), make phone calls to various agencies in France, and find information on a variety of topics from exchange rates, to petrol prices and places of interest. A potential drawback of the course is the extensive planning required from staff from the languages, information technology and business studies areas, and the time required to develop the links with outside organisations, individuals and counterpart schools in France. Nevertheless, the authors state that ‘the resulting increase in student interest and motivation more than repays the hard work involved’.

The programme described above can be seen to fall within the concept of ‘border pedagogy’ described by Graf as an example of good practice in the teaching of vocational languages in Europe. This concept is encapsulated in the slogan of ‘learning your neighbour’s language’, and is particularly relevant to the European context. The programme focuses on carrying out projects in neighbouring countries in conjunction with a partner school in the target country. Because students are required to work together with students from other schools to carry out specific tasks, communication is described as being intrinsically relevant and applied.29

Inclusion of Languages in Vocational Education Programmes

There are a number of system level programmes in place in the European Union to promote the inclusion of languages in Vocational Education and Training programmes. In the European Union, the EU-LINGUA programme funds the development of occupational related teaching and learning materials via the cooperative efforts of linguists and experts in occupational practice.30 The PETRA Programme also plays a major role in encouraging the joint development of training units that incorporate languages and vocational education.31 Another initiative in the European Union is the EUROQUALIFICATION project which has involved 10 member states working together to establish parameters for technical language instruction for specific occupations.32

The Australian and American literature only describes individual school or college initiatives. In an Australian example, Elizabeth Hodson describes how the Drysdale Institute of TAFE in Tasmania has

29 Graf, p 41
30 Wolf, p 68
31 Wolf, p 69
32 Wolf, p 69
incorporated French and Japanese modules into their Hospitality Courses. The LOTE inclusion, and the concentration on French and Japanese are responses to industry:

‘French was selected because of its role in cooking and hospitality. Japanese was selected because it is the focus of much tourism activity in Australia. The course objectives include the achievement of a level of communication adequate for working in a restaurant or hotel. Areas covered include ordering from a menu, giving directions or booking rooms, plus basic literacy and numeracy.’

The number of hours devoted to language learning in the programme is limited. Hodson states that this is due to the heavy workload involved in hospitality training, and is also consistent with the relatively lower level of proficiency they are aiming at for their learners. Due to the limited number of contact hours for languages in the course, the Drysdale staff have developed links with the secondary schools to try to ensure that students are able to achieve a requisite level of proficiency in that time. They visit schools and talk to students from years 7 to 12, promoting the programme and emphasising the relevance of languages in business. These promotional activities are focused closely on quality assurance and client service. The model illustrates the linking required within the education system to respond to industry needs. In 1994, 100% of those graduating with the Associate Diploma of Business (Hospitality) had found employment, and within six months 100% of those graduating with the Associate Diploma of Business (Travel and Tourism) had also found employment. Hodson notes, that ‘the attention given to LOTE has obviously not disadvantaged this training programme.’ The question of how advantageous the inclusion of languages was for graduates, however, is not explicitly addressed.

In Hodson’s view the Drysdale TAFE programme is ‘leading the way’ in terms of the linking of LOTE and VET in the state. The key good practice elements identified by Hodson are that the programme has developed in deliberate response to industry needs and economic demands, that the language modules are specifically tailored to the vocational needs of the programme, and the links that have been developed between the TAFE and feeder secondary schools in the area.

In her article, Foreign Languages and Technical-Occupational Programmes: Local Needs and Global Imperatives, Laura Walker provides a review of a number of technical-occupational programmes being

---

33 Hodson, p 23
34 Hodson, p 25
35 Hodson, p 27
36 Hodson, p 22
run in community colleges in the United States, which incorporate a language learning component. These programmes have developed in response to an increasing demand from industry for foreign language training from community colleges. She refers to a number of examples of technical-occupational language programmes in the US. Tacoma Community College Washington is one example given. The College there has ‘plans to pair language and humanities courses as well as language and business courses to emphasize language and cultural experiences as prerequisites to conducting business in the Pacific Rim.’ The college has selected its business and nursing programmes as initial targets for the programme.

Cochise College International Communications Certificate is also cited as an example of a college which provides training in technical and occupational Spanish for English speakers. This professional training is designed to prepare students for working in the borderlands region of Arizona and Mexico. The programme includes an internship in a bilingual technical setting as well as monthly field trips to businesses, factories, banks and hospitals.

Four other colleges (Oklahoma City Community College; County College of Morris, New Jersey; Holyoke Community College, Massachusetts; and Kingsborough Community College, New York) are described as being in the process of developing offerings in Spanish for Medical Carers, Spanish for Business, Spanish for Law Enforcement Personnel, and Spanish for Hospitality Management. Riverside Community College District, California has a language programme for court interpreters, which was developed in response to the California State Constitution mandate for court interpreting services, as well as community requests for assistance. Mississippi Gulf Coast Community College plans to make Spanish for Law Enforcement personnel available to degree majors in criminal justice as well as to local law enforcement officers. Shoreline Community College, Washington offers Spanish for Law Enforcement Officers as an elective. The College is also looking at French for Cosmetology and Fashion and Merchandising, and Spanish for Nurses and X-Ray Technologists. Mt San Antonio Community College District, California, offers Spanish for Fire Personnel. Given the large number of Spanish Speakers in the District, the college is also exploring Spanish programmes for nurses, doctors, police and court officials. The aim is to give the learners the skills to communicate with non-English speaking area residents during situations of crisis. Cultural sensitivity is a key component.

According to Walker, Tulsa Junior College Oklahoma has made its international language studies technical-occupational programmes available in six languages – French, German, Italian, Japanese, 37 Walker, p 26
Russian and Spanish. An advisory board made up of representatives from international firms made recommendations for most of the components of the technical-occupational language degrees. In addition to language proficiency, the board strongly recommended a humanities component. There was considerable debate about how worthwhile this was, but the board was ultimately convinced that professionals needed to communicate with their foreign counterparts as educated and informed adults. So humanities units are taught as short segments with the aim of promoting an understanding of the culture and value system of the targeted language group. 38

Walker sees this model of vocational language provision as very effective and notes that community response to the courses has been strong and a significant number of firms are requesting on-site beginning classes. This appears to be a result of the fact that most programmes are direct responses to the needs of their specific communities, such as the growing arrests of non-native speakers, and the lack of appropriate support services for multicultural community members in crisis situations. Walker describes how companies in the United States are taking advantage of vocational programmes being run by community colleges. She comments: ‘Employees of companies with international markets need to learn language and cultural skills quickly. They need to be able to communicate with their counterparts in another country via telephone, fax and email, as well as with customers living in the US who do not speak English.’ As such they need the ‘fastest, most efficient learning programme possible for their employees.’ 39

The courses described above tend to focus predominantly on oral skills. They are designed to allow students to gain sufficient language proficiency for application in their career. As with the Drysdale TAFE programme, the number of hours allocated to language learning in the programmes is limited. Walker comments: ‘Since technical-occupational language study is usually coupled with another specialised skill area…students tend to limit the number of hours devoted to language study to what is needed to gain the fluency and proficiency necessary to perform in the chosen career area. Most certificates required 24-28 semester hours of language related course work.’ 40

Work Experience and Exchange Programmes
A number of examples described in the literature include either a work experience and/or international exchange programme designed to link languages with vocational imperatives. A number of the

38 Walker, p 27
39 Walker, p
40 Walker, p 27
examples, particularly in the European context, combine work experience or traineeships into an international exchange programme.

The European literature describes a number of system level vocational exchange initiatives that have implemented by the European Union. Many of these initiatives incorporate training placements for participants in other countries. Each of these programmes focuses on the development of language skills to improve employment prospects. The rationale for these programmes is about developing an increasingly mobile workforce within Europe. Programmes developed include:

- **EU-LINGUA**, mentioned above, which also supports youth vocational training exchange schemes to promote foreign language learning;
- **COMETT**, which is designed to strengthen cooperation between industry and all post-secondary training establishments in order to develop initial and continuing training in technology to meet industry’s requirements for a qualified workforce;
- **COMETT II**, which provides transnational traineeships for students in a range of industries;
- **PETRA**, mentioned above, which aims to improve the standard, quality and availability of vocational training in Europe and to develop a European dimension to vocational training through providing transnational placements for young people in initial training in the metal industries;
- **ERASMUS**, which is designed to promote the mobility of staff and students involved in higher education (including technical and further education) by providing financial support to higher education institutions for exchange programme within Western Europe;
- **TEMPUS**, which operates in the same way as ERASMUS but is designed to encourage links with Eastern Europe;
- **YOUTH EXCHANGES**, an exchange programme open to anyone aged between 18 and 28 seeking employment, or has completed their basic vocational training/apprenticeship; and
- **EWE**, the European Work Experience project is funded both nationally and by the European Commission and undertakes to establish contacts with schools and educational establishments in the countries concerned. Schemes are organised across a variety of vocational sectors, with the most popular sectors being Catering/Hotel/Tourism and Secretarial and Business Studies.\(^\text{41}\)

\(^{41}\) White Paper, p 59-61, Brigitte Wolf, ‘Occupation Related Foreign Language Instruction’, p 68
Anne Stevens et al in their publication *Languages for the World of Work* describe a number of individual initiatives that have been implemented at a school and college level in the United Kingdom, and include either a work experience or exchange component, or a combination of the two.

One such programme is ‘The South Downs College Scheme’, a work placement exchange programme operating from a British technical and further education college. The scheme involves placing students undertaking vocational courses at the college, such as business, technology, catering and hotel reception, in work experience programmes abroad. Participants in the programme do not have to be language specialists, as ‘brief but intensive’ language survival courses and cultural briefings are provided to students before going abroad. The authors describe the programme as very successful, with both students and the prospective employers seeing value in the experience. Demand for the programme exceeds the number of places available. Students develop confidence and greater proficiency in using their language. The majority of students return with a desire to further develop their language skills. The process is modelled on commercial practices, from the selection process on, and participants are required to make presentations to staff and students on their return.42

A second programme described by Stevens et al is the Foreign Languages at Work (FLAW) course at St Dominic’s Sixth Form College, Harrow. The FLAW course is one of a range of courses run by the London Chamber of Commerce and Industry (LCCI) in response to the needs of industry, and provides practical and vocational teaching which would enable students to develop language skills that can assist them in their future career paths. Schools that receive funding under the FLAW course develop and assess their programmes, and these are monitored by a representative from the LCCI. The programme developed by St Dominic’s built on the school’s pre-existing relationship with BP. The programme involved a study visit to Dunkerque, which included two days at an oil refinery. Students did not undertake a work placement, as such, at the refinery. Rather they were required to complete a work shadowing exercise. Each student spent half a day shadowing an employee at the refinery, and conducted an interview with the employee to determine what their work involved. Preparation for the programme involved the development of interview questionnaires, teaching of appropriate vocabulary for conducting the interviews, and training in interview techniques including how to structure the interview, active listening, and the use of sign language. According to the report, the work shadowing exercise was the highlight of the trip, and ‘students felt a great sense of achievement and even excitement’ and expressed an increase in confidence in using their language.43

---

42 Stevens et al, p 37-38
The Kingsway College Scheme is another example of a work placement programme for language students. This scheme can be distinguished from the other two as the work placements are undertaken in the United Kingdom with companies whose working language is the target language that the students are learning. In this regard, it is similar to the structured workplace learning programme developed by the Catholic Education Commission of Victoria. The work experience component was included in the Kingsway Scheme to prove that languages are an asset in the workplace, and ‘that local businesses and industry would be only too pleased to have linguists working with them.’\textsuperscript{44} Placements were organised for a two week time period. Students engaged in the programme prepared a work experience diary in the target language which they recorded both in written form and on cassette. On completion of the placements, students received a reference from their employers, a report from the college and wrote a letter of thanks to the companies. Once again, the programme is seen to be very successful. The authors write:

‘References and reports were excellent, students truly grateful. They had all gained in self confidence, saw the relevance of the skills they had acquired in college and fed back to the college their insights into the companies. Not only that, many were offered temporary or permanent jobs.’\textsuperscript{45}

The success of the scheme is attributed to the relationships developed by the college with local trade and industry.

The benefits of the exchange/work experience model is that learners have the opportunity to use language in a real vocational setting, and can make direct links between language use and the workplace. However, there are a number of considerations to be taken into account in attempting to implement a work experience model for students of language. The Further Education Unit, London, identifies the following:

- The fact that it may be difficult to arrange placements in times of economic recession;
- The difficulty of matching language levels and vocabulary with the demands of the workplace;
- The need to monitor students’ progress against course requirements;
- The importance of coordinating activities across vocational sectors; and

\textsuperscript{43} Stevens et al., p 52
\textsuperscript{44} Stevens et al, p 47
\textsuperscript{45} Stevens et al, p 48
• The time and staffing implications involved in organising the programmes.\textsuperscript{46}

**Company Training Programmes**

The final type of programme described in the literature involves the development of language training programmes for industry. One particular initiative of this kind, operating at a national level, is the Overseas Vocational Training Association (OVTA), a unique training initiative established by the Japanese government in 1982 to support the globalisation of Japanese business. OVTA provides specialist training to professionals who will be working overseas. OVTA programmes are designed to help Japanese personnel acquire the language skills, and socio-cultural understandings necessary to work overseas. There is a high level of emphasis on socio-cultural understandings. In 1998, OVTA was training approximately 180,000 of the 700,000 Japanese working abroad for Japanese enterprises people each year. Given that the largest companies have their own training programmes for employees working abroad, this suggests that more than 200,000 Japanese employees are receiving language and cultural training before working overseas.\textsuperscript{47} OVTA offers:

• Training for foreign trainers who are instructors in Japanese companies operating overseas;
• Other programmes in Japanese language and culture for foreign trainees who are working in Japanese companies overseas;
• Consultants who can travel to overseas operations and provide on-site assistance with any vocational education training problems;
• Development of training materials; and
• An extensive Human Resource Development information service.

The association receives annual funding from the Japanese government to a value of $US 38 million.\textsuperscript{48}

A national initiative implemented in Australia is the Austrade Asia-Pacific Fellowship Programme which was introduced in 1991-1992 to subsidise 6-12 month placements in Asia of key managers or graduate employees of Australian companies. The subsidies enabled Fellows to spend 50% of their time on language training, and the other 50% of the time gaining hands-on business experience. An evaluation

\textsuperscript{46} Further Education Unit, London (1993) *Languages in Further Education*, August 1993, p 2
\textsuperscript{48} Chris Robinson, p 20
of the Programme showed it to be very effective, and found that the ‘Fellows were experiencing rapidly accelerating career promotion on their completion.’

A company-specific initiative is also described in the Australian context. Australia’s major airline, Qantas, has a policy which makes it mandatory for all newly recruited cabin crew to speak a second language. The airline also encourages the acquisition of language skills at a management level. In line with this, the organisation has established a learning centre in Sydney, which has language learning software available as one of its major components. Qantas staff are encouraged to use the Centre in their own time in order to develop their language skills.

In relation to company training, a survey undertaken by AGB McNair in the Australian context found that 89% of 275 business representatives surveyed claimed that they would give some priority for company-funded training in Asian languages and societies (however, this priority was generally of a low-medium level). Of the 243 businesses that did accord such training some priority, 51% were of the view that the responsibility for training was that of the education system, while 46% perceived that it was the responsibility of the companies themselves. The survey found that the larger the companies were, the less reliance they placed on the education system in terms of such training.
Section 4: Elements of Good Practice

Key elements of good practice in the provision of vocational language learning programmes identified in the literature are outlined below under the following headings:

- Meaningful, Relevant and Applied Language;
- Combination of Technical and General Purpose Language;
- Inclusion of Cultural Perspectives;
- Appropriate Pedagogy;
- Relevant Teaching Materials;
- The Use of Technology;
- Assessment;
- Needs Identification; and
- Clearly Articulated Pathways.

Meaningful, Relevant and Applied Language

A recurring theme throughout the literature is the need for language usage in the Vocational Education and Training context to be both meaningful and applied. Egloff and Fitzpatrick contend that for vocationally oriented language learning to be effective, it is vital that learners can see the immediate relevance of the language to their vocational contexts. They therefore maintain that content matter needs to be specifically linked to the vocation.52

This argument is reinforced by Kornbeck:

'It is certainly important to give French instruction to a class of butchers, however, if instruction focuses more on the correct form of the past participle rather than on day to day language and technical language (and this is often the case in reality) then this unfortunately is tantamount to the compulsory imposition of a training area alien to the butcher. Hence it can be assumed that trainees will have little interest in the curriculum and will write it off as useless…'53

52 Egloff and Fitzpatrick, p 228
53 Kornbeck, p 36
It is his view that occupation related language instruction should be modified to the needs of the occupation. Plasberg presents a similar case. He believes that students who see the relevance and applicability of language skills in their vocational context will feel more motivated to learn and come to regard foreign language as a core skill, rather than an add-on to their curriculum.\footnote{Plasberg, p 52}

Language teachers surveyed by Hall and Bankowska also found that there was ‘A lot to be gained in student motivation from tailoring the courses closely to their needs.’\footnote{Hall and Bankowska, p 7}

The need for language learning to be relevant and meaningful is further reinforced by Adelman who writes: ‘If US professors of Russian would rather teach Pushkin than the protocols and bargaining techniques necessary for getting tank cars across the Finnish border, then send the students to St Petersburg and let the Russians teach them basic language and culture.’\footnote{Adelman, p 5}

Stevens et al claim that ‘the most effective way of developing language competence is by applying it to an increasing range and variety of real needs and real purposes in which something of genuine interest is communicated.’\footnote{Stevens, p 15.} Many of the examples described in the previous section have been constructed around developing situations in which the foreign language can be applied to practical vocational situations, through either work placements or business simulations.

**Combination of Technical and General-Purpose Language**

A number of writers suggest that successful vocational language programmes should combine technical language used in the occupation with general-purpose language for every day use. In this regard, Plasberg argues that even in vocationally-oriented language programmes, course content needs to focus concurrently on social and work arenas, thus meeting the learner’s need for linguistic competence in both language for special purposes (in this case, architecture) and language for general purposes (social and cultural skills).\footnote{Plasberg, p 52} Kornbeck holds a complementary view. He describes the aim of vocational education as being to ‘impart to the individuals supposedly useful skills which he can use when and if he finds himself in a production situation.’ He sees that vocationally-oriented courses have a tendency to prioritise knowledge and skills relevant to the labour market over general communication skills. By contrast, he holds that traditional education theories have tended to focus on ‘improving, intensifying and socialising the individual.’ For him, vocationally oriented language learning processes will be optimised if both aspects are taken into account at the same time: ‘It makes no sense to focus on personal

\footnote{Plasberg, p 52}
development and neglect learning oriented towards the labour market, nor does it make sense to push marketability at the expense of learning cultural elements of a general nature’.\textsuperscript{59}

**Inclusion of Cultural Perspectives**

Another common theme emerging in the literature was the need for vocational language courses to incorporate socio-cultural perspectives. Inman, for example draws attention to the issue of cross-cultural misunderstanding, which she regards as ‘even more significant than a lack of foreign language capability’. She refers specifically to misunderstandings that may arise in business settings when ‘methods of analysis and motivation differ’ between players from different cultural backgrounds, as well as ‘different approaches to solving problems, getting cooperation and achieving agreement.’\textsuperscript{60} Inman is of the opinion that such misunderstandings can occur even when all business communication between parties occurs in English.

In his discussion of the skills necessary for the development of a ‘truly transnational workforce’, Clifford Adelman also refers to the need for workers to develop important cultural understandings. In his view, ‘Anyone studying Latino culture without also studying Spanish is not studying Latino culture: she is merely a tourist. And anyone studying French until he can read and discuss Moliere is not studying Francophone cultures unless is immersed in contemporary cultural training.’\textsuperscript{61} Using the example of an international company moving toxic chemicals from the Russian border, he illustrates how, in order for the workforce to work well, all participants in the process have ‘to recognise the transaction as one in which the economics and the technology are truly transnational, whereas the regulations, the customs and the connections are local…..To make the process work better, most participants must be able to negotiate in more than one culture and language and must be accustomed to the rhythms of exchange that leave long periods of time unfilled.’\textsuperscript{62} Comments from the MCEETYA brochures also highlight the importance of being in tune with the business and decision making cultures of the country in which you are operating.\textsuperscript{63}

Laura Walker holds a similar view, remarking:

‘People who speak other languages will recognise a non-native accent, and may forgive the speaker for language errors. They are not so quick to forgive cultural errors…The

\textsuperscript{59} Kornbeck, p 40

\textsuperscript{60} Inman, pp 1-3

\textsuperscript{61} Adelman, p 5

professional must understand the other’s value system, including the status of the family, the role of women in professional activities, the importance of education, the literacy rate, the population growth rate, economic resources, the value placed on tradition, and the dominant religion and its influence on the governing powers.\textsuperscript{64}

She regards this cultural understanding as important not only for people working internationally, but also for people working with culturally and linguistically diverse populations in their own countries.

The National Tourism Strategy also reinforces the need to equip the tourism and hospitality workforce with cultural as well as linguistic skills:

‘It is important that staff in our tourism industry can communicate the essence of Australian culture to tourists, whether those visitors be from other countries or other regions and ethnic groups in Australia. Tourism staff should be informed about the cultures of international and local clients and be equipped to interact intelligently and sensitively across cultures. This requires language competence and an understanding of different cultural practices.’\textsuperscript{65}

The importance of including a focus on culture in any language course is in line with industry research conducted in Australia, which prioritises cultural knowledge over language knowledge in terms of personnel recruitment. Kerry Marrone’s research into the language and cultural awareness needs of small to medium sized businesses in the export sector in Australia, found that 9% of respondents prepared staff for overseas negotiations by accessing language and cultural awareness classes of short duration. 50% of the remaining group indicated that they were interested in cultural awareness programmes. Common comments by respondents were that if a member of staff had no pre-existing language skills then it was preferable to develop cultural sensitivity rather than language in the short term. Respondents viewed cultural awareness as being familiar with the likes and dislikes of their customers in particular relating to food, greetings, gifts, religious observances and dress.\textsuperscript{66} The majority of respondents prioritised cultural awareness of this kind over language competence. Marrone also notes, however, a reluctance by business to recognise language as an inherent part of cultural awareness.

\textsuperscript{63} MCEETYA brochures
\textsuperscript{64} Laura Walker, p 27
\textsuperscript{65} Gibney, p 12
\textsuperscript{66} Marrone, p 9
Anne Gibney’s report into the language needs of the Hospitality and Tourism sector in Queensland recommends the development of short cultural awareness courses and workshops for business. Specifically, she recommends courses of 16-20 hours which could be offered through Adult and Community Education Programmes (for example, Know Your Korean Customers), and one-day introductory vocational cultural awareness workshops. The aim of these workshops is to raise the cultural awareness level of the local business community. Research conducted by the Murdoch Asia Research Centre also supports this recommendation.

Drawing on the research above, the Southbank report recommended to ANTA that ‘In the short term, the development of cultural awareness courses must be a priority if industry needs are to be met and the potential economic advantages gained while business opportunities exist.’ The report also notes ‘that any cultural awareness training should incorporate introductory language as the two elements are interdependent’. This is consistent with Kornbeck’s research which stresses the interconnection between linguistic, non-linguistic and para-linguistic skills.

**Appropriate Pedagogy**

The question of what constitutes good practice pedagogy for vocational language programmes is raised by a number of authors. The emphasis throughout the literature is on communicative language learning. Stevens et al stress the importance of developing communicative language competence, regarding the key element of this as a focus on ‘process rather than content’. Hall and Bankowska elaborate on this concept as requiring the use of ‘practical, interactive and speech based learning methods’. From their evaluation of vocational language programmes in Scotland, they identify three key elements of appropriate pedagogy. These are:

- Teaching should focus on the meaning and use of the target language in realistic situations relevant to the students;
- The extensive use of the target language in the classroom is valued by the students and should be encouraged; and

---

67 Gibney, p 14.
68 Smart, D. p
69 Southbank Institute of TAFE, p 15
70 Southbank Institute of TAFE, p 14
71 Kornbeck, p 36
72 Stevens, p 9
• This does not preclude the teaching of grammar, nor does it imply any undue concentration on the spoken language to the exclusion of the written language.\textsuperscript{73}

Walker is scathing of traditional methods of language teaching which she describes as ‘teaching in isolation with little, if any, focus on oral skills.’\textsuperscript{74} A key element of the occupational-technical language courses she describes is the focus on oral skills. In addition to oral language skills the courses are also aimed at providing graduates with sufficient skills to be able to ‘read basic messages, letters and instructions in the foreign language, while referring to a dictionary for unfamiliar words.’\textsuperscript{75}

Plasberg suggests that in terms of teaching pedagogy, it is important to ensure that materials and activities are relevant to the students’ experience in their mainstream course and correspond to tasks expected of them in their vocational context. As an example, he suggests that while language students are often asked to read a text and then answer a series of questions that test their comprehension, such an activity is not appropriate to architecture students, who would respond better to being asked to read a text and highlight relevant data. To support his argument, he refers to a recent UK needs analysis of language students in Higher Education Institutions, which suggests that students most liked activities done for a purpose, as opposed to those that seem meaningless.\textsuperscript{76} This is echoed by Holroyd who argues for ‘Communicative activities and authentic materials, realism and immediacy, closer contact with the foreign country, and involving students in their foreign language learning.’\textsuperscript{77}

In a similar vein, Egloff and Fitzpatrick argue that language learning in an occupational context should provide concrete learning experiences for students. The work experience and business simulation activities described in the case studies outlined in the previous section also support this view. Providing concrete learning experiences is seen to be important for developing greater flexibility and self-confidence in students, particularly those who have had negative language learning experiences in the past, rather than focusing on conceptual language learning.\textsuperscript{78}

Plasberg also suggests that there may be a difference in the common learning style of ‘traditional’ language students and students in vocationally-oriented programmes. He describes the common learning style of language students, which he sees as emanating from an arts/humanities background,
as ‘divergent’. Learners with this type of learning style, are seen to prefer open-ended tasks which require creative answers. According to Plasberg, research has shown that learners in many other disciplines tend towards a ‘convergent’ style of learning, where they attempt to find the one right answer to a problem. He believes it is important, within most vocational language programmes, for teachers to adopt a pedagogy which is more suitable to convergent learners. It is worth noting that having said this, Plasberg then goes on to distinguish architecture students, the subjects of his case-study, who he believes generally adopt a divergent style of learning.\textsuperscript{79}

Egloff and Fitzpatrick advocate a change in the role of the language teacher from ‘supplier of information to facilitator, co-explorer and co-learner’. In their view, such a role acknowledges the learner’s expertise in the vocational area and transforms language learning to a collaborative effort between student and teacher.\textsuperscript{80} This view is supported by Plasberg, who sees that vocational language programmes are enhanced when the language lecturer and the students both contribute to the education process with their own area of specialist knowledge.\textsuperscript{81} Egloff and Fitzpatrick identify six key elements of effective pedagogy in vocationally-oriented language learning. They advocate an approach which is:

- Learner-centred;
- Content-based;
- Action-oriented;
- Project-based;
- Intercultural; and
- Reflective\textsuperscript{82}

They also believe that the approach should seek to develop self-directed learners, a term they prefer to autonomous. They state: ‘The vision is self-directed learners who are aware of their strategies, apply them consciously and deliberately widen the scope of their language activities.’\textsuperscript{83} This is also emphasised by Holroyd, who highlights the importance of developing autonomous learners who can think for themselves, as this is a key requirement for success in the work force. To nurture the development of this skill, he recommends a self-access model based on a collaborative learning structure, whereby learners are organised into small groups so that they can practice all the macro skills

\textsuperscript{79} Plasberg, p 55
\textsuperscript{80} Egloff and Fitzpatrick, p 230
\textsuperscript{81} Plasberg, p 54
\textsuperscript{82} Egloff and Fitzpatrick, p 228
\textsuperscript{83} Egloff and Fitzpatrick, p 228
simultaneously in one classroom. For this to work properly he notes that students will need access to appropriate printed materials, reference books and other equipment. He also emphasises the need for learners to be trained in this form of working.84

Teaching Materials
The literature also stresses the importance of having vocationally relevant and authentic teaching materials which are tailored to student needs.85

Adelman stresses the need for the incorporation of authentic materials into vocationally-oriented language courses. He gives the examples of the use of ‘non English language keyboards and bank documents from Mexico and Quebec’ in office support programmes and ‘simulated Interpol dossiers’ for use in criminal justice administration programmes. In his view, materials used in these courses must include the cultural diversity found among primary speakers. He argues: ‘Watch Lyon TV…read newspapers from Haiti…’ 86

Egloff and Fitzpatrick support this view. They also believe that it is important that the materials developed for vocationally-oriented language programmes are directly related to the vocational needs of learners. They are aware, however, that there are often difficulties acquiring suitable materials. They suggest a cost-effective approach as an alternative, which is the development of common-core materials which can be used across several clearly defined occupational fields.87

Walker also identifies the development of appropriate instructional materials as a challenge for occupational-technical language programmes. In her view, the majority of specialised textbooks that currently exist may be filled with appropriate vocabulary for the occupational area, but are inappropriate for language acquisition. In her opinion,

‘Time and experience have taught us that a good basic textbook can be used if special vocabulary words and phrases are integrated into the textbook exercises.’88

Walker’s focus is on employer-funded language training programmes. In this regard, she suggests that the development of new training materials and textbooks should be done in conjunction with industry.

---

84 Holroyd, in Stevens, p 16
85 See for example, Hall and Bankowska, p 7, See also Adelman, Egloff and Fitzpatrick
86 Adelman, p 5
87 Egloff and Fitzpatrick, p 229
88 Walker, p 26
Her experience suggests that international companies are often able to supply the vocabulary used in their industry, which needs to be included in the training materials.

From his case-study of the linking of languages into architectural education, Plasberg extrapolates some key principles for the development of teaching materials for vocationally-oriented language learning. These include:

- Contacting industry bodies in target countries to request teaching materials used in those countries;
- Incorporating authentic materials into the programme, as opposed to relying on texts designed exclusively for language learning purposes;
- Using materials that promote independent learning, that are stimulating and motivating and which allow application of the language in contexts, which are intrinsically interesting to the learners;
- Ensuring that materials used correspond with materials used in their vocational context;
- Ensuring that materials provide a progressive introduction to the whole conceptual basis of the language, rather than just new terminology;
- Designing teaching materials that take into account the fact that students learn in different ways; and
- Ensuring that any grammar taught in the course reflects the area in which the student will be applying the language skill.

In relation to teaching materials, the Southbank report concludes that there is a need for planning to develop national resources, which can be modified or updated to ensure currency.

**Use of Technology in Vocational Language Programmes**
The benefits of integrating technology into the vocational language classroom are discussed by a number of authors. In the Australian context, the Southbank report identifies technology as having the ‘potential to provide cost effective training which teaches, reinforces and gives practice in language skills at times suitable to clients’. The report regards technology as a vital instrument in providing flexible access to training which is suited to industry needs. The importance of multimedia is also recognised by Kerry Marrone’s research, which informed the Southbank report. Marrone recommends that a study be

---

89 Walker, p 25  
90 Plasberg, p 54-55  
91 Southbank Institute of TAFE, p 15  
92 Southbank Institute of TAFE, p 15
undertaken to determine the scope for the application of multimedia in the delivery of languages other than English in the Vocational Education and Training sector. In addition, she recommends that funding be made available to provide staff with the skills to use multimedia technologies in the delivery of programmes. She recommends further that funding be made available for an internet site to be developed which will provide a complete record of all LOTE provision and cultural awareness programmes delivered by the VET sector.\textsuperscript{93}

The most detailed examination of this area was conducted by Hogan-Brun and Laux. The authors explore the role of the web and other forms of information technology to assist in the development of a workforce equipped with multilingual and multicultural competencies. They see that in order for foreign language learners to acquire cultural and workplace-related competencies, 'content and discourse have to be drawn from various sources to guarantee authenticity.'\textsuperscript{94} Their research work focuses on ‘specialist’ learners. By this, they are referring to people who are learning a language in relation to a specific vocation. They regard multimedia as having the potential to offer an 'intensive and contextual learning environment, mirroring real life situations.'\textsuperscript{95} The authors refer to a website which delivers the news in German, enabling learners to read a short summary of each news event, watch a 2-5 minute video report of each story, watch yesterday’s main evening news in full, watch the latest news being updated, browse an archive which contains any news broadcast of the past 8 months, research “dossiers” on main headline stories. They state: ‘Combining text, sound and video footage…they facilitate comprehension in a way daily newspapers and video recordings could not do.’ It is acknowledged that the site has not been created to teach people languages; nevertheless, they believe that the advantages are huge: ‘The content is real, authentic and always up to date. Students who regularly use it get immersed in the target language on an acoustic and visual level whilst staying in touch with current affairs and gathering cultural background information.'\textsuperscript{96}

Other information technology tools they explore include:

- Search engines such as Altavista, Lycos and Yahoo which can operate entirely in the setting of the target country (and its languages) for searches;
- Online dictionaries and machine translations; and
- Email, Public mailing lists, discussion groups, usenet news groups, relay chat.

\textsuperscript{93} Marrone, p 11
\textsuperscript{94} Hogan-Brun, p 254
\textsuperscript{95} Hogan-Brun, p 255
\textsuperscript{96} Hogan-Brun, p 256
They describe a situation in which they worked with medical students and asked them to choose a medical discussion group in German. The medical students were required to deal with patient queries and to make contributions themselves. The students were regarded as having low-medium proficiency in the target language, and as such their responses were monitored prior to posting. However, as the main aim of the exercise was not accuracy, but successful communication, only minor modifications were suggested where absolutely necessary. The authors regard the benefits of this approach as ‘the immersion of the students in an environment which has taken on a real human dimension’, and the fact that they were ‘engaging with others on a subject which they considered inherently interesting’ and where ‘language learning was incidental to practical use of the target language in a truly communicative setting’.97

Other writers also advocate the use of technology in the vocational language classroom, including Walker who refers specifically to the use of word processors capable of printing the target language in written form, and hypermedia workstations, which include not only audio capabilities but also interactive video and writing exercises.98 Egloff and Fitzpatrick also see the benefits of using technology to enhance language learning in vocational education contexts. They quote Korsvold and Ruschoff, who claim that vocationally oriented language learners are generally very open to using technology in language learning as a majority are required to use information technologies in their professional life.99

Holroyd notes that technology has a very definite part to play in language learning. He refers to foreign databases like Télétel, which can be downloaded under licence onto disk and incorporated into assignments. He also refers to the importance of word processing commenting that ‘even poor writers can take pleasure in editing out their errors’. An additional resource he identifies is satellite television. The attraction of satellite television is seen to be due to the material it can offer, such as ‘cartoons, children’s programmes, weather forecasts, advertisements.’ While technology can play a vital role in bringing authenticity and meaning to vocationally oriented language learning, Holroyd is aware that preparation is required to get the best out of the materials, and this can be time consuming.100

Assessment
Some good practice elements relating to assessment were also raised in the literature. Egloff and Fitzpatrick, for example, highlight the importance of ensuring that tasks for assessing vocational

97 Hogan-Brun, p 257
98 Walker, p 27
99 Egloff and Fitzpatrick, p 230
language competence are similar in nature to the tasks used to assess competence in the vocational area. They argue that in vocational education contexts there is a strong emphasis on performance types of assessments in which the learners have to accomplish work-related language tasks, for example following instructions in the target language.\textsuperscript{101} Plasberg, citing Reuben, also stresses the need to create links between assessment in the vocational area and in language assessment, both in relation to the style and content of the assessment procedures. This should result in the assessment processes being less onerous in terms of a new workload.\textsuperscript{102}

Plasberg argues further that, in relation to some vocational education contexts, there may be no need to assess learners across all macro skills, as some macro-skills may be more relevant than others. For example he suggests that in relation to areas such as law, agriculture and public health and for simulating negotiations the focus should be on audio-lingual and cultural skills. In this regard, Lila Waldman concludes that more companies use oral rather than written methods for testing language ability for such positions. She therefore advocates a focus on oral skills in the testing language competence in the Vocational Education and Training context.

In addition, Hall and Bankowska place strong emphasis on the use of continuous assessment methods in the vocational language programmes.\textsuperscript{103} In this regard, they note that language teachers are used for ‘informal monitoring’ of their students’ progress and suggest that this is a valuable assessment tool. They also promote a view of assessment as a ‘process of gathering evidence’ not as ‘tests’. In addition, they suggest that teachers should minimise formal assessment as far as possible ‘by integrating the assessments of two or more outcomes into a single exercise’.\textsuperscript{104}

**Identification of Needs**

The importance of identifying the needs of both learners and industry groups is highlighted in the literature. Egloff and Fitzpatrick argue that a key element of good practice incorporated into the VOLL programme, is that all teaching practices and materials are based upon needs analysis, which both precedes and accompanies the teaching/learning experience. These needs analyses are seen to vary in scope from nation-wide overviews of vocational needs of the adult population or analysis of preferred learning styles of vocational language learners.\textsuperscript{105}

\textsuperscript{100} Stevens, p 16  
\textsuperscript{101} Egloff and Fitzpatrick, p 229  
\textsuperscript{102} Plasber, p 55  
\textsuperscript{103} Hall and Bankowska, p 7  
\textsuperscript{104} Hall and Bankowska, p 10
They introduce the concept of a ‘language audit’ to emphasise the importance of an approach which is systematic in taking care of the needs of any particular enterprise and its employees. Catherine Greensmith describes this concept more fully as a way of assisting companies to identify what levels of language skills are required in an organisation, and to propose tailor-made training solutions to address any gaps and then to monitor the level of progress within the organisation.\textsuperscript{106} Greensmith sees benefits for companies in having a language audit conducted. This would assist employers in that it can ensure that staff skills are matched to organisation needs, and additionally, can act as an aid to recruitment, job description development and performance appraisal. She also perceives a benefit to training providers in conducting the audit in that the training providers can offer more marketable courses that they can be sure will meet industry needs.\textsuperscript{107} She regards language audits and needs-based analyses as ‘essential in order to provide the most relevant and best adapted training’ to industry.\textsuperscript{108}

According to Egloff and Fitzpatrick, the language audit has the capacity to take into account the needs of learners. Plasberg also argues that it is necessary to analyse up front what the real needs of learners are in their vocational context, and how they will use the language skills in the workforce. By doing this, they are able to ensure that the language, grammar, and cultural understandings taught are relevant to the language context.\textsuperscript{109} While acknowledging the utility of conducting a ‘needs analysis of … student groups’, Hall and Bankowska’s evaluation of nine vocational language programmes in Scotland found that it was easy for teaching staff to tailor their courses very closely to the needs of the students in language courses which have been specifically customised for a particular industry or vocation. It was considered more difficult to tailor courses to meet the needs of students participating in beginner level courses, or in courses which are non-vocationally specific.\textsuperscript{110}

It is interesting to note that many of the examples of LOTE-VET programmes described in the literature have been developed as a response to industry needs (for example the Drysdale TAFE programme), or in response to community needs (for example the occupational language programmes being run in the US community colleges).

\textsuperscript{105} Egloff and Fitzpatrick, p 228-229
\textsuperscript{106} Greensmith.
\textsuperscript{107} Greensmith, p 4
\textsuperscript{108} Greensmith, p 7
\textsuperscript{109} Plasberg, p 52
\textsuperscript{110} Hall and Bankowska, p 7
The Australian literature also emphasises the need to increase links with industry. The Southbank Institute of TAFE report describes a model which is aimed at ‘positioning the VET sector to deliver quality LOTE programmes which are reflective of industry and community needs’. The model is underpinned by twelve ‘best practice characteristics’:

- A shared vision for ‘first-class’ performance;
- A strategic plan developed in consultation with the workforce;
- An executive level commitment to change throughout the organization;
- A co-operative and participative culture that encourages and includes consultation with key stakeholders;
- A commitment to continuous improvement and learning;
- Innovative human resource policies which include Equal Employment Opportunity;
- A co-operative and participative industrial relations culture;
- A focus on customers, both internal and external;
- Close relationships with suppliers (e.g., schools, enterprises);
- The pursuit of innovation in technology, products and processes;
- The use of performance measurement systems and benchmarking; and
- Involvement in networks which enhance competitive capabilities.\textsuperscript{111}

The report does not expand further on what they mean by these principles and it is unclear which organisations are expected to adhere to those principles, the VET sector, or the organisations who wish to put their employees through the training.

**Pathways**

The existence of clearly articulated learning pathways that facilitate the development of language proficiency overtime is also referred to in the literature. Heidi Byrnes regards the development of better programme articulation as a key issue for good practice in language teaching. While her article focuses predominantly on articulation between secondary schools and Universities, the principles she sets out can be seen to be applicable in terms of developing pathways between language learning and the vocational education sector. For her, the key principles are:

- Vertical articulation, to ensure continuity throughout the length of the programme;

\textsuperscript{111} Southbank Institute of TAFE, p 16
• Horizontal articulation, to ensure that the curriculum is coordinated across the many classes that are attempting to achieve the same objectives; and

• Interdisciplinary and multidisciplinary articulation to enable foreign languages to be ‘mainstreamed’ so that they will come to be regarded as a ‘necessity, rather than a luxury’.112

Stevens et al. also stress the importance of securing pathways which allow for progression to further, higher and adult education, training and employment, and for transfer between routes.113 In line with this, Kornbeck discusses the value of having professional associations in promoting the development of vocationally-oriented language programmes. He believes that these associations play a role in comparing national training and entrance requirements, and thinking about mutual recognition of qualifications between countries. He illustrates this by reference to social workers, who have been working towards mutual recognition of training in this field throughout Europe.114

One example that illustrates the benefit of such pathways is that of the Drysdale Institute of TAFE, which has successfully developed links with secondary schools in the area to promote the idea of language learning as a useful skill for entering the workforce. The Institute has also had to work with language teachers at the schools to ensure that the appropriate level of proficiency can be achieved.115

The London Further Education Unit also notes the importance of cumulative learning, rather than simply continuous learning, a concept that is also strongly promoted in the Australian literature.116

112 Heidi Byrnes, Foreign Language Programme Articulation from High School to the University. ERIC Digest. Eric Identifier ED321586, Publication Date 1990-07-00. Source Eric Clearinghouse on Languages and Linguistics, Washington Dc, pp 1-4.
113 Stevens, p 7
114 Kornbeck, p 36
116 London Further Education Unit, p 2, See also Simpson Norris, Pathways.
Section 5: Factors that Facilitate and Hamper the Linking of Languages and Vocational Education

This section summarises some of the key factors emerging from the literature that work to facilitate the development of vocationally oriented language programmes, as well as those that work against their development.

Policy

The existence of supportive policy in the European Union has been a major factor contributing to the expansion of vocationally oriented language programmes throughout Europe. In order to encourage the learning of languages in a vocational context, the European Union has assisted in the development of a number of programmes. Major initiatives in this regard include the LINGUA, SOCRATES and LEONARDO programmes. Other policy initiatives have included the introduction of assessment systems to cover the methods and materials used to teach European Community languages; the introduction of a European Quality Label award to schools meeting certain criteria in respect of language teaching and learning; support for exchanges of language-teaching materials; and the encouragement of the early teaching of Community languages from nursery school level.

Such policy at the European level has led to the implementation of supportive policy at a national level. For example, the United Kingdom launched a new languages strategy in May 2001. The strategy includes a component for making greater use of adult vocational learning to promote languages. It also includes a component for engaging business to help people understand the importance of languages within the workforce and to promote language learning to adults at work.

In both Australia and the United States where there has not been such a strong strategic push, there appears to have been less achieved in terms of development, acceptance, and uptake of vocational language programmes. In the Australian context, the introduction of the NALSAS Strategy provided considerable impetus to introduce Asian languages in primary and secondary schools for students from years 3 to 10. By contrast, the short lived MCEETYA Adult LOTE and Literacy Sub-Committee, formed as a result of the National Collaborative Strategy for LOTE in VET, appears to have been less successful incorporating LOTE into VET programmes.

---

117 The LINGUA programme is now incorporated into SOCRATES and LEONARDO.
The importance of a nationally coordinated approach is argued by the AFTMLA in their position paper regarding the incorporation of languages into the Vocational Education and Training Curriculum. They write:

‘Given the national focus of accredited VET curriculum, and the existence of national collaborative mechanisms in LOTE, it would seem most appropriate, if any action is to be taken, if it were at a national rather than a local level. This is the approach which has been taken in the UK, where, over the past five years, what is probably the most rapid and prolific expansion of vocationally oriented languages curriculum has taken place (their emphasis).’

In conjunction with the idea of a nationally coordinated approach, Stevens recommends the development of a nationally defined system of skills and competencies which will help both learners and those recruiting them to understand what, exactly, the skill means in terms of use in the workplace. She notes, however, that no system will be successful unless the employer recognises the skill and actively seeks to promote and reward them. The lack of industry recognised certification in Australia raised a barrier to the incorporation of languages and vocational education by the AFMLTA.

**Developing Links**

Connected with the notion of identifying community and industry needs, is the importance of developing strong links between teaching staff, key agencies, institutions, stakeholders and the community.

Some writers place importance on developing cross-disciplinary links within the school or college. According to Plasberg, this is important in enhancing understandings between of the two disciplines. In their evaluation of Scottish vocational language programmes, Hall and Bankowska found that some language teachers felt that there was a lack of understanding by other staff about what was involved in language learning, which meant that unrealistic expectations were being placed on them. They identify three strategies used by language departments to develop cross-disciplinary understandings:

- Offering language courses to staff in the institution as part of a staff development exercise;

---

120 AFMLTA, p 2
121 Stevens, p 21
122 AFMLTA, p 2
123 Plasberg, pp 53-54
124 Hall and Bankowska, p 9
• Offering languages courses on an ‘open learning’ basis to students in the institution; and
• Offering translation and other language related services to colleagues in the institution.  

Others, such as Holroyd, promote the importance of developing links with overseas institutions. The Languages in Further Education Unit, London found also recognises the value of developing links with other countries to provide a means for students to extend their language usage and experiences. They identify two ways that different colleges have made these international connections. One way was by building on the civic ‘twinning’ procedures, and the other was by offering English as a foreign language to the other institution. A number of the examples in the literature have as a key component links with schools and colleges in the target country, to facilitate inter-country exchanges, to enable business simulations between or simply to provide students with an opportunity to communicate via email with learners in other countries.

The importance of developing links between schools/colleges and industry is strongly reinforced by the literature. The White Paper developed by the European Union, for example, identifies as a priority the need for the development of links between industry and schools. Stevens also notes that many European initiatives stress the importance of ‘collaboration, co-operation and mutual support between industry and education’. This position is also held by the AFMLTA, who write, ‘The most recent approach to VET [in Australia] is one which is quite clearly industry led.’ Both Plasberg and Walker refer to the need to collaborate with industry to develop appropriate teaching materials. The Further Education Unit, London, suggests that one way of developing links between industry and education is through providing ‘language audits’ as an additional service to industry.

Industry Input
The value of industry support, input and recognition is referred to in the literature in terms of facilitating the development and uptake of vocational language programmes. It is evident, for example, that many of the vocational language programmes referred to as being successful in the literature have developed in response to industry needs. One such programme is the Drysdale TAFE example in Tasmania. In addition, it is apparent that many of the business exchange and work experience programmes outlined in Section 4 have required the development of good relationships with industry. Other areas in which

125 Hall and Bankowska, p 9
126 Holroyd, in Stevens, p 14.
127 Languages in Further Education Unit, London, p 2
128 Stevens, p 4
129 AFMLTA, p 2.
130 Plasberg, p 54 and Walker, p 26
131 Further Education Unit, London, p 3
industry input can be valuable are in relation to the development of authentic and appropriate teaching materials, collaboration in respect of training, tailoring programmes to make them relevant to the workforce, and developing and promoting nationally accepted certification standards and competencies.

**Community Perceptions**

Community perceptions play a major role in either supporting or hindering the development of vocational language programmes. Where the community regards language as a relevant skill for the workplace, they will be more supportive of such programmes. This situation can be evidenced in Europe, where there are now calls to include language learning in kindergartens.\(^{132}\) Additionally, where vocational language programmes are provided in response to community needs, community attitudes about the relevance of languages will be enhanced. The community colleges programmes in Section 4 provide examples of this.

It is clear in the Australian context, that a major barrier to the implementation of vocational language programmes is a perception by the community that language skills are not relevant. This is evidenced in the research undertaken by the Asia Research Centre at Murdoch University which found that there was a perception among small businesses that language skills provide no commercial benefits.\(^{133}\) These perceptions are often attributed to Australia’s isolation and historical reliance on primary industry exports.\(^{134}\) The desire to address the perception that languages are not useful in the workplace is the subject of much of the promotional material developed in the Australian context, which focuses on providing profiles of people who have used languages in their careers.

Brandle notes that it is no wonder that English language speakers do not see the relevance of studying a language when 65% of all second language learners around the world are studying English, the remainder the LOTEs.\(^{135}\) The impact of this on American perceptions of the value of foreign language learning is also outlined in the American Foreign Language Paper.\(^{136}\)

Brandle also notes that different languages come and go in terms of their popularity, often on the basis of perceived economic benefits. He believes that people who are motivated to study a language based on purely economic considerations may be setting themselves up for a fall. He cites a letter from a disgruntled mother whose son had studied Korean at school. Her concern was that the lack of

---

\(^{132}\) Bleisner
\(^{133}\) Murdoch Asia Research Centre, p 56.
\(^{134}\) Brandle, p 37
\(^{135}\) Brandle, p 38
\(^{136}\) American Foreign Language Paper.
opportunities for people with skills in Korean to get employment in Australia meant that her son was forced to take work in Korea.\textsuperscript{137} He also refers to the surge in students of Japanese in Australia, and particularly Queensland, in the early 1990s. In his view, 'many learners, who expected quick results and career advantages, were disappointed.'\textsuperscript{138} The AFMLTA is of the view that the ‘policy rhetoric’ about languages being vital for Australia’s economic survival, has sometimes all too easily been proved as hollow, and a different promotional strategy for vocational language programmes is therefore required.\textsuperscript{139}

Perceptions of the capabilities of vocational education students may also impact upon the development of links between the two learning areas. This perception is not confined to the Australian literature. For example, the Bleisner, describing the links between vocational education and languages in Germany notes that there is a ‘widespread perception that those receiving initial vocational training will only be able to keep learning the language they learned at school and would not be able to cope with a new language.’\textsuperscript{140}

**Promotion of Languages in the Vocational Context**

The question of how to promote language learning in vocational contexts is addressed by some authors. Egloff and Fitzpatrick see that, in the European context, it is important to promote the idea of language as an all-round competence. They see this as particularly important in Vocational Education and Training, specifically in order to engage students who have had negative experiences of language learning previously.\textsuperscript{141} Plasberg notes the importance of breaking presuppositions that may be held in relation to the relevance of learning languages in vocational education contexts. In the example of architecture students he uses, it was necessary to address the view that architects don’t need foreign language skills because they ‘speak with the pen’. It was pointed out to learners that this only occurs in the design phase of architecture, and that negotiation with clients etc requires other forms of communication.\textsuperscript{142}

Although the issue of promotion is not addressed explicitly in the Australian literature, there does appear to be a common theme in the promotional materials developed by the education and training sector to promote languages as a vocational skill. This involves the presentation of profiles and case-studies of individuals who have applied their linguistic or cultural knowledge in their work, and case-studies of companies who are employing people with language or cultural skills. The analysis suggests that the

\begin{itemize}
  \item \textsuperscript{137} Brandle, p 37
  \item \textsuperscript{138} Brandle, p 39
  \item \textsuperscript{139} AFLMTA, p 2
  \item \textsuperscript{140} Bleisner, p 28
  \item \textsuperscript{141} Egloff and Fitzpatrick, p 229
\end{itemize}
profiles work better where a company/industry perspective is taken and then interspersed with personalised information about individuals, thereby providing a double description of the types of skills desired in the workplace, rather than focusing on the individual and leaving the reader making connections to the industry.

**Funding**
The level of available funding is certainly a key factor in facilitating or hindering the implementation of languages in vocational education programmes. In Europe, there has been a substantial injection of funds into the development of programmes at a system level. These funds have supported the development of national standards, assessment frameworks, teacher training, student scholarships and international exchange programmes among other things.

At the school-level, Stevens notes that the implementation of strategies to effectively link languages and vocations is often costly, for example, organising authentic materials, incorporating appropriate technology, the cost of international telephone calls, as well as larger items such as travel for in-country experience.

A specific funding issue that arises in relation to the vocational language area, is related to the size of classes. This relates to the question of how specific vocational language programmes should be in terms of both language and vocational focus.

**Organisational Issues**
The Further Education Unit, London raises the organisation and management of languages as an area of concern for vocational education. This was to do with the question of where the language department was physically located in relation to the vocational departments, or whether the programme should be included as a cross-college provision rather than being located in a particular department. Timetabling and resource constraints were also raised as specific issues, particularly in relation to the need for common timetabling to enable learners from different vocational areas to access languages and the importance of shorter regular contact when timetabling languages rather than providing classes in one long weekly block. In addition, the difficulties associated with accessing appropriately trained staff was also identified as an issue, particularly as a result of the high proportion of part-time staff teaching languages.\(^{143}\)

---

\(^{142}\) Plasberg,

\(^{143}\) Further Education Unit, London, p 3 - 5
Section 6: Issues Associated with Linking LOTE and VET

The literature also draws attention to some of the key issues to be considered in relation to the incorporation of language programmes into the Vocational Education and Training context. These are described below.

Level of Language Proficiency

In the Australian literature there is a general view that learners in vocational language courses do not need to achieve high levels of language proficiency. In this regard, Brandle argues that proficiency is not the aim of LOTE learning in vocational contexts, but rather the aim is to enable people to be able to ‘speak a few phrases in a LOTE [which] may break the ice and establish a cordial business partnership’ or to give them ‘enough language functions to cope in their daily job routine’.144 Hodson’s description of the Drysdale TAFE programme also notes that the low level of contact hours for LOTE are related to the lower levels of proficiency that the learners are expected to achieve to meet the requirements of the course.

Similarly, the American occupational language courses described by Walker are not aimed at developing proficient language speakers. They are only designed to allow students to gain sufficient language proficiency for application in their career. Focusing on employer-funded language learning programmes in the US, Walker believes that it is important to negotiate both learner and employer expectations. She says that commonly in such cases, the employer or student will determine how much proficiency is desired, but it is the role of the instructor to determine how to reach that goal.145

In Scotland, Hall and Bankowska found that most students involved in vocationally oriented language programmes found that the majority of students had fairly realistic expectations of the levels to which they might take their foreign language learning, and were not expecting to achieve complete fluency but were rather looking to acquire a level of functional competence.146 Teaching staff differed in the extent that they thought it was desirable to teach vocationally specific language to beginners.147

By contrast the MCEETYA brochure included an interview with managers from the Australian airline Qantas. The interviewees stressed that they needed employees with very high levels of proficiency.148

---

144 Brandle, p 42
145 Walker, p 27
146 Hall and Bankowska, p 5
147 Hall and Bankowska, p 7
The AFMLTA Position Paper on Languages other than English at the Senior Secondary Level and Vocational Education and Training regards lack of agreement about ‘the most appropriate overall aims and expectations for VET-focussed LOTE curriculum’ as a key issue to be overcome in developing vocationally oriented language programmes in Australia. They identify two views held by educators about the levels of language proficiency that can be achieved through vocational language programmes at secondary school. The first is that as the level of proficiency achievable by the end of Year 12 is insufficient for real world vocational use, time and effort are better spent on developing students’ cultural understandings. Another view suggests that the development of oral/aural skills is more worthwhile than time spent on developing productive written skills. They continue:

‘If it is acknowledged that a VET-focussed pathway for students of LOTE is desirable, then there is a real need to explore the fundamental question of what the aims and expectations of LOTE in such a pathway might be.’

According to the AFMLTA, the fundamental issues surrounding appropriate expected levels of performance, their measurement and reporting need much work in the Australian context.

**Time Devoted to Language Learning**

It appears evident from the literature that the time devoted to language learning in vocational language courses should be compatible with the desired level of proficiency for learners. Many authors refer to the difficulty of allocating time to languages in already crowded curricula. For example, Walker argues:

‘Since technical-occupational language study is usually coupled with another specialised skill area…students tend to limit the number of hours devoted to language study to what is needed to gain the fluency and proficiency necessary to perform in the chosen career area.’

Adelman makes a similar point:

“You can’t provide language and culture training for people who use community colleges to complete their high school educations, for ad hoc students of data processing, or for those

---

148 MCEETYA  
149 AFMLTA, p 1  
150 AFMLTA, p 2  
151 AFMLTA, p 1  
152 Walker, p 27
planning to transfer into bachelor’s degree programmes in, for example, nursing. But there is sufficient room in the curricula of some occupational associate degree programmes to provide community college students with the beginnings of international mobility. It can be done in office support programmes...in the criminal justice administration programmes...And I have seen the potential in 48-credit, certificate granting air transport programmes, by requiring only 12 additional credits of language training, designed around a panoply of transport activities and problems, we can produce credentialed crews that can land anywhere with any kind of cargo and negotiate repairs, customs and service.153

Similarly, Hodson notes that the inclusion of languages in the Hospitality Training Courses run through the Drysdale Institute of TAFE, is limited in terms of time allocation. The LOTE component of the programme can be regarded, at best, as a ‘taster’ course. In the Advanced Certificate of Hospitality, four hours per week for ten weeks are devoted to Japanese language and culture for students in the Accommodation Division, while only one and a half hours per week for ten weeks are devoted to Culinary French for students in the Catering Division. Students undertaking the Advanced Diploma of Business (Travel and Tourism) are required to take two and a half hours per week of Japanese Language and Culture studies for a thirty four week period. Once again, the intention of the course is not to develop fluent speakers of the LOTE, but rather to provide learners with ‘heightened sensitivity in regard to the related cultures’ and to encourage trainees to develop their language skills further.154

Hodson notes that one of the difficulties with incorporating LOTE into a vocational education context is the impact on the curriculum. In her view, hospitality training courses require students to undertake a fairly intensive course load, even without the inclusion of a languages component. For this reason, she regarded the addition of a demanding LOTE programme to the current course as ‘unworkable’.155

Teacher Training
Appropriate training for teachers of vocationally oriented language programmes emerged as a particular issue for consideration. Egloff and Fitzpatrick regard teacher training as one of the greatest challenges for vocationally-oriented language learning. This is seen to be due to the fact that the learners will often have more expertise in the vocational area than the language teachers have. They stress the need for teachers to regard this ‘not as a threat to their authority, but as an enrichment.’156 To facilitate effective teaching of vocational languages, Plasberg believes that it is vital that cross-disciplinary connections are

---

153 Adelman, p 5
154 Hodson, p 23
155 Hodson, p 22
established between language lecturers and lecturers in the vocational discipline. He is of the view that
dual-directional cross-discipline discussion, will enable instructors to find a logical level of connection
between the two disciplines, thus enhancing understanding of the contexts and issues arising in the
specialist areas.\textsuperscript{157} Walker also regards the appropriate training and preparation of instructors to teach
career related language and culture as essential.\textsuperscript{158}

Kornbeck believes that the training of future language teachers, not just those working in vocational
education contexts, should be done in a manner which is closer to practice and less academic. In this
regard he is of the view that ‘technical language research, which has been working very close to practice
for a long time, offers inspiration for all areas of foreign language teaching, education and planning.’\textsuperscript{159}

In terms of teacher training, there is some debate about the level of technical knowledge required of
language teachers in vocational programmes. Egloff and Fitzpatrick, quoting Bauer, are of the opinion
that language teachers are not required to become subject experts in any occupational fields, but simply,
‘must show an interest in the world of work, and be curious about ‘how things work’. They take the
perspective that this ‘curiosity’ on the part of the teachers will help them to ‘enlarge their linguistic
repertoire and…develop an empathy with the mindsets of their learners.’\textsuperscript{160} Plasberg sets a slightly
higher standard. He believes that language teachers need more than an interest in the area, rather, they
need to develop some knowledge of the subject in order to be able to include clear links between
languages and the vocational/occupational context.\textsuperscript{161}

**Introduction of Language Teaching at an Early Age**
The European Union has introduced a policy to encourage the teaching of European languages to
students from an early age.\textsuperscript{162} Graf argues, ‘language teaching cannot concentrate on higher-level
courses, nor does the solution lie in commercial language courses, supplementary private schools or
periods of time abroad.’ He believes that language teaching must start early so that students are
learning languages before they are separated into different types of schools and educational styles.\textsuperscript{163}

Naserdeen presents a similar argument:

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{156} Egloff and Fitzpatrick, p 230
\item \textsuperscript{157} Plasberg, p 53-54
\item \textsuperscript{158} Walker, p 25
\item \textsuperscript{159} Kornbeck, p 34
\item \textsuperscript{160} Egloff and Fitzpatrick, p 230
\item \textsuperscript{161} Plasberg, p 53
\item \textsuperscript{162} White Paper, p 48
\item \textsuperscript{163} Graf, p 41
\end{itemize}
‘In order to help students compete in a global economy teachers in the United States must begin to teach children a second language at an early age. Aside from global competition, research also indicates that students who are proficient in a second language score higher on standardised tests conducted in English. This provides them with a competitive advantaged in the workforce.’

Bliesner notes that in the German context ‘an early start to foreign language teaching has basically ceased to be an issue in Europe’ and notes that the position paper on European Union educational and cultural policy makes calls for foreign language teaching in kindergartens.

**Generic versus Vocationally Specific Courses**

According to the AFMLTA, there is considerable disagreement about ‘the practicality of developing a range of industry specific curriculum modules versus a generic approach’. The generic approach offers a more administratively convenient approach for educators, but may not meet the needs of industry or learners.

Egloff and Fitzpatrick highlight the issue of costs associated with providing language training in vocational contexts where classes are often small. One solution they identify is to group occupations into clusters so that related jobs with common language driven tasks are put together. This is seen to enhance the quality of group encounters and make courses more economically viable. Plasberg also believes that the small size of classes can make the cost of providing such education prohibitive.

**The Use of Background Speakers**

Walker sees that the use of background speakers as instructors in vocationally-oriented language courses may be advantageous. She refers to the experience of Avis International when they were preparing to open up a new market in South America. In this instance, the college involved in the programme contracted a Brazilian woman who was undertaking her medical training in America to teach the course. This was seen to be beneficial in two respects. Firstly, the woman was able to convey to learners some knowledge of the country’s culture and politics. Secondly, it was seen to be more time-efficient to teach a native speaker the basics of language teaching pedagogy than to develop the

---

164 Naserdeen
165 Bliesner, p 28
166 AFMLTA, p 1
167 Egloff and Fitzpatrick, p 229
requisite linguistic knowledge in a person with the pedagogical skills. She claims, ‘It takes a long time to learn a language, but a short time to learn instructional methodology.’

Adelman takes a slightly different perspective, drawing attention to the fact that background speakers who are not trained as language teachers, may have limited pedagogical understanding which can affect the outcomes achieved by learners. Research conducted in Australia also suggests that in many cases, pedagogical skills are more important than linguistic skills in terms of language teacher training.

The ANTA report concludes that resources developed for LOTE in VET should be both informed by native speakers, and ‘ideally delivered’ by them.

---

168 Walker, p 27
169 Adelman, p 3
171 The ANTA Report, p 15
## Appendix 2: Interviews Conducted by State and Category

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Boards of Studies</th>
<th>AFMLTA</th>
<th>CTA</th>
<th>ANTA</th>
<th>TAFE/ RTOs</th>
<th>Chamber of Commerce</th>
<th>Industry</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACT</td>
<td>1 Deputy Principal</td>
<td>1 LOTE rep</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NSW</td>
<td>1 LOTE rep</td>
<td>1 LOTE rep</td>
<td>1 LOTE rep</td>
<td>1 VET rep</td>
<td></td>
<td>1 LOTE rep</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NT</td>
<td>1 VET rep</td>
<td>1 LOTE rep</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qld</td>
<td>1 LOTE rep</td>
<td>1 LOTE rep</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1 LOTE rep</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SA</td>
<td>2 LOTE teachers</td>
<td>1 LOTE rep</td>
<td>1 LOTE rep</td>
<td>1 VET rep</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tas</td>
<td>1 VET rep</td>
<td>1 VET teacher</td>
<td>1 rep</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vic</td>
<td>1 CEO LOTE rep</td>
<td>1 LOTE rep</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WA</td>
<td>1 LOTE rep</td>
<td>1 LOTE rep</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1 LOTE rep</td>
<td>1 Business Council rep</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Bodies</td>
<td>1 rep</td>
<td>Unable to comm.-ent</td>
<td>1 rep</td>
<td>1 ITAB rep</td>
<td>1 Business Council rep</td>
<td>2 Aust Company 2 Aust Based Foreign Companies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>